The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia

“Integrating Estonia 2020”
# Table of Contents

Introduction ................................................................................................................................. 3

State of play ..................................................................................................................................... 6

Objectives, measures and indicators for 2014–2020 ........................................................................ 14

  General objective .......................................................................................................................... 14
  Sub-objective 1 ............................................................................................................................. 15
  Sub-objective 2 ............................................................................................................................. 17
  Sub-objective 3 ............................................................................................................................. 19

Integration objectives to be achieved through other development plans ........................................ 20

  Objective 4 .................................................................................................................................... 20
  Objective 5 .................................................................................................................................... 23
  Objective 6 .................................................................................................................................... 24

The relation of the development plan with other policy documents and cross-cutting themes. ................. 27

The preparation, management and implementation, monitoring and financing of the development plan ........................................................................................................................................ 36

  Preparation of the development plan ............................................................................................ 36
  Management and implementation .................................................................................................... 36
  Monitoring and financing ............................................................................................................... 37

Annex 1. Main terms and definitions used in the development plan .................................................... 40

Annex 2. Individuals involved in the preparation of “Integrating Estonia 2020” ................................. 42

Annex 3. The composition, tasks and competence of the steering committee and steering group of the development ............................................................................................................................ 44

Annex 4. References ....................................................................................................................... 47
Introduction

The development plan “Integrating Estonia 2020” comprises the strategic objectives of the Estonian integration policy and the means for achieving them for the 2014–2020 period, continuing and further developing the strategic trends and activities initiated by the “Estonian Integration Strategy 2008–2013” and the national programme “Integration in Estonian society 2000–2007”. A national integration strategy is necessary for ensuring the sustainability of the Republic of Estonia and is one of the prerequisites for the realisation of many other national strategies.

For the purposes of this document, integration shall mean the increasing of cultural, political and socioeconomic coherence of society. The process of integration is characterised by the development of knowledge, skills and values, contributing to the development of society through practical cooperation and mutual openness. As a result, differences relating to the linguistic and cultural background and ethnicity of the members of society in participating in society decrease. Integration enables the development of a joint shared national identity of Estonia, increases the feeling of affiliation towards the state and other members of society, supports the growth potential of the economy and the stability of the state.

Integration as a social phenomenon is conflictive by nature as it aims at joining two contrasting processes in society – maintaining differences and increasing social coherence. An increasing social coherence presupposes the decreasing of ethnic differences in the cultural and social groups of society, as a result of which existing borders between groups change, but do not cease to exist. Integration also means supporting the specific culture of minorities. Integration must be seen as a process affecting society as a whole and concentrating on a linguistic and ethnic approach must stop.

The “Integrating Estonia 2020” development plan supports the multiculturalism of society and the enhancement of its preservation, and builds on the Constitution of the Republic of Estonia according to which the task of Estonia is to guarantee the preservation of the Estonian people, language, culture and the right of each individual to preserve his or her ethnic identity. No one may be discriminated against on the basis of nationality, race, colour, sex, language, origin, religion, political or other views, property or social status, or on other grounds. Equal treatment is more specifically regulated under the Equal Treatment Act prohibiting the discrimination of individuals on grounds of nationality (ethnic origin), race, colour, religion or other beliefs, age, disability or sexual orientation. In addition to domestic regulations, the development plan also builds on obligations and objectives brought by Estonia’s membership in international organisations and takes into account the framework for legal principles and policies established and coordinated on the European Union (EU) level.

The general objective of the activities specified in the development plan is a socially cohesive Estonian society, in which individuals with different linguistic and cultural backgrounds actively participate in society and share democratic values. Due to the multilateral nature of the integration process, the process also means taking into account activities supporting integration aimed at Estonian-speaking permanent residents and society as a whole in the development plan. Addressing integration policy as a broad process involving the entire society was also highlighted in previous policies and development plans, but the main target group of the integration policy to date has been

---

1The first strategic document in the field of integration was the “The Starting Points of the Estonian National Integration Policy for the Integration of Non-Estonians into Estonian Society” adopted in 1998 in the Riigikogu.
2Equal Treatment Act section 1, RT I 2008, 56, 315.
the Russian-speaking Estonian permanent residents without Estonian citizenship, most of whom are citizens of the Russian Federation or persons with undetermined citizenship. This does not constitute a homogeneous target group.⁴

The European Union membership and the free movement of workers, knowledge-based development of the Estonian labour market and economic policy as well as the internationalisation of education enhance immigration and emigration. The growing need for competing for quality labour with other countries as well as the harmonising effect of the European Union regulations on the migration and integration policy has resulted in a growing need to pay more attention to the adaption of new arrivals as well as their further integration into society. If the objective of the talent policy led by the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications is to facilitate the entering of skilled labour into Estonia and increase the interest of professionals and foreign students towards Estonia, then one of the objectives of the integration policy is to ensure conditions contributing to their adaptation and integration. In the context of demographic processes, the immigration of individuals contributing to the Estonian socioeconomic development is the key factor for the Estonian labour market and education for the coming years. People from Estonia who have been abroad for a longer time also need support and attention upon their return.

Taking into account the current socioeconomic situation of Estonian society and the diversity of the potential target group for the integration policy based on fundamental research⁴, three broader challenges can be distinguished in the field of integration: 1) increasing the openness of society, including Estonian-speaking permanent residents and making their attitudes towards integration more supportive⁵; 2) the continuing support for permanent residents⁶ with cultures and native languages different from Estonian in the society; 3) supporting the adaptation and integration of new arrivals as a growing target group.

The integration activities in this development plan support the active participation of individuals with different linguistic and cultural backgrounds in the development of a socially cohesive society. A successful integration process mainly takes effect based on free choice and motivation, supported by the national and community-based institutional framework, in which, in addition to public sector organisations, including local governments, organisations of the private sector and civil society are also included.

The development plan was prepared in cooperation with ministries and intermediate bodies, involving the broader public⁷ and building on the opinions of experts. The forming of integration activities in this development plan support the active participation of individuals with different linguistic and cultural backgrounds in the development of a socially cohesive society.
activities included in the development plan was based on the understanding that implementing the policy should be participatory and knowledge-based, build on open discussions and as many area studies, monitoring and expert assessments as possible and also on the performance reports of the Estonian Integration Strategy 2008–2013, which takes into account changes in society, evaluated and studied with the help of monitoring and surveys.8

Integration policy is horizontal by nature and involves several policy areas in the budget strategy of the state, helping to achieve their objectives, including helping to preserve the Estonian language and culture, strengthen Estonian security and increase the competitiveness of the economy. At the same time, the activities of other policy areas support achieving the objectives of the integration policy. Due to the transversal nature of integration, other development plans also contribute to achieving the main strategic objective of this development plan, primarily the Estonian Lifelong Learning Strategy 2014–2020, Development plan of the Estonian language 2011–2017, Youth Field Development Plan for 2014–2020 and the development plan of the Ministry of Social Affairs. Therefore, objectives are divided into two:

- objectives to be achieved under the development plan;
- integration objectives to be achieved through other development plans.9

The development plan “Integrating Estonia 2020” serves as a basis for the implementation of the national integration policy and the planning of financing in 2014–2020. The development plan shall be implemented through implementation plans, describing actions and measures, which are updated annually and are necessary for achieving strategic objectives.


9Description presented in chapter “The relation of the development plan with other policy documents and cross-cutting themes”.

---

text were open for comments in the osale.ee environment. During the entire process of preparing the development plan, website www.integratsioon.ee allowed to give feedback and input and access information on including target groups and stakeholders.
State of play

Outcomes of the Estonian Integration Strategy 2008-2013

The Estonian Integration Strategy 2008-2013 established as the main objective, the comprehensive integration of society based on democratic values, the keywords of which were equal opportunities, strengthening national identity and overcoming ethnic exclusion to encourage all members of society to contribute to the development of the state and its society. The sub-objectives were

- increasing contacts at all levels and increasing communication between people with different native languages as well as decreasing differences in participating in citizens' associations and the public sphere;

- decreasing the level of persons with undetermined citizenship among Estonian residents;

- increasing the trust of Estonian residents of different nationalities towards each other and Estonia;

- increasing the regular communication of information through media in the Estonian language to individuals whose native language is not Estonian and increase their trust towards the Estonian media;

- decrease differences in employment and incomes between employees of different nationalities.

Another important aspect was improving Estonian language skills among people whose native language is different from Estonian.

The objective of decreasing the level of persons with undetermined citizenship among Estonian residents was achieved, the level of the target group in the population decreased from 9% in 2007 to 6.5% in 2014. According to the population register, the majority of individuals with citizenships of other states are the citizens of the Russian Federation with a total of 94,404 people, followed by individuals with Ukrainian citizenship with 5,432 people. The largest group of other European Union citizens living in Estonia are citizens of Finland (4991), followed by citizens of Latvia (2877) and Lithuania (1830).

Some progress was made in 2008–2013 in improving Estonian language skills among people whose native language is different from Estonian. The transitioning to Estonian as a language of instruction for secondary education in upper secondary schools with other languages of instruction continued, aiming at increasing the competitiveness of Russian-speaking young people; the popularity of the language immersion programme also increased. Language programmes were launched for adults and people in vocational education; continuing education was provided for teachers of vocational

---

10 According to the data of the population register as at 01.01.2014, 1,354,679 people are living Estonia of whom 88,365 are persons with undetermined citizenship without a valid residence permit, but whose place of residence is registered in Estonia. According to the Population and Housing Census 2011 of Statistics Estonia, 93% of third-country nationals in Estonia are citizens of the Russian Federation.

11 According to the Population and Housing Census 2011, 15.6% of the Estonian population is formed by individuals with a citizenship other than Estonian and 22.6% by immigrants (individuals between 15–74 years of age living in Estonia whose parents were born in a foreign country).

12 As at the beginning of 2014, 51 kindergartens and 35 schools with a total of approximately 6,000 students are participating in the Estonian language immersion programme.
education institutions, students, employees of the public and third sector. Language clubs were initiated and comprehensive language-related counselling was provided. Free Estonian language courses were offered to third-country citizens and persons with undetermined citizenship as well as to people with fewer opportunities. The level of individuals having passed the Estonian language proficiency examination (A2–C1) also gradually increased.

The supporting of cultural associations of national minorities and Sunday schools as well as extracurricular Estonian language teaching for young people with a language of instruction different from Estonian in Estonian families and camps was continued; media and cooperation activities as well as providing information in different languages was supported. The results of EIM 2011 show that the estrangement among the Russian-speaking population characteristic to 2007–2008 has started to decrease and acquiring Estonian citizenship has become a topic of interest among persons with undetermined citizenship. The attitude of Estonians towards other nationalities has become more positive regarding inclusion and contacts and communication between individuals with different native languages have also increased. The consumption of Estonian media as well as trust towards Estonian media has also increased; differences in the number of long-term unemployed persons between Estonians and other nationalities have decreased. At the same time, the survey highlights the continuous negative attitude of Estonians towards representatives of other nationalities.

Approximately a third of the Estonian population using Russian as a main language of communication actively consumes Estonian media, but also mainly follows Russian television channels, resulting in an information space different from Estonians and information regarding the situation of the Estonian society. EIM 2011 points out that a lower trust towards Estonian state institutions and lower participation in civil society is characteristic of the population consisting of other nationalities.

The unemployment rate among individuals of other nationalities has always been higher than that of Estonians. If in 2010, the unemployment gap was 10.1 percentage points due to the economic crisis, then in 2013 the respective number was 5.6. The difference of employment rates between Estonians and other nationalities in 2013 has decreased to 2.7 percentage points. Other nationalities are more active on the labour market than Estonians; their labour participation is 1.2 percentage points higher than that of Estonians. The equalised disposable income of residents of other nationalities in 2012 was approximately 1600 euros i.e. 20 percentage points lower than that of Estonians.

According to the data of EIM 2011, 39% of residents who speak Estonian as a second language do not feel integrated into Estonian society and have a weak civil identity. According to the survey, international contacts in Estonia have increased; however, in one month, 45% of Estonians do not interact with representatives of other nationalities and 27% claim that there are no other nationalities in their circle of closest acquaintances. On the other hand, almost a third of permanent residents with Russian as their main language are well-managing, active individuals with a strong civil identity who nevertheless do not feel a part of Estonia.

15 EIM 2011.
16 Statistics Estonia. The annual equalised disposable income of Estonians in 2012 was 8322.91 euros and the respective income of other nationalities was 6704.56.
17 According to EIM 2011, the group constitutes for 92% of the total Estonian population of individuals with a foreign background. Compared to men, there are more women in the target group (53% women vs 47% men). The average age of the target group is between 30-55 (45%). By education, most of the individuals in the group have upper secondary education (66%). By social status, the majority of the group are skilled or unskilled workers (25%). Approximately the same
**Target group based approach**

**EIM 2011 drew attention to the fact that population groups with a native language different from Estonian need a different approach and support measures in the integration process.** As a result of the survey, indexes and integration clusters measuring the linguistic, political and social integration of the target group were mapped, describing the five levels of integration and the different dimensions of integration. The “Study of Social Groups in Integration”, carried out in 2013 by the Institute of International and Social Studies of Tallinn University (IISS), refers to different needs and integration patterns within integration clusters, implying the active inclusion of a wider target group in planning and implementing the integration policy. The same need is highlighted in the integration discussions of third-country citizens of Europe, carried out in cooperation with Praxis and the Institute of Baltic Studies in 2013. If, for well-integrated individuals, the priority issues are related to participation options and equal treatment then for less integrated individuals, the key issue is better employment opportunities and gaining trust through social security and networks.

**In area-specific monitoring, new arrivals and their families are highlighted as a clearly distinct group in the integration process.** International studies point out higher unemployment among immigrants, which is more common among family migration and highlight the risk of the poor integration of new arrivals in society, regardless of having resided in the country for a longer period. In the case of Estonia, the low preparedness of welcoming new arrivals has been highlighted. Different studies have highlighted that many obstacles impede the adapting of new arrivals in Estonia: mainly the low availability of practical everyday information in English and the fragmentation thereof (including on the internet), low supply of language courses and its low cohesion with culture training, bureaucratic procedures (including in obtaining a residence permit) and the low capacity of the state of providing services (including in English) to new arrivals, limited opportunities for communicating with Estonians and difficulties in finding work, a limited number of places in schools and kindergartens for family members in the case of family migration.

---

amount of individuals of other nationality are retired (24%). Compared to Estonians, there are more unemployed individuals (11%), but less of professionals, specialists, officials or self-employed individuals, entrepreneurs, middle managers or senior managers. Regionally, the majority reside in Tallinn (43%), followed by Virumaa (35%). The smallest number of representatives reside in South-Estonia (3%). Integration clusters are more specifically described in the integration monitoring of 2011.

18 The integration clusters of EIM 2011 describe target groups with a native language different from Estonian as a) equally in all three dimensions – civil identity, speaking Estonian and participation – integrated (21%); b) strongly integrated on a legal and political basis, but weakly integrated on a linguistic basis (16%); c) linguistically well-integrated, but with a low civil identity (13%); d) individuals mostly with an undetermined citizenship and weak language skills (28%); e) to a large extent individuals with the citizenship of the Russian Federation and mostly of older age (22%).

19 A Study of Social Groups in Integration, Tallinn University, IISS, 2013.

20 If, for well-integrated individuals, the priority issues are related to participation options and equal treatment then for less integrated individuals, the key issue is better employment opportunities and gaining trust through social security and networks.

21 According to the data of the Ministry of the Interior, in 2010–2012, the Police and Border Guard Board issued an average of 3061 temporary residence permits to third-country nationals (excluding persons with undetermined citizenship) and approximately 2819 third-country nationals extended their temporary residence permits per year (excluding persons with undetermined citizenship). Approximately 2039 EU citizens annually registered their residence and acquired a temporary right of residence in Estonia for five years.

22 International Organisation for Migration (IOM) 2011.

23 EIM 2011; Praxis 2013, Institute of Baltic Studies 2014, Expert opinions on the measure of the European Social Fund titled “Creating opportunities for residents living in Estonia and less integrated permanent residents in the Estonian society for increasing active participating and social activity as well as for supporting the adaptation and integration of new arrivals” („Võimaluste loomine Eestis elavate ning ühiskonnas vähelõimunud püsielanike aktiivse hõive ja ühiskondliku aktiivsuse suurendamiseks ja uussiserändajate kohanemise ja lõimumise toetamiseks”).

24 The evident lack of free-of-charge language teaching and the lack of English-based language courses as well as intermediate and upper-intermediate level courses; also, the poor accessibility of information regarding language courses.
Based on the aforementioned results, the measures and activities should be planned by taking into account the principle that in ensuring successful integration, various activities must be provided to different target groups. Measures supporting practical use of language and culture are targeted mainly at less integrated (clusters E, D and B) as well as young people, offering preparation courses on the Constitution and the Citizenship Act shall also be continued. Non-formal language teaching, cultural immersion, participation in decision-making processes and offering practical, including labour market related information, with the help of information and support networks is targeted at more well integrated people (clusters A, B and C). For this purpose, public and private sector organisations with a multilingual staff are supported and informed on career opportunities in the public sector. The population, Estonians as well as people of other nationalities, are offered communication projects for making the orientation of social values more open; also, joint activities initiated by citizen’s associations and cultural activities with the objective of uniting representatives of different nationalities are offered.

**Figure 1. Integration patterns by integration clusters**

---

Cluster A – comprehensively integrated (22%); characterised by higher than average civil identity, Estonian language skills and participating in Estonian social life. Half of the people in cluster A live in Tallinn and one third in other regions of Estonia (excluding Ida-Virumaa).

Cluster B – integrated in terms of citizenship and participation (16% of the Russian-speaking population in Estonia), characterised by relatively high civil identity. Many indicators of participating in social life are higher than of the total sample; however, the majority have not participated in political actions or citizens’ associations. Weak Estonian language skills are a significant characteristic of the representatives of the B cluster. The majority of representatives of this cluster reside in Ida-Virumaa (52%) and Tallinn (34%).

Cluster C – integrated in terms of language skills and participation (18% of the Russian-speaking population in Estonia), characterised by relatively active participation in social life, including communicating in Estonian and participating in an Estonian information space. However, this cluster is also characterised by lower civil identity. The majority of representatives of this cluster reside in Tallinn (60%) as well as in other regions of Estonia (excluding Ida-Virumaa) (25%).

Cluster D – integrated in terms of citizenship and language skills (18% of the Russian-speaking population in Estonia), characterised by higher than average Estonian language skills and civil identity. Their passivity is reflected in lower indicators of participating in social life. Representatives of the D cluster often reside in other Estonian regions (excluding Ida-Virumaa) (46%) and Tallinn (35%).

Cluster E – less integrated (26% of the Russian-speaking population in Estonia), characterised by lower than average indicators in all three dimensions of integration: lower civil identity, lack of Estonian language skills and low participation in Estonian social life. 52% of less integrated people reside in Ida-Virumaa and 33% in Tallinn.

**Source:** A Study of Social Groups in Integration, IISS, 2013.
The cohesion of society is hindered by the development of closed communities between whom there is no communication, no contacts and the members of which do not participate in a common social life.\(^{26}\) Therefore, in implementing the integration policy in Estonia, special attention should be paid to the Ida-Virumaa and Harjumaa areas on a regional level, where many Russian-speaking people reside.

Addressing integration as a process of multilateral social cohesion, international benchmarking\(^{27}\) stresses the need of integration policies to pay special attention to making attitudes more open on a wider scale in society. It is also important to pay attention to the supporting of the integration of beneficiaries of international protection.

In terms of linguistic-cultural communities, special attention should be paid to Roma, whose integration with society should be supported. Compared to other European Union Member States, the Estonian Roma community is rather small and this brings difficulties when considering them as a separate target group in integration policies. However, the Roma community still needs additional attention in the spheres of education, employment and social affairs.

**Area-specific challenges**

As a conclusion of EIM 2011, four central problems are revealed in the area of integration: the poor establishment of attitudes and common values supporting successful integration; a slowdown in

\(^{26}\) EIM 2011.

\(^{27}\) MIPEX (Migrant Integration Policy Index) 2011.
the naturalisation process; the low labour market activity\textsuperscript{28} of non-native Estonian speakers due to their insufficient official language skills and their low participation in society.

Active communication and positive contacts between different groups of society play a significant role in shaping attitudes supporting integration. Awareness of what is happening in society is one of the key elements in successful integration.\textsuperscript{29} The activities of people of different nationalities and associations of national culture also play an important role in ensuring this by promoting and introducing their national culture.

Naturalisation is related to the number of persons with undetermined citizenship, which is continuously decreasing. The main reason behind the decreasing number of naturalisation cases is the lack of motivation in acquiring Estonian citizenship as well as a poor knowledge of the official language. However, according to the data of EIM 2011, the language skills of residents with Estonian as a foreign language are increasing slowly but steadily. The lack of opportunities to practice language is also a problem, especially in Ida-Virumaa. A positive trend, according to EIM 2011, is the decreased number of persons not wishing to obtain any citizenship from 16\% in 2008 to the current 6\%.

For active and effective participation in society and the distribution and establishing of integration-supporting attitudes, the official language skills of permanent residents with a native language different from Estonian and of new arrivals must be improved; their adaption and awareness on the possibilities of acquiring citizenship must be supported; differences on the labour market and in participating in civil society should be reduced and connections with other members of society and the state must be encouraged. If a person contributes by enhancing their knowledge and skills, the state shall, in turn, create an environment and ensure the conditions for their integration in different areas of society.

The feeling of unequal treatment reflects the feeling of exclusion among individuals with a native language different from Estonian. Acknowledging and implementing the principles of equal treatment help to avoid inequality and exclusion resulting from national and racial origin, which, in turn, supports the objective of creating a socially cohesive society. The situation of individuals of different nationalities, including their possible unequal treatment on the labour market also needs attention from the point of view of integration. The development plan supports managing structural barriers hindering the active participation of individuals with a native language different from Estonian on the labour market. Special attention should be paid to activities targeted at employers and the area of labour relations to combat the glass ceiling effect.\textsuperscript{30}

The education system plays a key role in ensuring the success of the integration process and in developing necessary attitudes. In upper secondary education, as of 2013, all schools with Russian as the language of instruction have transitioned to subjects being taught in Estonian. In 2014, the transition to Estonian as the language of instruction will begin in vocational education. As a result of the transition of Russian upper secondary schools to Estonian language instruction, the level of

\textsuperscript{28}In addition to insufficient language skills, labour market activity is also influenced by other factors such as lower geographic mobility, orientation towards specific labour market segments and professions which can also be found in other countries.

\textsuperscript{29} Praxis 2013.

\textsuperscript{30} The glass ceiling effect is a theory describing the situation in which career advancement is hindered by unequal treatment, for example, due to gender or racial discrimination.
Estonian and Estonian language learning in Russian kindergartens and basic schools has increasingly improved. At the level of basic education, approximately 20% of Estonian students still study in schools with Russian as the language of instruction. Therefore, in the field of education, some activities targeted directly at integration differ: extending the content and language integrated learning (CLIL) (including developing the language immersion programme), supporting the teaching and learning of Estonian in schools with Russian as the language of instruction and supporting students with a native language different from Estonian studying in Estonian schools. Integration is also supported by the planned training of teachers and school leaders as well as the development programme of teaching materials and other activities under the Estonian Lifelong Learning Strategy. Special attention should also be paid to approximating schools with a different language of instruction. The Ministry of Education and Research is responsible for developing the respective strategy documents.

Based on the previous, the following aspects need to be earmarked for attention to achieve the objectives of integration:

- activities supporting active social participation and strengthening a common communication space, which take into account regional characteristics and also focus on the regions of Ida-Virumaa and Harjumaa, where many people with Russian as their main language of communication reside;
- activities which help to make society more tolerant and open, stressing the importance of cooperation between different ethnic groups in Estonia and creating open attitudes encouraging integration in society;
- activities supporting active participation on the labour market and ensuring equal opportunities;
- language learning activities, in addition to formal language learning, targeted at improving language skills through practical language use.
- activities introducing possibilities of practical participation in Estonian culture;
- activities supporting naturalisation;
- flexible activities promoting adaption targeted at new arrivals.

Related development plans

Many other development plans and activities contribute to the achieving of the 2014–2020 objectives in the area of integration. The Youth Field Development Plan for 2014–2020 contributes to the increase of the competitiveness of Estonian residents with a different linguistic and cultural background and also contributes to the inclusion of young people and employment capacity; the Estonian Lifelong Learning Strategy 2014–2020 as well as the 2014–2020 Strategy of the Language Immersion Programme, the Development plan of the Estonian language 2011–2017, implemented under the Lifelong Learning Strategy as well as labour market services based on individual needs, contribute to the ensuring of competitive knowledge and skills of students and adults with a different linguistic and cultural background.

Taking into account the connection of integration activities with the implementation of policies of other areas, it is essential to pay more attention to the cohesion between different development plans and other relevant strategic documents.
In particular, attention should be paid to cohesion with policy areas targeted at education, young people, labour market, internal security, regional policy and civil society. In the implementation of the integration plan, plans belonging to other policy areas are not implemented. However, the target groups will be given the opportunity to participate in the activities of other areas on equal grounds. In the long term, it is feasible to plan all integration objectives, measures and financial resources with indicators and target levels into relevant area-specific development plans, in turn, ensuring the harmonisation of integration in all policy areas.\(^31\)\(^\text{a}\) For successfully implementing the policy, it is essential to increase the cooperation between different organisations (including at public, private and civil society levels) and empower organisations in planning policies as well as participating in the implementation of the latter.

**Figure 2. The relation of the integration policy to other policy areas**

For achieving the objectives in the field of integration, it is important to pay attention to a knowledge-based approach in planning and evaluating policies. For achieving the aforementioned objective, systematic cooperation between ministries, policy makers, interest groups and social partners as well as private and third sectors is essential. It serves as a basis for the management structure of the development plan, supporting the cooperation between different parties and the inclusion of interest groups related to the area of integration in developing and shaping policies.

\(^31\)\(^a\) See Figure 2 below.

\(^32\)This is based on the Common Basic Principle 10 of the Communication of the European Commission COM(2005) 389 final “Common Agenda for Integration Framework for the Integration of Third-Country Nationals in the European Union: Mainstreaming integration policies and measures in all relevant policy portfolios and levels of government and public services is an important consideration in public-policy formation and implementation.
Objectives, measures and indicators for 2014–2020

General objective

General objective: That Estonian society is integrated and socially cohesive; people with different linguistic and cultural backgrounds actively participate in society and share democratic values.

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Base level</th>
<th>Target level 2017</th>
<th>Target level 2020</th>
<th>Responsible bodies:</th>
<th>Co-respondents:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The share of persons considering themselves being a part of the Estonian people based on the integration monitoring among all members of society as well as among individuals of other nationalities</td>
<td>all – 76%; other nationalities – 55%</td>
<td>all – 77%; other nationalities – 58%</td>
<td>all – 78%; other nationalities – 61%</td>
<td>Ministry of Culture</td>
<td>Ministry of the Interior, Ministry of Education and Research, Ministry of Social Affairs, Ministry of Justice</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Integration monitoring as an answer to the following question: “The Constitution of the Republic of Estonia states that in Estonia, supreme power of the state is held by the people. In terms of the Constitution, do you consider yourself being a part of the Estonian people?” 33 The base level has been measured under the 2011 integration monitoring of Estonian society.

Frequency: Measured regularly every three years.

The share of people with strong or rather strong national identity among people of other nationalities based on the integration monitoring.

Source: Integration monitoring, summary index based on arguments, established in the course of the 2014 integration monitoring.

Frequency: Measured regularly every three years.

---

33 In the next monitoring, the word “estonia” shall be replaced by “Estonia”. Under the terms of the Constitution, Estonian people are all people living in Estonia, including different ethnic groups.
## Sub-objectives

### Sub-objective 1

*Attitudes and values supporting integration have been established in Estonian society*

### Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Base level</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The frequency of contacts between Estonians and the representatives of other nations (share of people with many contacts)</strong></td>
<td>Estonians – 20%; other nationalities – 44%</td>
<td>Estonians – 23%; other nationalities – 46%</td>
<td>Estonians – 26%; other nationalities – 47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source:</td>
<td>Integration monitoring as an answer to the following question: Have you interacted with an Estonian / Russian, or other Russian-speaking people within the last week? The base level has been measured under the 2011 integration monitoring of Estonian society.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency:</td>
<td>Measured regularly every three years.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Differences in participating in civil society organisations between Estonians and people of other nationalities</strong></td>
<td>voluntary work: difference 9.2 percentage points; member of association/society: difference 5.1 percentage points;</td>
<td>voluntary work: difference 8.7 percentage points; member of association/society: difference 4.8 percentage points;</td>
<td>voluntary work: difference 8.4 percentage points; member of association/society: difference 4.5 percentage points;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source:</td>
<td>Integration monitoring as an answer to the following question: 1) Have you done any voluntary work in the past year? 2) Are you a member of any association or society? The base level has been measured under the 2011 integration monitoring of Estonian society.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency:</td>
<td>Measured regularly every three years.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The share of people with an open attitude based on the tolerance summary index</strong></td>
<td>Estonians – 22%; other nationalities – 36%</td>
<td>Estonians – 25%; other nationalities – 37%</td>
<td>Estonians – 27%; other nationalities – 38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source:</td>
<td>Integration monitoring. Three claims form the basis of the index: 1) A – exposure to different cultures enriches the Estonian society and promotes it; or B – differences between cultures create conflicts between groups and demolishes Estonian society. 2) A – it is better to let minorities live according to their values and norms, implementing common norms would depress the rights of the individual; B – minorities should take into account the will of the majority and follow the general values and norms of society. 3) A – I do not have anything against people whose lifestyle distinctly differs from the lifestyle of the general society and display it publicly; B – people can act however they want in their own homes and in the privacy of their closer circle of acquaintances, but I am bothered when people display their divergent lifestyle publicly. The base level has been measured</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Integration monitoring.
Measure 1.1. Supporting the awareness of a common information space and of cultural diversity

Responsible bodies: Ministry of Culture

Description of measure:

Media activities supporting increased social cohesion are carried out within the measure, supporting the establishing of values and attitudes targeted at openness and mutual understanding in society: activities targeted at the public in print, television and interactive media (including article series, television and radio shows and the development and translation of websites), reflecting the subject of integration and relating attitudes (valuing the cultural heritage, tolerance, equal treatment). Separate attention shall be paid to creating a new television programme proposed by the Estonian Broadcasting Council, aimed at the Russian-speaking target group, supporting respective development activities. Also, employers are informed about the importance of equal treatment in terms of staff policies and the economic value of a multicultural staff for enterprises (for example, in the service sector or for export purposes).

As a result of the measure, open and democratic values supporting integration as well as the common national identity building on them are acknowledged and valued in Estonian society.

Measure 1.2. Supporting everyday contacts, communication and involvement in society

Responsible bodies: Ministry of Culture

Description of measure:

Practical joint activities for supporting the development of active social participation and a common national identity shall be carried out within the measure as cooperation and involvement projects (including culture and sports projects, institutional cooperation projects for organisations of different Estonian regions and areas, empowering local NGOs in participating in decision-making processes on a local level). The cooperation between local governments in areas with a large percentage of Russian-speaking people and the non-profit organisations working within them is also supported. The aforementioned activities aim at increasing the involvement of people with different nationalities (especially of cluster A) and their participation in decision-making processes at the local government and regional level (developing dialogue platforms into the consensual solving of specific integration questions, etc.).

As a result of the measure, the practical contacts between people with a different linguistic and cultural background and people living in different areas are supported and people with a

---

34 For a common national identity to develop in a multicultural society, it is important to support the acknowledgement of shared democratic values, their recognition and distribution. Active participation and cooperation between people and groups of society in shaping the everyday life of Estonia will ensure the sense of unity and the development of the country.
different linguistic and cultural background as well as organisations based on their participation (including societies of national culture) are included in an active social life (including through participation on a local level in the Ida-Virumaa region).

Measure 1.3. Supporting the native language and culture of ethnic minorities.
Responsible bodies: Ministry of Culture, Ministry of Education and Research

Description of measure:

The measure foresees funding and introducing national minorities’ Sunday schools and activities of cultural societies representing different ethnic nationalities aimed at conserving the multicultural society of Estonia, including training leaders and teachers of Sunday schools as well as supporting projects.

As a result of the measure, the multiculturalism of the Estonian society, the sustainable functioning of organisations representing different national cultures and their systematic development is ensured.

Sub-objective 2

*The participation of less integrated permanent residents with a foreign background in society has increased through acquiring Estonian citizenship and through new social knowledge.*

**Table 3**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Base level</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of people having obtained Estonian citizenship by naturalisation</td>
<td>156,396</td>
<td>Increasing</td>
<td>increasing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source: Data of the Police and Border Guard Board, number of people having obtained Estonian citizenship by naturalisation from 1992. Base level measured as at 01.01.2014.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency: Measured annually.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of persons with undetermined citizenship</td>
<td>91,288</td>
<td>86,000</td>
<td>82,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source: Data of the Police and Border Guard Board. Base level measured as at 01.01.2014.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency: Measured annually.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The activities of the measure have an important connection to the implementation of the Civil Society development plan 2011-2014 in the implementation of which the following guiding principle shall be taken into account under the measures of the development plan: “The development plan creates connections with adjacent areas such as the inclusion of the Russian-speaking population in society or the civic education of national minorities, but avoids duplicating activities.”
Measure 2.1. Creating opportunities for less integrated Estonian permanent residents with a foreign background for increasing their social activity and supporting their integration.

Responsible bodies: Ministry of Culture

Description of measure:

The measure foresees developing and implementing flexible integration services, taking into account the needs of the target group (including introducing Estonian culture, preparation courses on the Constitution and the Citizenship Act, supporting the practicing of Estonian as a language), focusing on developing the practical competence in language and culture and offering practical information for integration (including information on other public services). The aforementioned activities also aim at introducing opportunities to the target group regarding how to better realise oneself through activities in the business or third sector and by finding better work. Imprisoned persons are also offered Estonian language courses. As a result of the measure, permanent residents who have participated in training courses and consumed information have acquired skills and knowledge (including language skills) necessary for naturalisation and participating in the public sphere, civil society and the labour market.

Measure 2.2. Supporting the integration on a legal and political basis

Responsible bodies: Ministry of Culture and Ministry of Justice

Description of measure:

The measure foresees carrying out and supporting projects targeted at civil education, aimed at strengthening the creating of a common state and national identity, and informing individuals not holding Estonian citizenship about the rights and obligations of owning citizenship. For increasing legal awareness, the circle of users of the www.juristaitab.ee website among the Russian-speaking population will be extended – translations of most significant acts and free legal assistance in Russian will be provided.

As a result of the measure, attitudes supporting a common national identity as well as democratic and civil values have strengthened among less integrated Estonian residents and their legal awareness has increased. Third-country nationals and persons with undetermined citizenship are also aware of their possibilities for acquiring Estonian citizenship.

Measure 2.3 Promotion of equal treatment on the labour market

Responsible bodies: Ministry of Culture

Description of measure:

Activities for promoting ethnic equal treatment in work collectives are implemented under the measure. In addition, public and private sector organisations with a multilingual staff are supported and people with a native language different from Estonian are informed on career opportunities in the public sector.

36 EIM 2011 and IISS 2013 have highlighted the different needs and expectations of target groups by integration clusters regarding integration activities.

37 Developing practical skills is mainly enabled by developing opportunities for language immersion.
As a result of the measure, the awareness of organisations on the necessity of decreasing ethnic segregation on the labour market has increased.

Sub-objective 3

New arrivals have adapted in the Estonian society

Table 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Base level</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The share of new arrivals who have completed the adaption training and who consider they have improved their competitiveness for functioning in society</td>
<td>none 38</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: The Ministry of the Interior, data according to the feedback of individuals having completed the adaptation training.

Frequency: Measured annually.

Measure 3.1 Offering adaptation training programmes for new arrivals 39

Responsible bodies: Ministry of the Interior

Description of measure:

The measure foresees developing and offering adaptation training for new arrivals in Estonia, taking into account their specific needs and aimed at helping the acquisition of basic practical knowledge and basic Estonian language skills regarding everyday life, society and statehood.

As a result of the measure, new arrivals have the knowledge and basic language skills necessary for functioning in their new society (organisation of state and society, cultural characteristics, information regarding everyday life). As a result, immigrants adapt faster and are capable of self-fulfilment in Estonian society.

Measure 3.2 Developing support services and adaptation training targeted at new arrivals

Responsible bodies: Ministry of the Interior

Description of measure:

An online information portal shall be developed under the measure, aiming at pooling information and offering the latter to the target group. In addition, organisations are supported in providing services to new arrivals and the creation of support networks is encouraged (including exchanging of knowledge between organisations related to new arrivals). The

---

38 The Ministry of the Interior began developing the flexible adaptation training targeted at new arrivals in 2014.
39 New arrival – a foreign national having legally emigrated to Estonia who has lived in Estonia less than five years. Reasons for immigration vary and cover all grounds for issuing residence permits established in the Aliens Act of Estonia, grounds for residing in a country established in the Citizen of the European Union Act and the grounds for issuing residence permits established in the Act on Granting International Protection to Aliens.
Unemployment Insurance Fund and officials of local governments will also be offered training focusing on the status and rights of and services targeted at immigrant groups.

As a result of the measure, the developed information portal shall ensure the accessibility of relevant and timely information, the development of services necessary for the target group and the creation of good cooperative relationships between the state, service-providers and the target group is supported. The quality and sustainability of providing services is ensured, the Unemployment Insurance Fund and officials of local governments are also aware of the rights of and services aimed at target groups.

Integration objectives to be achieved through other development plans

Presented below are integration objectives to be achieved through other development plans and measures which contribute to the achievement of the general objective specified in the “Objectives, measures and indicators for 2014–2020” chapter. The aforementioned objectives and measures comprise areas of education, youth work, labour market and adult language learning as the activities carried out under them are of key importance in terms of integration (see chapter “State of play” for additional information), but the activities and resources have been planned in other development plans.

Objective 4
Students with a native language different from Estonian have competitive knowledge and skills for functioning in an Estonian-speaking society.

Table 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Base level</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The average results of basic school examinations and upper secondary school state examination in Estonian as a second language</td>
<td>68 points (basic school)</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>69 points (all forms of study of upper secondary school)</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Statistical data of Foundation Innove; Base level measured in 2013.
Frequency: Measured annually.

The share of students having completed the B2-level examination in Estonian of all students in vocational training having taken the Estonian language proficiency examination.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>13.3%</th>
<th>25%*</th>
<th>32%**</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Source: Statistical data of Foundation Innove; The results of the state examination in Estonian as a second language combined with the B2-level examination are measured. Base level measured in 2014.* 2017/18 entrants ** 2019/2020 entrants

Frequency: Measured annually.

The share of students with high-level skills (PISA levels 5 and 6) in a school with a language of instruction different from Estonian compared to an Estonian school

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Estonian as native language 9.9%</th>
<th>Native language different from Estonian 9.7%</th>
<th>no difference</th>
<th>no difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Life sciences:</td>
<td>school with a language of instruction different from Estonian 6.2%; Estonian school 14.5%;</td>
<td>school with a language of instruction different from Estonian 8.7%; Estonian school 16.5%;</td>
<td>Literacy: school with a language of instruction different from Estonian 10.1%; Estonian school 11.7%;</td>
<td>Life sciences: school with a language of instruction different from Estonian 11.2%; Estonian school 18.5%;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: PISA test. Base level (all students: a) Reading Literacy 8.4%; b) Mathematics Literacy 14.6%; c) Science Literacy 12.8%) was measured in 2012.

Frequency: PISA 2015 results will be known by the end of 2016 (PISA 2015 results serve as target level for 2017). PISA 2018 results will be revealed by the end of 2019.

The difference between the percentage (%) of 18-24 year old young people with a low level of education with Estonian as their native language and young people with a native language different from Estonian

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Estonian as native language 9.9%</th>
<th>Native language different from Estonian 9.7%</th>
<th>no difference</th>
<th>no difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Estonian as native language 9.9%</td>
<td>Native language different from Estonian 9.7%</td>
<td>no difference</td>
<td>no difference</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Frequency: Measured annually.

The objective shall be achieved under the “Estonian Lifelong Learning Strategy 2020” and the “Development plan of the Estonian language 2011–2017”. The following are specific measures, which are based on the objectives of the development plan and are targeted at the target groups of the integration policy:

---

41 A low level of education is considered basic or incomplete basic education.
42 See part “Relation of the development plan to area-specific strategic documents”. 

Measure 4.1. Ensuring competitive education opportunities for individuals with a native language different from Estonian

Responsible bodies: Ministry of Education and Research

Description of measure:

In addition to developing the general training system, the measure also supports the shaping of training systems for teachers of Estonian and school leaders of general education schools, kindergartens and vocational educational institutions as well as Estonian teachers in non-formal education; it supports the creation of competences (including working in a multicultural learning environment) and types of cooperation for implementing a changed approach in teaching; the measure also offers information and counselling services for shaping knowledge based decisions and offers students, who have graduated from basic school with Russian as the language of instruction, opportunities for acquiring the Estonian language in general as well vocational education. Modern study materials will be prepared for learning Estonian as a foreign language. In terms of general education, attitude-shaping activities that value Estonian language are supported, giving students with a native language different from Estonian opportunities for using their Estonian language skills in real life (student exchange programmes, cooperation projects between Russian and Estonian schools, language camps, study visits focusing on language immersion, etc.). In vocational educational institutions, the acquisition of specialised Estonian language, including completing practical work and training in an Estonian-speaking environment is supported. Students of institutions of higher education are offered additional courses of Estonian and specialised language.

As a result of the measure, leaders and teachers of schools with a language of instruction different from Estonian are able to create an environment where attention is paid to the progress and the development of the potential of each student and where personal differences are valued. Schools with Russian as the language of instruction are included in joint projects, all students in the third stage of basic education are provided career studies and career counselling; conditions are created for people who lack Estonian language skills for acquiring a qualification and for applying themselves in the best way possible in their further working life; basic school graduates with Russian as their language of instruction are provided opportunities for acquiring Estonian language skills on an independent user level necessary for continuing studies in secondary school and/or in a vocational educational institution. In vocational education, students studying in Russian are provided additional Estonian language learning opportunities to help graduates acquire Estonian language skills necessary for further studying and employment. In the field of higher education, the objective is to help students with Russian as their native language who have completed higher education in Estonia, to develop their skills in Estonian and specialised language necessary for academic studying and working in the future. In addition, the creating of professional Estonian language e-courses and e-materials is supported. Also, opportunities for additional language learning shall be created in educational institutions for teachers with a native language different from Estonian.

43 Non-formal education is a type of adult education helping to develop a person’s creativity, talents and social skills. Non-formal education is mostly related to hobbies and pastimes.
Measure 4.2. Supporting the transition to Estonian, supporting language immersion and carrying out and implementing integrated learning

Responsible bodies: Ministry of Education and Research

Description of measure:

The measure foresees offering training courses for kindergartens and schools who have joined the language immersion programme; creating study methods allowing active language learning aiming at helping children practice Estonian on a daily basis; enhancing the effectiveness of teamwork and the networks of educational institutions; developing the content and language integrated learning (CLIL) model with the objective of making language immersion multidirectional. In addition, education institutions with Russian as the language of instruction are also supported in developing language immersion and in transitioning to Estonian language instruction (including a subsidy of 20% for schools allocated through local governments).

As a result of the measure, programme participants (organizations and people) are annually, nationally or regionally recognised; children of language immersion groups and students of language immersion classes are included in out-of-class activities allowing active language learning. Teachers use the principles of the language immersion method in teaching and are satisfied with their work, the developed guidelines, the quality of materials and the accessibility thereof. Language immersion has been reflected in the development plans of local governments who have joined the programme.

Objective 5

Students with a native language different from Estonian actively participate in youth work and have close contacts with Estonian-speaking peers.

Table 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Base level</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inclusion of young people in youth work in local governments, the population of which mainly consists of individuals with a native language different from Estonian, compared to the Estonian average</td>
<td>defined 2015</td>
<td>defined 2015</td>
<td>60% (equal to the average Estonian target level)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ministry of Education and Research: summary index of the inclusion of 7–26-year-old young people in hobby schools (Estonian Education Information System) number of contacts of information and counselling centres; number of participants in youth associations, number of participants in youth camps and number of youth work camps (information collected by the Estonian Youth Work Centre). For specifying data, serving as a basis for calculating the index in 2015, the indicator level and the target level of 2017 is established in local governments with a majority of non-Estonian residents.

Frequency: Measured annually.
The objective shall be achieved under the Youth Field Development Plan for 2014-2020 (see part “Relation of the development plan to area-specific strategic documents” for details). The youth field measure is based on the objectives of the development plan and is targeted at the target groups of the integration policy.

Measure 5.1. Increasing opportunities for initiatives, joint activities and increasing the involvement of young people

Responsible bodies: Ministry of Education and Research

Description of measure:

The objective of the measure is to increase the capability of the youth work field to create and develop a socialising environment suitable for young people and support young people’s own initiatives and the organising of youth projects. The measure supports the self initiative of young people and common activities through youth work; various forms of participation are created and developed and youth workers are trained for work with different youth groups. Particular attention shall be paid to including young people at risk of social exclusion. As a result of the measure, young people have wider opportunities for development and self-fulfilment and young people with a native language different from Estonian have the opportunity of participating in youth work, which supports the creation of a cohesive and creative society.

Objective 6

Working age residents with a native language different from Estonian are given opportunities for enhancing their knowledge and skills for a more competitive participation on the labour market.

Table 7

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Base level</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The self-rated active Estonian language skills of non-native Estonian speakers in society.</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Integration monitoring, the number of people with an active language skill and people having thorough knowledge of Estonian. The base level has been measured under the 2011 integration monitoring.

Frequency: Measured regularly every three years.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Base level</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment rate among Estonians and residents of other nationalities</td>
<td>difference 1.82 times</td>
<td>difference 1.75 times</td>
<td>difference 1.625 times</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

44 The activities of the measure have an important connection with the implementation of the Youth Field Development Plan for 2014–2020, the implementation of which, under all measures of the development plan, takes into account the cross-cutting principle “The youth field contributes to the integration of society, including promoting equality and preventing discrimination as well as encouraging a caring attitude towards the surrounding environment.”
### Source:


### Frequency:

Measured annually. Base level measured in 2013.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employment rate among Estonians and residents of other nationalities</th>
<th>Estonians – 63.0% residents of other nationalities – 60.3%</th>
<th>Estonians – 63.2% residents of other nationalities – 61.2%</th>
<th>Estonians – 63.6% residents of other nationalities – 62.1%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

The objective shall be achieved under the development plan of the Ministry of Social Affairs and the “Estonian Lifelong Learning Strategy 2020”\(^{45}\). The following are specific measures which are based on the objectives of the development plan, and are designed for the target groups of the integration policy:

**Measure 6.1. Increasing the employment of residents of other nationalities**

**Responsible bodies:** Ministry of Social Affairs

**Description of measure:**

The Estonian Unemployment Insurance Fund offers a total of 20 labour market services, the objective of which is to support people entering the labour market. The Unemployment Insurance Fund offers services, implementing an individual approach to each person, regardless of their nationality or language skills, identifying the needs of the specific unemployed person and their prospects upon entering the labour market. In offering labour market services, professional training, work experience, and the needs and opportunities of the individual are considered.

Clients whose employment is hindered by a lack of Estonian language skills are offered Estonian language training, specialised Estonian language training or professional training courses including an Estonian language module by the Unemployment Insurance Fund. The Unemployment Insurance Fund shall also actively inform clients regarding the opportunities of independent Estonian language learning. When necessary, the Unemployment Insurance Fund provides or organises labour market services for customers who do not speak Estonian (e.g. training courses, work exercise career counselling, and workshops for finding work, job clubs, psychological counselling, and individual recruitment) in Russian. When possible, Estonian language practicing is integrated in services offered in Russian (e.g. job clubs, work exercises). Consultants of the Unemployment Insurance Fund counsel Russian-speaking people in their

\(^{45}\)See part Relation of the development plan to horizontal strategic plans (“Arengukava seos horisontaalsete strateegiliste kavadega”) for more details.
native language, ensuring that people are informed about their possibilities and obligations. If needed and possible, the Unemployment Insurance Fund also offers counselling in English.

The Ministry of Social Affairs has planned activities for the ESF 2014–2020 period, which, *inter alia*, support the employment participation of the “Integrating Estonia 2020” target group. Planned services are generally available to all clients regardless of their ethnicity and linguistic skills and are provided according to individual needs just as all other labour market services. The objective of the activity titled “My first job” is to reduce youth unemployment by helping young people with little or no work experience or professional training to find work. Mobility support is also offered under the programme, aimed at unemployed persons whose employment is hindered by finding work near their place of residence and who begin working at least 30 kilometres from their place of residence. As low mobility is also a problem for unemployed people of other nationalities, the activity will help to increase the employment rate of the target groups of the integration development plan.

**Measure 6.2. Improving the knowledge of the official language of individuals with a native language different from Estonian**

*Responsible bodies: Ministry of Education and Research*

*Description of measure:*

The measure foresees creating a system for ensuring the quality of Estonian language learning, aimed at increasing the effectiveness of Estonian language learning for training personnel and establishing quality criteria for training institutions and their compliance therewith through surveillance. For this purpose, an extension of the sphere of responsibility of the Language Inspectorate is planned.

Individuals not knowing sufficient Estonian shall be given the opportunity of participating in language learning. Target groups are offered flexible opportunities for learning Estonian depending on their needs with the aim of increasing learning readiness and competitiveness on the labour market. The measure will also ensure the availability of modern digital learning materials necessary for acquiring Estonian (including via www.keeleklikk.ee).

The relation of the development plan with other policy documents and cross-cutting themes

The development plan and Estonian integration policy builds on the document “The Starting Points of the Estonian National Integration Policy for the Integration of Non-Estonians into Estonian Society” adopted in 1998 in the Riigikogu:

- Future orientation. The integration policy must ensure the conservation of the Estonian nation and culture, and the future of Estonia in a united Europe, which is stable and has the capacity for development.
- Targeted at children and young people. The objective is to develop the current generation growing up in Estonia into a society valuing Estonia and considering it to be their home.
- Integration as a challenge for development, for Estonians as well as for non-Estonians.
- The active participation of non-Estonians in integration as real subjects whose needs and expectations are taken into account in developing the integration policy.
- Feeling of security as a foundation for integration. The real breaking down of barriers and development of tolerance can only take place when all parties feel secure.

The relation of the development plan to related international conventions

The development plan “Integrating Estonia 2020” builds on obligations and objectives brought by Estonia’s membership in international organisations and takes into account the framework for legal principles and policies established and coordinated on the European Union level. In preparing “Integrating Estonia 2020”, agreements of the European Union as well as other international agreements have been complied with, including the Treaty on European Union, the Treaty establishing the European Community and the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union; the development plan also builds on the general objectives of the Europe 2020 strategy. The development plan takes into account the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms as well as the UN Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the UN International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and the UN International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination.

In conclusion, the following are conventions of international organisations which Estonia has joined and the performance of which is supported by integration activities:

Relationship of the development plan to horizontal strategic plans

The National Security Concept of the Republic of Estonia

The objective of the security policy is to prevent security risks to the state and promote the following for coping therewith: 1) social cohesion, which is increased by better employment and inclusion in society; 2) psychological protection, which includes developing and conserving common values and increases trust towards civil society and the state. Psychological protection is developed in cooperation with all participants of civil society; 3) integration, the objective of which is shaping a culturally diverse Estonian society with a strong identity and common values.

“Integrating Estonia 2020” contributes to the achieving of security policy objectives, continuing activities encouraging the integration of different groups of society in order to develop opportunities of actively participating in society. The effectiveness of integration is also supported by harmonised regional development, accessibility of education, encouraging the learning of the official language and the consistent implementation of the integration process. The integration policy is supported by the activities of citizens’ associations, local governments and state authorities.

The Estonian National Strategy on Sustainable Development “Sustainable Estonia 21”

The objective of the strategy is the vitality of the Estonian cultural area – for example, enabling the intensity of using Estonian cultural elements (including the language) in different areas of life, the reputation of Estonian culture and the wide availability thereof as well as implementing integration mechanisms that ensure the integration of new arrivals with the Estonian cultural area; the growth of well-being as satisfying the material, social and cultural needs of people resulting in the opportunity for self-fulfilment and realising one’s ambitions and objectives. It is envisioned that by 2030, disparities resulting from ethnic origin of individuals in employment, participation in politics, etc. are minimal.

The development plan “Integrating Estonia 2020” mainly contributes to the “Sustainable Estonia 21” objective of creating a cohesive society in which all members of society participate in a manageable way, creating benefits and take part in what has been created, and where differences resulting from ethnic backgrounds in participation on the labour market as well as in society as a whole are minimal. The development plan also contributes to the conservation of the Estonian cultural area, supporting the development of different national cultures.

National Reform Programme “Estonia 2020”

The programme focuses on restoring the high employment rate precluding the economic crisis, which is related to increasing the share of people with third degree education in society and the growth of people participating in lifelong learning, which would, in turn, decrease the rate of relative poverty, the rate of long-term and youth unemployment. The strategy also focuses on increasing the rate of participating in employment and encouraging highly qualified labour to work in Estonia.

“Integrating Estonia 2020” contributes to achieving the objectives of the competitiveness plan, mainly by empowering people with a native language different from Estonian to participate in lifelong learning and on the labour market; the development plan also helps to improve the competitiveness of people with a native language different from Estonian and creates a social background supporting integration in Estonian society for qualified workers.
Relationship of the development plan to area-specific strategic documents

Active Ageing Development Plan 2013–2020

The objective of the Active Ageing Development Plan is to shape an age-friendly society and ensure quality of life and equal opportunities for the elderly. The area of integration relates to the Active Ageing Development Plan in terms of social activity, the prerequisite of which is an open background supporting activity and the knowledge and opportunities of realising oneself in society.

“Integrating Estonia 2020” contributes mainly to the following objectives of the development plan: 1) the elderly are included in society and are socially active; 2) the elderly are willing to learn and are versatile active learners and 3) the elderly are active on the labour market and satisfied with life. The contribution of the development plan consists of creating background conditions, including developing the practical Estonian language skills of elderly non-native Estonian speakers.

Estonian Lifelong Learning Strategy 2014–2020

The objective of the strategy is to provide education opportunities for Estonian people equal to their needs and skills throughout their entire life. The strategy contributes to the objectives of the “Integrating Estonia 2020” development plan, mainly through ensuring quality Estonian language teaching in general education schools as well as in non-formal education and adult education, and developing continuing vocational training and retraining for individuals of all ages.

“Integrating Estonia 2020” contributes to the objectives of the Estonian Lifelong Learning Strategy mainly through distributing information on the use of the different opportunities of the strategy (including Estonian language learning).

Estonian Entrepreneurship Growth Strategy 2014–2020

The objective of the strategy is to increase productivity as well as the employment rate and to ensure that Estonian entrepreneurs earn more profit for high value products and services. One of the activities of the growth strategy is to develop an efficient talent policy. The strategy foresees simplifying the finding, recruiting, adaptation and implementing of talents. The objective of the growth strategy is to make Estonia a destination country for talent, where personal services necessary for the adaptation of talents and their family members are flexibly combined. The strategy supports the creation of a talent network, and their cooperation, and contributes to the talent policy by shaping the reputation of Estonia and creating a suitable living and working environment. In the course of the growth strategy, the “Made in Estonia 3.0” action plan regulating Estonian state foreign investment and export activities has been approved, mapping state activities for increasing the export capacity of Estonian enterprises and for including foreign investments for 2014–2017. The action plan actively introduces Estonia as an attractive country to work in, in which the workinestonia.com website of Enterprise Estonia plays an essential role. As a result of the activities, the work culture of Estonian enterprises should become more international with the help of which the competitiveness of non-native Estonian speakers on the labour market should also improve. Enterprise Estonia also offers counselling in English and Russian on starting a business and introducing the opportunities of applying for grants to individuals with a native language different from Estonian. The growth strategy also foresees the growth of exporting enterprises. For this, the state shall help to mediate contacts of Estonian enterprises to partners of markets nearby as well as
of those further away, aiming at increasing the opportunities of enterprises to enter foreign markets as producers or exporters of a service. Exporters are offered information support in the destination country, specific counselling regarding the destination country, training and other export support services. While in previous years export training was also offered in Russian, due to the lack of participants no export training in Russian will be planned for the upcoming years.

**Development plan of the Estonian language 2011–2017**

The objective of the Development plan of the Estonian language is to ensure the functioning of the Estonian language as the official language in all areas of life and ensure the teaching, research, development, protection and conservation of Estonian. The Estonian language must have development potential and be recognised as a common language of communication for Estonian residents.

Knowledge of the national language is one of the prerequisites for successful integration and the development plan of the Estonian language contributes to integration by developing language learning in formal education as well as in adult education and developing the continuing education of Estonian teachers. In a situation where schools with Estonian as the language of instruction are becoming multinational and multicultural, the objective is to ensure a valuing attitude towards Estonian language and culture among all students, and language skills compliant with the requirements of today’s society. An individual having graduated from a general education school with a language of instruction different from Estonian should have sufficient language skills in Estonian to be able to perform at the next level of education as well as in their working life. The objectives of the Development plan of the Estonian language are ensuring Estonian language skills and developing attitudes valuing Estonian language in general education with a language of instruction different from Estonian, supporting the teaching of specialised Estonian language skills and academic communication skills, and providing language support for university students with a language of instruction different from Estonian. Models of bilingual education must be developed and supported, including developing and supporting language immersion, and content and language integrated learning; also, programmes helping new arrivals to adapt must be developed and implemented.

The development plan “Integrating Estonia 2020” contributes to the Development plan of the Estonian language mainly by supporting the improvement of Estonian language skills of Estonian residents.

**Estonian Regional Development Strategy 2014–2020**

The general objective of the regional development strategy is ensuring the sustainable development of all regions as well as supporting integration between different regions of Estonia, including supporting better contacts between students and teachers, peers and colleagues from other Estonian regions. Development plan “Integrating Estonia 2020” contributes to the achievement of the objectives of the Regional Development Strategy mainly through strengthening the social cohesion of Ida-Virumaa with other regions of Estonia and encourages the international economic competitiveness of larger urban areas through foreign skilled labour, investors, professionals, researchers and students as well as through encouraging adaptation. The Regional Development Strategy contributes to the achieving of “Integrating Estonia 2020” objectives via the “Sustainable development of the cities of Ida-Viru County” measure financed by structural instruments. The
measure focuses on developing a sustainable urban, human, and environmentally friendly public area as well as on physically, economically and socially revitalising less used urban areas.

**National Tourism Development Plan 2014–2020**

The development plan focuses on the effective implementation of the development potential of the Estonian tourism sector, the objective of which is to ensure the competitiveness of Estonia and its international attractiveness as a tourism destination. “Integrating Estonia 2020” contributes to the development plan through the conservation and introduction of the multiculturalism of Estonia.


The objective of the strategy is to increase the quality and volume of research and development activities, to make Estonian entrepreneurship more open to innovations and capable of creating added value in terms of the global economy, and have society focusing on long-term development and innovation.

The development plan “Integrating Estonia 2020” contributes to the achieving of strategic objectives supporting the studying, working and adapting of specialists necessary for the state and its economy.

**The Main Guidelines of Estonia’s Security Policy Until 2015**

The Main Guidelines of Estonia’s Security Policy Until 2015 defines the common principles, vision, strands and long-term impact based objectives of the security policy, which the public, non-profit and private sector must build on and to the achieving of which they must contribute. The main orientations of the security policy foresee the decreasing of international tensions as a result of more effective integration activities. The main guidelines of the security policy also support integration objectives through measures of reducing risk behaviour and measures reacting to and preventing offences.

The development plan “Integrating Estonia 2020” contributes to the main guidelines of Estonia’s security policy mainly through supporting the creating of common values among different groups of society. International tensions decrease as a result of more effective integration activities.

**Development Plan of Internal Security 2015–2020 (draft)**

The general objective of the draft Development Plan of Internal Security 2015-2020 is to ensure that Estonian people feel that they live in a free and safe society where the value, inclusion and contribution to the safety of the community by each individual help to create a safer European country. Smart, optimal and effective solutions improve the living environment, reduce risks to life, health, assets and constitutional order, and provide fast and professional help.

The development plan “Integrating Estonia 2020” is mainly connected with the draft Development Plan of Internal Security 2015-2020 programme “Harmonised citizenship and migration policy”. In shaping the integration policy it is also important to build on developments in the areas of migration policies and ensure sufficiently flexible measures and solutions in a changing environment. Activities planned in the integration plan for reducing the number of persons with undetermined citizenship, mainly by ensuring the quality and opportunities of Estonian language learning and the integration programme for individuals wishing to complete the examination on the knowledge of the Constitution of the Republic of Estonia and the Citizenship Act, for the adaptation of new arrivals and
for increasing the general openness of the Estonian society support the objectives of the draft Development Plan of Internal Security 2015-2020.


The objective of the Ida-Virumaa action plan is to ensure the harmonised development of the county and common development priorities for a longer period. The essence of the action plan is targeted at increasing the cohesion of the region with the rest of Estonian society. The objective of the development plan is, *inter alia*, to ensure the effective resolution of issues resulting from unemployment and other social and cultural aspects. The action plan concerns all important strands of actions and economy, serving as a document supporting national development and action plans.

In 2014, the new Ida-Virumaa action plan shall be prepared for the 2015–2020 period. It will focus on the need for creating a modern living environment, the further developing of an infrastructure targeted at entrepreneurship, taking into account the horizontal view of the development plan, the interests of the state as well as the characteristics and opportunities of the region. Creating jobs and the development of economy is a prerequisite for solving all other issues, as regional development of the area as well as strengthening internal security are both essential. In terms of integration, the development plan focuses on overcoming the social, economic and regional differences of the population, encouraging, in addition, the integration of residents with a different linguistic and cultural background in society.

The activities of “Integrating Estonia 2020” are targeted at all Estonian regions, but due to the linguistic and cultural background of the population of Ida-Virumaa and its specific socioeconomic conditions, some of the integration activities focus mainly on Ida-Virumaa. The main activities of the integration plan aimed at strengthening the cohesion of the Ida-Virumaa region with other Estonian regions are cooperation and communication activities, language learning activities, including developing language immersion and CLIL studies and providing language learning courses for non-native speakers of Estonian, providing information supporting active participation in society and supporting activities of national culture societies.

Civil Society Development Plan 2011–2014

The objective of the Civil Society Development Plan is to increase the awareness of Estonian residents on the functioning of a democratic society, on the importance of civil participation, opportunities, rights, and responsibilities as a citizen. The objective is to promote civil education in general education schools as well as among adults; to improve the quality and content of civil education, and include a larger proportion of people such as people of other nationalities and non-Estonian speakers in civil education and social life and avoiding their exclusion. Another important aspect is developing citizens’ associations, as citizens’ associations with operational capacity are an essential prerequisite for the development of democracy. Other language speaking community groups need support and encouragement for joining citizens’ associations as well as for a more active participation in third sector activities.

The development plan “Integrating Estonia 2020” contributes to the development plan mainly through supporting the creating of common values between different groups of society, through supporting cooperation activities and supporting the provision of civil education.
The general principles of cultural policy until 2020

The general objective of cultural policy is creating a society which values creativity, conserving and promoting the Estonian national identity; researching, storing and carrying the cultural memory as well as creating favourable conditions for the development of a viable, open and diverse cultural area, and for participating in the aforementioned cultural area. One of the benchmarks of the trends of culture policy is that both Estonians and representatives of other nationalities living in Estonia create Estonian culture.

The development plan “Integrating Estonia 2020” contributes to the achieving of cultural policy objectives through supporting cultural and social activities of different linguistic and cultural groups of society.

Youth Field Development Plan for 2014–2020

The objective of the Youth Field Development Plan is to provide all young people, regardless of their ethnic nationality and native language, more opportunities for developing their creativity, own initiatives and common activities; to reduce the impact of unequal aspects on the development opportunities of young people and avoid exclusion; to ensure active participation in the community, in decision-making and success on the labour market as well as implement quality youth policies and youth work.

The Youth Field Development Plan contributes directly to the achieving of integration objectives in terms of all three sub-objectives of the development plan as well as achieving the integration objectives under chapter “The relation of the development plan with other policy documents and cross-cutting themes” which focuses on reducing youth inequality and increasing active participation in social life. “Integrating Estonia 2020” contributes to the achieving of the objectives of the youth field mainly by including young people in social processes, including increasing the inclusion of young people with a different linguistic and cultural background in decision-making processes.

Compatriots Programme 2014–2020

The main objective of the Compatriots Programme is to support the conservation and development of the Estonian language and culture outside Estonia. The activities of the measure support the teaching of and in Estonian in schools abroad and the studying of foreign Estonians in Estonia, the conservation of the culture and cultural heritage of compatriots’ living abroad and the feeling of cohesion among Estonians, encouraging the returning of Estonians to Estonia as well as strengthening the cooperation between foreign Estonians and Estonians living in Estonia.

The development plan contributes to the compatriots programme mainly through encouraging the creating of social cohesion supporting adaptation and through developing and providing activities targeted at language learning and practical consumption of culture.

National Defence development plan 2013–2022

Integration is linked to non-military national defence in terms of internal security. The basis for internal security is a safe living environment, a cohesive and functioning civil society which is based on the cooperation of the public, private and non-profit sectors and conscious citizen activity, and where the state has enough power to react to risks and relieve damages caused by materialised risks.

“Integrating Estonia 2020” contributes to the area of national defence in terms of internal security and psychological defence. The first mainly concentrates on making people with different linguistic
and cultural backgrounds active in civil society and increasing active citizenship. The area of psychological protection focuses on providing sufficient information on Estonia and its functioning to residents of Estonia with a different linguistic and cultural background.

**Estonian Public Broadcasting development plan 2015–2018**

According to the development plan, Estonian Public Broadcasting encourages the culture and language based programming of different ethnic groups residing in Estonia and offers them opportunities for introducing their language and culture. To improve mutual understanding and tolerance, representatives of different ethnic groups shall be given the opportunity to express opinions. The objective of the activity of Radio 4 (*Raadio 4*) is to ensure that the foreign audience is in the same information space as Estonians. A growing number of Russian-speaking young people also speak Estonian, meaning that their inclusion in the Estonian-speaking information space is a topic that needs to be addressed in the coming years. The objective of the Russian programme of ETV2 is to offer Russian news, giving a harmonised image of events in Estonia, and ETV programmes with Russian subtitles. Environments encouraging Russian interactive discussion on vital issues also need development – this objective aims at strengthening the rus.err.ee website.

**Development plan for security, inclusion and equal opportunities for 2016–2023**

The objective of the development plan is to help people improve and ensure functioning and equal opportunities for participating in social life (including on the labour market), encouraging gender equality in all areas of social life and promoting tolerance in society. “Integrating Estonia 2020” contributes to the development plan mainly through activities focusing on equal treatment and promoting tolerance in society between individuals of different ethnic nationalities.

**Relationship to crosscutting themes in the area-specific development plan**

**Environmental conservation and climate**

Neutral impact. Objective 2 of the development plan foresees the development of civic competence, including the development of knowledge and attitudes supporting environmental protection among the residents of Estonia. Objective 3 of the development plan foresees activities on a local level aiming at developing cooperation at the community level, including the development of one’s own environment. Therefore, the development plan allows supporting the development of positive attitudes of people with different linguistic and cultural backgrounds towards environmental protection and increased activity in the responsible development of their living environment.

**Equal opportunities**

Positive impact. The activities of the development plan as a whole are targeted at ensuring equal opportunities for people with a different linguistic and cultural background. The activities of the development plan are thus targeted mainly at residents of other nationalities allowing them to introduce and develop their language and culture, but also to learn the Estonian language, culture and history. In planning the activities of the development plan and making information accessible, the specific needs of minority groups (for example, adapting learning materials for special needs students, training courses for pedagogues working with special needs students (vision and hearing impaired people)) as well as taking into account accessibility issues, including the special needs of persons with disabilities.
Information society

Positive impact. In planning the activities of the development plan, the crosscutting target is supporting the further development of e-services: interactive provision of language learning and adaptation programmes, developing of information and e-services and making them accessible for Estonian residents, ensuring users of information services access to digital infrastructure. The accessibility of information has been separately highlighted as an important prerequisite in ensuring involvement, supported by measures 1.1, 2.1 and 3.1.

Regional development

Positive impact. The crosscutting theme in the flexible shaping of services and activities fully supports taking into account the specific needs of regions and contributes to achieving a more harmonised development depending on the characteristics of different regions. The activities of sub-objective 1 contribute to sustainability and interregional cooperation through supporting the creation of lasting cooperation relations by promoting these at a local level between people and organisations of one region as well as between different regions, focusing mainly on Ida-Virumaa. The activities of the development plan, specifically of sub-objectives 2 and 3, are aimed at creating background conditions for increasing employment.

The preparation process of the development plan also takes into account connections with local initiatives and therefore avoids inconsistencies with local and regional development priorities.

State governance

Positive impact. The crosscutting principle of the development plan is the cooperation between ministries and intermediate bodies in the successful planning and implementing of policies. In both preparing and implementing the development plan, a steering group and steering committee are formed to achieve the established objectives; their competence is specified and relevant ministries and intermediate bodies are included. As an initiative taking into account the administrative capacity of the local government level, sub-objective 3 focuses on activities improving the service offering capacity of local governments.

In addition to using existing research and data in preparing the development plan, additional analyses have been carried out and experts have been consulted, including in terms of collecting statistical data. The inclusion of the wider public in preparing the development plan ensured input policy making and that relevant parties were informed.

The activities of the development plan support the user-friendly provision of public services for users and providers as well as for stakeholders, for participating in the process. Many activities of sub-objectives 2 and 3 are specifically aimed at developing an optimal model of service provision.
The preparation, management and implementation, monitoring and financing of the development plan

**Preparation of the development plan**

In accordance with the decision of the Government of the Republic on 11.10.2012, the Ministry of Culture is responsible for preparing the development plan.

For preparing the development plan, bilateral meetings were carried out between the Ministry of Culture and other ministries and institutions within their jurisdiction to identify the connections between activities of different policy areas. Discussion seminars in Estonian, English and Russian with representatives of the target group also took place to get an overview of their needs and the potential challenges of the policy.

1. The preparing of the development plan consisted of five central stages:
   1. Mapping of the situation.
      Information on the previous activities, state of play, and significant problems and results in the area of integration was collected and analysed in 15 subject area working groups. In cooperation with Praxis, additional integration discussions were carried out with European third-country nationals with the objective of involving the target group in the development of the new integration policy of Estonia.
   2. Developing the concept.
      On the basis of the revealed need; priority areas, strands, objectives and vision were formulated.
   3. Developing solutions.
      Measures necessary for achieving results, and relationships to other development plans were mapped; target groups of actions and expected results were established.
   4. Preparing of the implementation plan.
      The financial resources, time schedule and implementation options of activities were coordinated with the relevant ministries.
   5. Preparing the final document of the development plan.
      A development plan and its implementation plan for 2014–2017 was prepared and coordinated with relevant ministries.

An expert committee\(^{46}\) consisting of area experts and scientists divided into 15 subject areas supported the preparation of the development plan.

In addition to the expert opinion, individual input was also taken into account in preparing the development plan, made available through the [www.integratsioon.ee](http://www.integratsioon.ee) website in Estonian, Russian and English.

**Management and implementation**

The implementation of the development plan is managed by a steering group consisting of representatives of stakeholder ministries, intermediate bodies, the Government Office, Ministry of Finance and the stakeholders of the development plan. In addition to organisations of the public sector, area experts mainly from research organisations and civil society shall be included in the work of the steering group. The steering group meets at least twice a year during the implementation

\(^{46}\)The composition of the expert group is presented in Annex 2 to the development plan.
period of the development plan. The work of the steering group is managed by the Cultural Diversity Department of the Ministry of Culture.\textsuperscript{47}


The multidisciplinary strategic head of the integration plan is the steering committee of the development plan under the general responsible body supported by the steering group.\textsuperscript{48} The Ministry of Culture organises the work of the steering committee and the steering group substantively as well as technically.

The development plan will include the generalised strands of the area up to 2020. Annual activities shall be specified in the implementation plan presented with the annually updated development plan.

\textbf{Monitoring and financing}

The activities of the development plan are regularly monitored, including with the help of expert opinions and evaluations, and annual reports and monitoring carried out every three years. The integration monitoring analyses the success of carrying out the activities of the development plan in all target groups and areas specified in the development plan. A monitoring focusing on quantitative and qualitative data collection shall be carried out in 2014–2015, 2017, 2020–2021.

For preparing effectiveness reports and the final report on the development plan, involved ministries present their conclusion to the Ministry of Culture on the implementation of measures and activities within their jurisdiction by 15 January at the latest of the year following the reporting period. The Ministry of Culture prepares a performance report, coordinates it with ministries and presents it to the Government of the Republic by 1 March of each year at the latest. The final report of the development plan shall be presented to the Government of the Republic by 30.06.2021 at the latest.

An implementation plan for 2014–2017 shall be prepared for implementing the “Integrating Estonia 2020” development plan. The implementation plan of the development plan specifies activities to be carried out in the respective period, the schedule for carrying out the activities, co-respondents and main responsible bodies as well as sources of resources to be used in carrying out the activities. The implementation plan is updated once a year in coordination with the state budget strategy approved by the Government of the Republic and is presented to the Government Office and Ministry of Finance by 10 May of each year at the latest.

In addition to other areas of activity of the Ministry of Culture, the development plan also relates to activities of the Ministry of Education and Research, Ministry of Social Affairs, Ministry of the Interior and the activities in the scope of the Ministry of Justice as well as to activities carried out under the

\textsuperscript{47}The composition, tasks and competence of the steering group of the development plan are presented in Annex 3 to the development plan.

\textsuperscript{48}The composition, tasks and competence of the steering committee of the development plan are presented in Annex 4 to the development plan.

The Ministry of Culture is responsible for the implementation of the development plan. Other included ministries and ministries cited in the implementation plan of the development plan and the intermediate bodies thereof have coordinated activities in their sphere of responsibility specified in the development plan and are responsible for the implementation of the respective activities.

The estimated total cost of the development plan for 2014–2020 is 42.47 million euros.

In the 2014–2017 period, the forecasted cost of the development plan is 27.86 million euros and in the 2018–2020 period, the respective cost is 14.61 million euros. The cost of the development plan for the first four years by measures has been presented in the implementation plan of the development plan and does not reflect the expenditure of activities carried out under the “Estonian Lifelong Learning Strategy 2014–2020” (including the “2014–2020 Strategy of the Language Immersion Programme”), the “Youth Field Development Plan for 2014–2020” and the “Development plan of the Estonian language 2011–2017”.

The development plan in the 2014–2017 period shall be financed within the area of government of the following ministries:

- Ministry of Culture – EUR 21,305,457
- Ministry of the Interior – EUR 4,845,715
- Ministry of Education and Research – EUR 659,550
- Ministry of Justice – EUR 1,022,087
- Ministry of Finance – EUR 30,000

In addition to the above, other ministries shall contribute additional means under the 2014–2017 area-specific development plans related to integration (outside the implementation plan of this development plan), including approximately 10.8 million euros from the Ministry of Education and Research for integration in general education and language immersion programmes, 119,600 euros for compensating language tuition costs and 2.68 million euros for improving the knowledge of the official language among adults. The activities of the youth work area have been planned as common activities without distinguishing between Estonian-speaking and Russian speaking young people. In 2014–2017, 24 million euros have been proposed for youth work activities supporting the area of integration. The cost of activities supporting the objectives of the area of integration, including measures within the development plan within the scope of the Ministry of Education and Research in 2014–2017 is a total of EUR 38,259,150. There is no opportunity of forecasting the total sum of budgetary means in the labour market field for the whole time period planned for offering labour
market services for non-Estonian speaking unemployed persons, because the target group may, at the same time, belong to several risk groups.

The resources for the presented implementation plan within the area of government of the Ministry of Culture are planned based on the 2014 state budget and the 2014–2017 state budget strategy. Expenditure related to the preparing, producing and screening of the Estonian Public Broadcasting Russian television programme shall be presented during the planning of the state budget strategy. The forecasts of the expenditure of other ministries shall be added during the coordination of the development plan. Expenditure planned for activities are based on the 2014 budgets of respective ministries and on the approved principles for following state budget strategies (2014–2017).
Annex 1. Main terms and definitions used in the development plan

**Ethnic minority** – a group within a society with a cultural background different from the ethnic majority.\(^{49}\)

**Civil identity** – an individual’s feeling of affiliation towards the state, which, in addition to formal citizenship, is also based on sensing and appreciating common values, norms and attitudes, shared feeling of cohesion and participating in a political community, which forms the basis for citizenship.

**Adaptation** – a process during which new arrivals having (re)settled in a country adapt to their new environment and society. The process is characterised by acquiring knowledge and skills, helping to function in the new environment in terms of everyday life (finding a residence, places in schools and kindergartens, taxes, healthcare and social services, language learning opportunities, etc.), in the state sphere (organisation of society, legislation, the operations concept of the state, the rights and obligations of citizens of another country, issues relating to residence permits and right of residence) as well as the behavioural sphere (first impression of the fundamental values of the receiving society, cultural traditions, basic level language learning, etc.).

**Third country nationals** – persons who are not citizens of the European Union, a member state of the European Economic Area (Norway, Iceland, and Liechtenstein) or the Confederation of Switzerland.

**Integration** – the process of a multilateral social cohesion in society between people with different linguistic and cultural backgrounds. The process of integration is characterised by the acquisition of knowledge, skills and values, contributing to the development of society through practical cooperation and mutual openness. As a result of integration, the socioeconomic inequality resulting from cultural, linguistic, religious and ethnicity shall decrease and participating in the society and the accumulating social capital will allow the society to develop uniformly.

**Person with undetermined citizenship** – a person or descendant thereof who has remained without a citizenship after the country of nationality of the person has ceased to exist, but who has not realised their right to obtain the citizenship of a successor country.

**Permanent resident** – a person legally residing in Estonia, having resided in the country for more than five years.

**Beneficiary of international protection** – a foreign national designated as a refugee, person enjoying subsidiary or temporary protection having been granted a residence permit in Estonia.

**National identity** – shared feeling of affiliation of members of society towards the state. A common national identity is based on shared values, symbols and practices and ensures the feeling of belonging and security in society. A common national identity as the “us” feeling of Estonian residents ensures the opportunity of participating in the social and political life of Estonia to all members of society and is based on recognising and valuing liberal democratic norms, values and procedures.

\(^{49}\)According to the Population and Housing Census 2011, the largest national minorities in Estonia are Russians, Ukrainians, Belarusians and Fins.
Social cohesion – the capability of society to ensure the well-being of all its members, decrease differences and reduce marginalisation (European Committee for Social Cohesion of the Council of Europe).

New arrival – a foreign national having legally immigrated to Estonia who has lived in Estonia less than five years. Reasons for immigration vary and cover all grounds for issuing residence permits established in the Aliens Act of Estonia, grounds for obtaining and issuing rights for residence established in the Citizen of the European Union Act and the grounds for issuing residence permits established in the Act on Granting International Protection to Aliens.

National minority – a historic ethnic group with an ethnic self-identification, language, religion or cultural characteristics different from the dominant ethnic group. A minority is considered the following: Estonian citizens who live in the territory of Estonia, have long-term, certain and lasting ties with Estonia; differ from Estonians by their ethnic origin, cultural characteristics, religion or language; are driven by their joint desire to conserve their cultural traditions, religion or language, serving as a basis for their common identity.

A permanent resident with a foreign background – a person legally residing in Estonia, a foreign national or the descendant thereof having immigrated into Estonia, who has lived in the state for more than five years.
Annex 2. Individuals involved in the preparation of “Integrating Estonia 2020”

Karin Andre (Estonian Unemployment Insurance Fund), Kristi Aruküla (BDA Consulting OÜ), Nele Gerberson (Ministry of Social Affairs), Nele Hollo (Ministry of Foreign Affairs), Kai Härmand (Ministry of Justice), Pavel Ivanov (Ministry of the Environment), Martin Jaško (Peegel ja Partnerid OÜ), Kärt Juhasoo-Lawrence (Ministry of Foreign Affairs), Katrin Juurvee (Ministry of Culture), Ivo Juurvee (Government Office), Kärt Kivirüüt (Ministry of Education and Research), Irene Käosaar (Ministry of Education and Research), Irina Külmoja (University of Tartu), Siiri Leskov (Ministry of the Interior), Birgit Lüüs (Ministry of the Interior), Kaur Kaasik-Aaslav (Ministry of the Interior), Tiina Kalve (Ministry of Foreign Affairs), Liina Kanter (Ministry of Social Affairs), Urve Kask (Statistics Estonia), Jaanus Kirikmäe (Ministry of Foreign Affairs), Juhan Kivirähk (International Centre for Defence and Security), Mari Klein (Integratsioon.ee), Natalja Kitam (Etnoweb.ee), Kutt Koppel (Statistics Estonia), Maarja Kuldjärv (Ministry of Social Affairs, retired), Piret Kärtner (Ministry of Education and Research), Marten Lauri (Ministry of the Interior), Patrik Maldre (Ministry of Foreign Affairs), Aurika Meimre (Tallinn University), Koidu Mesilane (Police and Border Guard Board), Tatjana Muravjova (Integration and Migration Foundation Our People), Tanel Mätlik (OÜ Gravitas Consult), Eduard Odinet (Ministry of Culture), Lea Orro (Foundation Innove), Helena Pall (Ministry of Social Affairs), Piret Potisepp (Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications), Silver Pramann (Tallinn University), Allan Puur (Tallinn University), Triin Raag (Ministry of Social Affairs), Liis Reiter (Ministry of Social Affairs), Ringo Ringvee (Ministry of the Interior), Signe Saar (The Institute of the Estonian Language), Jako Salla (Ministry of Justice), Raija Sannik (Integration and Migration Foundation Our People), Anne-Ly Reima (Ministry of Culture), Liana Roosmaa (Ministry of Culture, retired; Ministry of the Interior), Tiina Runthal (Riigikogu), Keiu Rõsa (Ernst & Young), Monika Schmeiman (Government Office), Maie Soll (European School Munich), Tiina Soon (Institute of the Estonian Language), Mihkel Susi (Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications), Mari-Liis Sööt (Ministry of Justice), Olga Žurjari (interpreter), Jevgeni Žurjari-Ossipov (Ministry of Culture, retired), Artjom Tepljuk (Ministry of Culture, retired), Sirli Tooming (Ministry of Culture), Kert Valdaru (Estonian Academy of Security Sciences), Jüri Valge (Ministry of Education and Research), Tea Vassiljeva (Statistics Estonia), Raivo Vetik (Tallinn University), Triin Võihlemm (University of Tartu), Andres Ääremaa (Foundation Innove), Kristina Kallas (Institute of Baltic Studies), Maiu Uus (Praxis).

Heads of expert working groups
1. Margarita Kazjulja – Employment
2. Nadežda Tšerašina – Education
3. Sergei Drõgin – Youth
4. Tatjana Kiilo – Estonian language learning
5. Marianna Drozdova – Participation and involvement
6. Igor Kopõtin – (a common) Estonian national identity
7. Marianne Meiorg, Maaris Raudsepp – Tolerance in society
8. Aune Valk – A culturally diverse Estonia
9. Margarita Tšernjajeva – Media and infosphere
10. Brigitta Davidjants – Target groups and stakeholders
11. Rivo Noorkõiv – Ida-Virumaa and regional differences
12. Jekaterina Gvirdžišvili – Cross-sectoral cooperation
13. Kristina Kallas – Research in the field of integration and measurement
14. Ülle Leis – Terms and definitions
15. Aleksandr Aidarov – The culture and identity of national minorities
Annex 3. The composition, tasks and competence of the steering committee and steering group of the development

Steering committee of the development plan

The steering committee shall be formed after the confirmation of the area-specific development plan under the order of the Government of the Republic for orienting the implementation of the development plan, monitoring the implementation and correcting the development plan when needed.

The activities of the steering committee are managed by the Minister of Culture. The members of the steering committee are representatives of ministries, Integration and Migration Foundation Our People and stakeholders of the area-specific development plan responsible for the implementation of measures and important related strategies.

Proposals for amending or completing the composition of the steering committee shall be made by the Minister of Culture. One member from each institution shall be appointed to the steering committee, having the powers to make decisions in the steering committee in the name of the respective organisation. The representatives of stakeholders of the area-specific development plan shall be designated to the steering group by consultations with stakeholders and ministries responsible for implementing the measures of the development plan.

Steering committee:
- endorses the performance report prepared by the steering group on the results of implementing the integration plan, presented by the Minister of Culture to the Government of the Republic once a year;
- makes proposals, when necessary, through the Minister of Culture to the Government of the Republic for amending the “Integrating Estonia 2020” and its implementation plan;
- initiates, when necessary, the preparing of the area-specific development plan for the next period under the leadership of the 2019 Minister of Culture, building on the results of the intermediary evaluation of “Integrating Estonia 2020” and confirms the final document of the integration plan developed by the steering group for the next period before presenting it for public coordination and to the Government of the Republic.

For fulfilling the abovementioned tasks, the steering committee has the right to:
- receive a performance report, including an effectiveness analysis from all responsible authorities by 15 January at the latest;
- receive proposals for amendments to the implementation plan from all responsible authorities by 31 January at the latest;
- obtain necessary documents and relevant written or oral information from national and local government authorities;
- include representatives of state and local governments as well as non-governmental organisations, experts of the respective field, foreign experts and other related persons in solving issues discussed in the steering committee;
- form working groups and expert committees.\textsuperscript{50}

Members of the steering committee:

- Minister of Culture;
- Deputy Secretary General for the Cultural Diversity Department of the Ministry of Culture;
- Deputy Secretary General for General and Vocational Education of the Ministry of Education and Research;
- Deputy Secretary General for Social Affairs;
- Deputy Secretary General for Fiscal Policy of the Ministry of Finance;
- Undersecretary for the Ministry of Foreign Affairs;
- Head of the Department for Citizenship and Migration Policy of the Ministry of the Interior;
- Deputy Secretary General for Justice Policies of the Ministry of Justice;
- Deputy Secretary General for Economic Development of the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications;
- Adviser for the Government Office Strategy Unit;
- Director for Integration and Migration Foundation Our People.

**Steering group of the development plan**

The central directing body in the process of preparing the development plan is the steering group of the development plan, consisting of eight representatives from ministries, Government Office and relevant bodies as well as from representatives of stakeholders whose representatives are designated to the steering group by consultations. The steering group launched by the Minister of Culture represents the main ministries and government authorities responsible for achieving the development plan and development plans contributing to the achieving of the objectives thereof.

The work of the steering group is managed by an official designated by the Minister of Culture. An official from the responsible ministry designated to the steering group is responsible for the internal coordination procedure of the ministry and for materials necessary for decision-making and preparation of positions.

The steering group:

- regularly collects information on the implementation plan of the integration strategy as well as on the implementation of related strategies and regularly analyses the development of integration and the processes thereof, and prepares a performance report on the previous year of activity building on the aforementioned information, presenting it to the steering committee by 1 March at the latest.
- organises discussions within their organisation on the implementation of the development plan and relating strategies as well as on the integration activities included in organisation-based development plans;
- prepares materials for the steering committee for making decisions;
- prepares a new area-specific development plan initiated according to the proposal of the steering committee and coordinates the general implementation and plan thereof;

\textsuperscript{50}In addition, an expert committee is planned to be formed, consisting of representatives of the target groups of the development plan and area experts, aiming at obtaining feedback on the effectiveness of planned and completed measures.
- shares information to parties implementing and benefitting from the development plan and to the public.

Institutions and organisations represented in the steering group:

- Ministry of Culture Cultural Diversity Department;
- Ministry of the Interior Department of Citizenship and Migration Policy, Regional Administration Department, Religious Affairs Department;
- Ministry of Education and Research General Education Department, Language Policy Department;
- Ministry of Social Affairs Labour Market Department, Department of Social Welfare;
- Ministry of Finance State Budget Department;
- Ministry of Foreign Affairs Public Diplomacy Department;
- Ministry of Justice Analysis Unit;
- Economic Development Department of the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications;
- Government Office Strategy Unit;
- Integration and Migration Foundation Our People;
- Foundation Innove;
- Association of Estonian Cities;
- Association of Municipalities of Estonia;
- Network of Estonian Nonprofit Organizations;
- Estonian Public Broadcasting;
- Ida-Virumaa Integration Centre;
- Estonian Folk Culture Centre.
Annex 4. References


10. A Study of Social Groups in Integration. Institute of International and Social Studies of Tallinn University. Tallinn, 201357.


13. The Migrant Integration Policy Index (MIPEX)60.


51 http://www.kogu.ee/public/Eesti_Inimvara_Raport_IVAR.pdf
54 http://www.praxis.ee/fileadmin/tarmo/Projektid/Valitsemine ja kodanike%C3%BChiskond/MISA_raport_EST_pdf
55 http://www.stat.ee/31389
56 http://www.kul.ee/index.php?path=0x2x1424x1931
58 http://dspace.utlib.ee/dspace/handle/10062/40681
59 http://www.stat.ee/rei2011
60 http://www.mipex.eu/estonia


17. Russophone civic associations and Estonian civil society: parallel worlds or silent integration? Institute of International and Social Studies of Tallinn University. Tallinn, 2010\(^62\).

18. Promotion of equal treatment and awareness in Estonia Institute of Baltic Studies. Tartu, 2013\(^63\).

**Reference materials for drawing up the development plan\(^64\)**


3. Overview of terms used in the field of integration. Institute of Baltic Studies, 2013.


\(^63\) [http://www.ibs.ee/et/publikatsioonid/item/download/108_a44a00dcdde546a9aab5805bd5569bdf](http://www.ibs.ee/et/publikatsioonid/item/download/108_a44a00dcdde546a9aab5805bd5569bdf)

\(^64\) Materials available at [www.integratsioon.ee](http://www.integratsioon.ee)