Approved by the Government of Estonia
on March 14, 2000

STATE PROGRAMME
“Integration in Estonian Society 2000-2007”

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.	INTRODUCTION	4
2.	BACKGROUND	8
3.	MAIN AIMS	17
4.	STRUCTURE OF PROGRAMME	24
5.	INSTITUTIONS RESPONSIBLE. MANAGEMENT OF PROGRAMME	27
6.	SUB-PROGRAMMES. CORRESPONDING OBJECTIVES, TASKS AND ACTIVITIES	
6.1	Sub-programme “Education”	29
	Objective A: Elementary school graduates will be socially competent and possess medium-level knowledge of the Estonian language	33
	Objective B: Adolescents who have acquired a secondary-school education possess knowledge of the Estonian language to an extent sufficient for everyday and occupational communication and are able to study in the Estonian language	45
6.2.	Sub-programme “The education and culture of ethnic minorities”	51
6.3.	Sub-programme “The teaching of the Estonian language to adults"	60
6.4.	Sub-programme “Social competence”	68
	Objective A: Inhabitants of Estonia actively participate in the development of the civil society regardless of their nationality and mother tongue	69
	Objective B: The attitudes of Estonians and non-Estonians contribute to the achievement of the main aims of the state programme	72

Objective C: Improvement of the situation of groups of the population with serious social special needs 82

7. ASSESSMENT OF EFFECTIVENESS AND SUCCESS OF PROGRAMME. REPORTING 84

8. CAPACITY-BUILDING OF INSTITUTIONS 86

9. APPENDICES:

APPENDIX 1 Target groups of sub-programmes

APPENDIX 2 Schedule for financing of sub-programmes in 2000 with existing funds

APPENDIX 3 Schedule for compilation of detailed action plans for sub-programmes

APPENDIX 4 Materials referring to the need for the programme

APPENDIX 5 Management of state programme

1. INTRODUCTION

Need for a state programme

The need for the implementation of the state programme "Integration in Estonian Society 2000-2007" is defined in the document *The bases of the Estonian state integration policy for the integration of non-Estonians into Estonian society* passed by the *Riigikogu* [Estonian parliament] on 10.06.1998:

The changed internal and external situation requires that Estonia's integration policy take a new step forward. This step must be based on internationally recognised standards and Estonia's constitutional principles, on our current national and social interests, and on the goal of ensuring rapid modernisation of society in the context of accession to the European Union, all while preserving both stability and a commitment to the protection and continued development of Estonian culture.

Participants in development of state programme

Pursuant to the document passed by the Government on 02.03.99 entitled "The Integration of Non-Estonians into Estonian Society: the Government's Action Plan", in 1999 the development of the state programme examining the integration under way in Estonian society took place for the years 2000-2007.

In accordance with the action plan of the Government, the institution responsible for the development of the state programme was the Integration Foundation (founded by the Government on 31.03.1998). In order to improve the performance of the tasks assigned to the Integration Foundation, the existing *Expert committee dealing with questions of demography and the integration of ethnic minorities into Estonian society* was reorganised in June 1999 into the *Expert committee dealing with questions of the integration of ethnic minorities into Estonian society*, the new membership and name of which were approved by the Government on 08.07.1999.

The expert committee that prepared and examined working versions of the state programme included Minister Katrin Saks (Chairman of the Committee), Minister Tõnis Lukas, Members of the *Riigikogu* Marju Lauristin, Vladimir Velman, Mart Meri, Mihhail Stalnuhhin, Kristiina Ojuland, Sergei Ivanov and Peeter Olesk, Governor of Ida-Viru County Rein Aidma, Andra Veidemann, Gea Rennel, Jelena Jedomskihh, Jana Krimpe, Marje Pavelson, Rein Taagepera, Pavel Ivanov, Raivo Vetik, Hagi Šein, Mart Rannut, Mati Heidmets, Sergei Tšernov and Kaja Kuivjõgi. A working group with the following membership operated under the ægis of the committee: Mart Rannut, Tanel Mätlik, Kai Võlli and Estel Aare. The working group gathered information and recommendations for the working versions of the state programme from ministries and their

subagencies, county governments, institutions of higher learning, research institutions and other agencies and organisations. Representatives of the Estonian Federation of Associations of Ethnic Cultural Societies "Lüüra", the Association of Estonian National Minorities and the Integration Foundation participated as guests in the working meetings of the committee. The President's Round Table, the Estonian Federation of Associations of Ethnic Cultural Societies "Lüüra", the Association of Estonian National Minorities, the Round Table of Ethnic Cultural Societies of Ida-Viru County, third-sector organisations, several international organisations, etc. submitted recommendations to the expert committee regarding the working versions of the state programme.

Main aims and objectives of state programme

In the state programme Estonia is treated as a society in which in addition to the common traits linking people there is also linguistic and cultural diversity. Thus one can speak of integration taking place within Estonian society, in which the source of stability and connectedness is the recognition of the common and different features of all members of society.

In other words, integration in Estonian society means on the one hand *the harmonisation of society* – the creation and promotion of that which unites all members of society – and on the other hand *the opportunity to preserve ethnic differences* – the offering to ethnic minorities of opportunities for the preservation of their cultural and ethnic distinctiveness. What is of significance here is that integration is a clearly bilateral process - *both Estonians and non-Estonians participate equally in the harmonisation of society*.

The outlet of the integration process supported through the state programme is the Estonian model of a multicultural society, which is characterised by *the principles of cultural pluralism, a strong common core* and *the preservation and development of the Estonian cultural domain*.

The common core connecting members of society consists of general human and democratic values, a common sphere of information and Estonian-language environment, as well as common state institutions and values based on the knowledge of Estonian history and awareness of the nature of Estonian citizenship and the multicultural nature of Estonian society.

Languages, ethnic traditions, religious beliefs, family traditions and personal lifestyles *are not necessarily* common to all members of society, as they belong to the area of the private interests of each individual, where opportunities for their advancement are to be found.

The social process supported by the state programme is described in greater detail through the following main areas and aims, and in their commonality and mutual interaction:

Linguistic-communicative integration, i.e. the re-creation of a common sphere of information and Estonian-language environment in Estonian society under conditions of cultural diversity and mutual tolerance.
Legal-political integration, i.e. the formation of a population loyal to the Estonian State and the reduction of the number of persons lacking Estonian citizenship.
Socio-economic integration, i.e. the achievement of greater competitiveness and social mobility in society regardless of ethnic or linguistic attributes.

The main emphasis of the state programme is on the promotion of linguistic-communicative integration in society, while at the same time the achievement of legal-political and socio-economic aims is also considered important for the successful execution of integration. While the state programme does not directly deal with legislation, it is very significant that the legislative and normative acts passed in the Republic of Estonia contribute to the achievement of the main aims of the state programme – so that corresponding legislation develops in conjunction with the evolution of a multicultural society arising with the support of the state programme. It is also important to connect the activities of the state programme with other similar socio-economic and regional development plans.

Sub-programmes and objectives
On the basis of the principles mentioned above, 4 sub-programmes are defined in the state programme, to which the following objectives correspond:

Sub-programme "Education" – pursuant to objectives A: "Elementary school graduates will be socially competent and possess medium-level knowledge of the Estonian language" and B: "Adolescents who have acquired a secondary-school education possess knowledge of the Estonian language to an extent sufficient for everyday and occupational communication and are able to study in the Estonian language".
Sub-programme "The education and culture of ethnic minorities" – "Ethnic minorities possess opportunities to acquire education in their mother tongue and preserve their culture"
Sub-programme “The teaching of Estonian to adults" – pursuant to the objective "Opportunities have been created for adult non-Estonians to improve their knowledge of Estonian and raise their socio-cultural competence"

Sub-programme "Social competence" – pursuant to the objective "the Estonian population is socially competent", which is divided into objectives A: "Inhabitants of Estonia actively participate in the development of the civil society regardless of their nationality and mother tongue", B: "The attitudes of Estonians and non-Estonians contribute to the achievement of the main aims of the state programme" and C: "Improvement of the situation of groups of the population with serious social special needs".

The implementation of the state programme shall take place with the close co-operation of government agencies, country governments, local governments, scientific institutions, universities and third-sector organisations. The state programme shall be financed with both state budget funds and foreign assistance.
In addition, the approved use of state programme resources and other funds, including those allocated by local governments, is planned.

2. BACKGROUND

Legislative background

The supportive role of legislative and normative acts in sub-programmes

A general goal in all of the sub-programmes is that legislative and normative acts passed in the Republic of Estonia promote the achievement of the main aims of the state programme

It is of great importance that legislative and normative acts passed in the Republic of Estonia promote the achievement of the main aims of the state programme.
By its nature, development activity in the area of legislative and normative acts supports the objectives, and such activities proceed from the needs and results of the sub-programmes.

International agreements and other legal acts to which the Republic of Estonia has acceded

The Republic of Estonia is a contracting party to the following principal Council of Europe international human rights agreements[1]:

1. European Cultural Convention. Paris, 19.12.1954. Entered into force in Estonia on 7 May 1992.
2. Statute of the Council of Europe. London, 05.05.1949. Entered into force in Estonia on 14 May 1993.
3. Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms. Rome, 04.11.1950. Entered into force in Estonia on 16 April 1996.
   - Protocol to the Council of Europe Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms. Paris, 20.03.1952. Entered into force in Estonia with the Convention.
   - Protocol No. 2, conferring upon the European Court of Human Rights Competence to Give Advisory Opinions. Strasbourg, 6.05.1963. Entered into force in Estonia with the Convention.
   - Protocol No. 3 to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms. Entered into force in Estonia with the Convention.
   - Protocol No. 4 to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms other than those included in

[1] Pursuant to the overview *Inimõigused Eestis [Human Rights in Estonia]*. United Nations Development Programme. Tallinn, 1998.

the Convention and in Protocol No. 1. Strasbourg, 16.09.1963. Entered into force in Estonia with the Convention.

- Protocol No. 5 to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms. Entered into force in Estonia with the Convention.
- Protocol No. 6 Concerning the Abolition of the Death Penalty. Strasbourg, 28.04.1983. Entered into force in Estonia on 10 April 1998.
- Protocol No. 7 to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms. Strasbourg, 22.11.1984. Entered into force in Estonia together with the Convention.
- Protocol No. 8 to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms. Entered into force in Estonia together with the Convention.
- Protocol No. 9 to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms. Rome, 6.11.1990. Entered into force in Estonia together with the Convention.
- Protocol No. 10 to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms. Strasbourg, 25.03.1992. Entered into force in Estonia together with the Convention.
- Protocol No. 11 Restructuring the Control Machinery Established thereby. Strasbourg, 11.05.1994. Entered into force in Estonia on 1 November 1998.

4. European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment. Entered into force in Estonia on 1 March 1997.
   - Protocol No. 1 to the European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment. Strasbourg, 4.11.1993.
   - Protocol No. 2 to the European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment. Strasbourg, 4.11.1993.
5. Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities. Strasbourg, 5.11.1992. Entered into force in Estonia on 1 February 1998.

The Republic of Estonia has joined the following UN human rights conventions[2]:

[2] Pursuant to the overview *Inimõigused Eestis [Human Rights in Estonia]*. United Nations Development Programme. Tallinn, 1998.

1. Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide. 09.12.1948. Entered into force in Estonia on 19 January 1992.
2. International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination. 21.12.1965. Entered into force in Estonia on 20 November 1991.
3. International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. 16.12.1966. Entered into force in Estonia on 21 January 1992.
4. International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. 16.12.1966. Entered into force in Estonia on 21 January 1992.
5. Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 16.12.1966. Entered into force in Estonia on 21 January 1992.
6. Convention on the Non-applicability of Statutory Limitations to War Crimes and Crimes against Humanity. 26.11.1968. Entered into force in Estonia on 19 January 1992.
7. International Convention on the Suppression and Punishment of the Crime of Apartheid. 30.11.1973. Entered into force in Estonia on 20 November 1991.
8. Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women. 18.12.1979. Entered into force in Estonia on 20 November 1991.
9. Convention against Torture and Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment. 10.12.1984. Entered into force in Estonia on 20 November 1991.
10. International Convention against Apartheid in Sports. 10.12.1985. Entered into force in Estonia on 20 November 1991.
11. Convention on the Rights of the Child. 20.11.1989. Entered into force in Estonia on 20 November 1991.
12. Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees, 28.07.1951 and the 31 January 1967 Protocol relating to the Status of Refugees. In Estonia the convention entered into force on 9 July 1997 and the protocol on 10 April 1997.

The most important legislative and normative acts of the Republic of Estonia connected with the aims of the state programme

Constitution of the Republic of Estonia
The Constitution of the Republic of Estonia stipulates, in addition to other clauses, the principle of guaranteeing the survival of the Estonian nation and culture through the ages, at the same time protecting the human rights and freedoms of all inhabitants of Estonia, regardless of nationality, religious creed, language or citizenship.

Citizenship Act
This Act establishes the definition of the Estonian citizen (Chapter 1), the conditions for obtaining and acquiring Estonian citizenship (Chapter 2),

the conditions for the acquisition of Estonian citizenship as a minor (Chapter 3), the conditions for the restoration of Estonian citizenship (Chapter 4), the procedure for the acquisition and restoration of Estonian citizenship (Chapter 5), the conditions and procedure for the deprivation of Estonian citizenship (Chapter 6), and other conditions (Chapter 7).

Aliens Act
This Act establishes the definition of the alien (Chapter 1), the immigration quota (Chapter 2), passport requirements (Chapter 3), matters involved with visas, residence and work permits (Chapter 4), the notification of circumstances and legal responsibility (Chapter 5) and other conditions (Chapter 6).

Language Act
This Act establishes the status of Estonian as the official language (Chapter 1), the use of foreign languages in state agencies and local governments (Chapter 2), the use of languages of national minorities in national minorities' institutions of cultural self-government (Chapter 3), the use of languages in other fields (Chapter 4), questions involving names, titles and information (Chapter 5) and other conditions (Chapter 6).

The *Cultural Autonomy of National Minorities Act* establishes the definitions of national minorities and the cultural autonomy of national minorities, the rights of persons belonging to national minorities and the principal objectives of cultural self-government (Chapter 1), the ethnic registers of national minorities (Chapter 2), the administrative bodies of cultural self-government and their formation (Chapter 3), institutions of cultural self-government and the financing of their activities (Chapter 4) and the termination of the activities of institutions of cultural self-government (Chapter 5).

The development of the state programme is a continuation of the activities performed by the Estonian State up to the present time in the resolution of problems of integration:

- In 1990, the State Language Board, under the authority of the State Chancellery (later under the Ministry of Education) was created in order to guarantee language training and linguistic planning and supervision. In 1997 this agency was reorganised into the Language Inspection Board for the supervision of the performance of the Language Act.
- Since 1992, in several memberships of the Government there has been one position of minister without portfolio - the Minister for Ethnic Affairs. The following have been Ministers for Ethnic Affairs:

Klara Hallik (1992), Peeter Olesk (1993-1994), Andra Veidemann (1997-1999) and Katrin Saks (1999-). The principal tasks of the minister include ethnic affairs and the integration of ethnic minorities into Estonian society.

- Since 1993 consultations for citizenship applicants in matters concerning the Estonian language have been financed from the state budget.
- In 1993 the President of the Republic formed an advisory body, the President's Round Table, for the representation of ethnic minorities and persons without citizenship.
- In 1995 the Linguistic Affairs Committee was created in the area of government of the Minister of Education. The committee was liquidated in 1999.
- Since 1996 a working group formed by the Minister of Education with members from different academic institutions has operated with the purpose of analysing opportunities for the social and cultural integration of non-Estonians into Estonian society and the future of Russian-language education.
- In 1996 the Estonian Language Strategy Centre was formed for the development of the language training strategy for the coming 10-15 years and the co-ordination of different language projects. In February of 1997 a working group composed of experts was formed for the development of a language strategy.
- On 16.07.1997, the Government formed a 17-member expert committee for the examination of demography and the integration of ethnic minorities into Estonian society, and the making of recommendations to the Government. The main task of the committee became the development of the foundations of the state integration policy.
- On 20.01.1998 the Government approved the Ministry of Education's *Development plan for Russian-medium schools: the formation of a unified Estonian education system, action plan 1997-2007*.
- On 10.02.1998 the Government approved the draft document presented by the expert committee, entitled *The bases of the Estonian state integration policy for the integration of non-Estonians into Estonian society*. The above-mentioned document was discussed by the *Riigikogu* and passed on 10.06.1998.
- On 31.03.1998, the Government founded the Integration Foundation, the purpose of which is to initiate and support projects oriented towards integration. The council of the Integration Foundation is chaired by the Minister for Ethnic Affairs, and its members are the Ministers of Internal Affairs and of Education, several members of the *Riigikogu* and representatives of ministries, the United Nations Development Programme, Estonian institutions of higher education and the Ida-Viru County Government.

- The Government allocated 6 million EEK from the 1998 state budget for activities promoting integration.
- On 21.04.1998 the Government approved the *Language training strategy for the non-Estonian-speaking population,* which determines the main directions and objectives in the teaching of the Estonian language to non-Estonians during the coming decade.
- On 27.08.1998 representatives of the Government and of Finland, Sweden, Denmark, Norway and the United Nations Development Programme signed an agreement for the launching of the project *Support for the state project for the integration of non-Estonians into Estonian society*. The total volume of the project is 1.34 million US dollars and its duration 2.5 years.
- In September of 1998 representatives of the Government, the European Union and the United Nations Development Programme signed an agreement for the launching of the project *European Union Phare Estonian Language Training Programme*. The total volume of the project is 1.4 million Euros and its duration 2.5 years.
- The Government allocated 5.7 million EEK from the 1999 state budget for activities promoting integration.
- On 02.03.1999 the Government passed the action plan *The integration of non-Estonians into Estonian society,* which prescribed the development, in the year 1999, of a state programme in that area. According to the action plan, the Integration Foundation is responsible for the utilisation of the resources allocated from the state budget for the support of programme development and integration-related activities.
- In order to better organise the development of the state programme, the Government reorganised the existing expert committee on 08.07.1999; Minister of Ethnic Affairs Katrin Saks was appointed as the new chairperson. In 1999 the principal objective of the expert committee was the development of the draft state programme in co-operation with the Integration Foundation and the other parties.
- In 1999 a project was initiated in co-operation with CIDA and the Toronto School Board for the launching of the project *Language immersion in Estonian schools*. The total cost of the project is 3.624 million Canadian dollars over 4 years, of which the contribution of CIDA and the Toronto School Board is 1.86 million Canadian dollars, and the Estonian State's contribution is 1.764 million Canadian dollars. Finland also supports the project, providing 47 600 Canadian dollars, and the Council of Europe also provides support.

In addition to the programmatic steps of the Government and government agencies, the other parties, including the Ida-Viru County Government, the United Nations Development Programme, different

third-sector organisations and institutions of higher learning also play an important role.

Previous conceptual and strategic documents

The document *The integration of non-Estonians into Estonian society: setting the course*, compiled in 1997 on the initiative of the United Nations Development Programme, has served as the basis for both the integration-related documents passed by the Government in 1998-1999 and also for this programme. *The integration of non-Estonians into Estonian society: setting the course* examined integration, based on the attitudes of social groups and political, cultural, educational, media and economic policy and regional policy aspects in the area - the same topics that are either broadly or narrowly covered by this programme.

The document *The bases of the Estonian state integration policy for the integration of non-Estonians into Estonian society*, passed by the *Riigikogu* on 10.06.1998, was a logical sequel to the document *The integration of non-Estonians into Estonian society: setting the course*, and in concentrated form revealed the principal emphases and objectives of future state integration policy. *The bases of the Estonian state integration policy for the integration of non-Estonians into Estonian society* also serves as a basis for this state programme, which in many respects focuses on the changes made in the field of non-Estonian-language education, devoting particular attention to the target group children and youth. The second important task of the integration process is the enabling of the preservation of non-Estonians' ethnic identity; as a result the state programme also devotes special attention to non-Estonians' opportunities for acquiring education in their mother tongue and preserving their culture.
On 02.03.1999 the Government passed the action plan *The integration of non-Estonians into Estonian society*, which defined the schedule of the compilation of the state programme together with the institutions responsible. At the same time and for the first time on a state level, the nature of the Estonian multicultural society to be created as the outcome of integration was also defined in the action plan. The main aims and objectives of the state programme have been compiled on the basis of the above-mentioned conceptual documents and strategic plans. The goal has been to set tasks with clear and measurable results.

Development plans and strategies connected with the state programme

Simultaneously with the compilation of the state programme, a number of socio-economic and regional development plans and strategies are being compiled, also encompassing non-Estonians as target groups,

particularly in the Ida-Viru region. In order to avoid the potential duplication of activities, the state programme has primarily concentrated on measures in the areas of education, culture, the media and legislation. At the same time the above-mentioned areas are closely connected with the resolution of socio-economic problems in different parts of Estonia. Thus the implementation of the state programme shall take place in co-ordination with other socio-economic and regional development programmes and strategies.

In the context of accession to the European Union, the S*tate Development Plan* compiled in 1999 examines, among other things, the promotion of initial vocational education and higher vocational education, the expansion of opportunities for and the improvement of the quality of supplementary training and re-training, the guaranteeing of access to the labour market and education for persons belonging to risk groups, the creation of equal opportunities in the labour market for men and women, as well as the improvement of the support systems for employment and training. The State Development Plan forms the basis for the more detailed action plans to be implemented with financial resources from the public sector, the European Union, the Estonian State, the private sector and others.

The *main features of the Ida-Viru regional development plan for the years 1998-2003* approved by the Government on 03.11.1998 foresees the shaping of Ida-Viru County into a multicultural region with a diverse economic and social structure and well-known and successful in Estonia and Europe. The development plan focuses on three areas shaping new structures and significantly modifying the environment: transport and transit [1], education [2] and tourism and vacationing [3].

The *Ida-Viru County social plan* (compiled in 1999) focuses on the issue of employment, which has become problematic in Ida-Viru County. In this region unemployment also causes the exacerbation of many other social problems (crime, alcoholism, drug abuse, homelessness, etc.). As a result the social plan has been compiled as an initial activity guideline in the planning and implementation of specific activities in the county in the areas of both employment and regional and economic policy.

The *Estonian regional development strategy* passed by the Government on 16.11.1999 defines the foundations of state regional policy and the foundations for the channelling of the regional influence of branch policies in the period prior to accession to the European Union. The objective established in the regional development strategy is the achievement of a stable and high quality of life for the inhabitants of all regions (secure and good living conditions, income and opportunities for self-realisation), which means the balancing of the state's regional development through the strengthening and maximal utilisation of local preconditions for development, thereby assisting towards the overall macroeconomic and social development of the state. In addition to other

regions, many programmes foreseen in the strategy also include the Ida-Viru region; the main target area of the programme for industrial areas is Ida-Viru County.

6. MAIN AIMS

6.1. Why the state programme is necessary

As a result of the extensive migration that took place during the Soviet period, a community using Russian as its first language has developed in Estonia, and many of its members lack a sufficient outlet to the rest of society. Linguistic attributes also largely determine the places these people work and live, the education they receive and their social mobility. Sociological investigations undertaken from the mid-1990s suggest the formation of a "two societies in one country" model in Estonia, which may become dangerous both socially and from the point of view of security policy. It is particularly disturbing that many non-Estonian adolescents fail to find sufficient opportunities for self-realisation. At the same time growing unemployment is forming a suitable environment for the spread of crime in society.

Yet there are also positive signs. A survey carried out in January of 1999 pointed to the integration process having reached a phase of acclimatisation and tolerance.[3] Integration as a whole is directed towards the creation of a balanced and democratic multicultural society, although it is clear that this is a complicated and also contradictory process lasting decades and requiring the long-term and systematic support of the Estonian State.

3.2. The nature and main aims of integration

The *nature* of the integration of Estonian society is shaped by two processes: on the one hand the social *harmonisation* of society on the basis of knowledge of the Estonian language and the possession of Estonian citizenship, and on the other hand the *enabling of the maintenance of* ethnic *differences* on the basis of the recognition of the cultural rights of ethnic minorities. The harmonisation of society also means the integration of both Estonians and non-Estonians around a unifying common core.[4]

The enabling of the preservation of ethnic differences means the existence of conditions in society for the promotion of one's ethnic identity by interested individuals who belong to ethnic minorities.

In the case of the non-Estonian target group, integration is expressed in the gradual disappearance of those barriers which today prevent many

---

[3] See Pettai, I. and Proos, I. *Integratsioon kui kokkulepe kahe rahvusrühma vahel [Integration as an agreement between two ethnic groups].* Commentated database. Estonia Open Society Institute. Tallinn, 1999.

[4] For the definition of the strong common core, see section 3.4

non-Estonians from being competitive in the Estonian labour market, taking part in the educational opportunities available here and participating in local cultural and political life. These barriers are above all connected with shortcomings in knowledge of the Estonian language and local culture, with uncertain legal status and also with fears and prejudices resulting from rapid social changes.
In the case of the Estonian target group, integration is expressed in the retreat of repellent attitudes towards ethnic minorities in the context of the recognition of the multicultural model of society and is also expressed in the decrease in fear concerning the survival of the national identity and cultural domain.
Since integration contains elements that in certain cases may come into conflict with each other (harmonisation and the preservation of differences are conflicting processes), one must specify what variety of social harmonisation and which differences to be preserved are referred to in specific social spheres. For this purpose one must distinguish between the common features and mutual interactions in the following *main areas* of integration:

Linguistic-communicative integration, i.e. the re-creation of a common sphere of information and an Estonian-language environment in Estonian society under conditions of cultural diversity and mutual tolerance.
Legal-political integration, i.e. the formation of a population loyal to the Estonian State and the reduction of the number of persons without Estonian citizenship.
Socio-economic integration, i.e. the achievement of greater competitiveness and social mobility for every member of Estonian society regardless of ethnic or linguistic attributes.

Main aims of integration by area

The need for *linguistic-communicative integration* arises from the fact that the detachment of many non-Estonians from Estonian society is the result of their insufficient knowledge of the Estonian language. The formation of a common Estonian-language environment shall take place in parallel with the creation of favourable conditions for the promotion of the linguistic and cultural identities of ethnic minorities. The toleration and mutual recognition of differences will mould Estonia into an open multicultural society. The positive attitudes of Estonians and non-Estonians towards each other support the development of a common sphere of information and the valuing of the Estonian-language linguistic environment as an attribute of statehood. By area this presupposes the following:

(a) *education* – The Estonian education system shall become a central area of integration. Teachers shall be prepared for work

with a multilingual and multicultural student body; Estonia-based textbooks and teaching materials have been created. Adolescents who have completed elementary school will have no linguistic or cultural barriers to continuing their education or competing in the labour market. At the same time the state also supports ethnic minorities' activities in the promotion of education and culture in their native tongue and the preparation of a pedagogical cadre;

(b) *knowledge of the Estonian language* – non-Estonians' knowledge of the Estonian language shall improve considerably and Estonian will become the predominant language of social interaction. Graduates of non-Estonian elementary schools need not undergo additional examinations beyond school final examinations in order to apply for Estonian citizenship.

(c) *changes of attitudes in society* - the attitude "non-Estonians as a problem" will be replaced by the attitude "non-Estonians as development potential", "non-Estonians as participants in the strengthening of Estonia." A clear interest on the part of the State in the prospects of non-Estonians and also particularly those of the generation presently maturing in Estonia has created the necessary political atmosphere for real integration, in which on the one hand there has developed a greater readiness for participation among non-Estonians and on the other hand Estonians accept the multiculturalism of Estonian society.

The need for *legal-political integration* is based on the fact that ca 25% of the population of Estonia does not possess Estonian citizenship, and ca 17% possesses no citizenship at all. The objective of the integration process is to increase the number of persons with Estonian citizenship, the common sphere of information of Estonians and non-Estonians and the formation of a state identity based on respect for Estonia's multiculturalism. By area this presupposes the following:

(a) *citizenship* – In Estonia a situation is being created that permits all non-Estonians who desire Estonian citizenship to fulfil the requirements for its acquisition. The naturalisation process shall become more productive and effective. The political integration of non-Estonians into Estonian life is legally expressed through the possession of Estonian citizenship;

(b) *participation in political structures* – In the Estonian political landscape a similar political pluralism will develop among both Estonians and non-Estonians;

(c) *loyalty* - non-Estonians sense that they are full and equal members of Estonian society and perceive their responsibility for the welfare of the Estonian State.

The need for *socio-economic integration* is connected with the need to avoid situations in which a person's wealth or poverty and success or lack of success on the career ladder are closely linked to his ethnic background. At present many of the problems encountered by non-Estonians are the result of their poor language knowledge and the complexity of socio-economic re-organisation in Ida-Viru County. This has led to extensive unemployment and social disenchantment in that region. The foundation of successful socio-economic integration is on the one hand the improvement of language training and on the other hand the implementation of a regional policy prepared using scientific research. By area this presupposes the following:

(a) *participation in Estonian social life* – barriers restricting the competitiveness of non-Estonians in the labour market and in public life decrease. Upon the development of more favourable conditions non-Estonians participate more widely in third-sector associations, cultural work and the international exchange of ideas.

(b) *the reduction of non-Estonians' regional isolation* – the mobility within Estonia of both Estonians and non-Estonians will increase as a result of state encouragement and support.

3.3. General emphases.

- Focus on the individual

Focus on the individual means that integration into society is the result of the free choice of the individual, not a decision dictated from "above". An individual's attitudes and understandings change above all on his own initiative, and the state's task is to create conditions favouring this change.

- Orientation towards children and adolescents

The prime attention and also material resources of the state programme must first and foremost be directed towards the young (kindergartens, schools, hobby groups, youth associations, youth work agencies, summer camps, sports clubs, sports schools and nation-wide sports organisations, etc.). The aim is for the generation now growing up in Estonia to become one that considers Estonia to be its home and to become a citizenry that values it.

- Integration as a summons to development

It is important to recognise that integration does not rule out contradictions and conflicts, since the social harmonisation of society and the preservation of differences are often conflicting processes. In this sense openness and tolerance towards differences is one of the principal

challenges for Estonian society as a whole. Integration is a serious exertion for non-Estonians, since language proficiency and accompanying competitiveness do not arise from nowhere. The diffident and passive attitudes widespread among non-Estonians must be replaced by the understanding that each person's prospects for a secure future in Estonian society depend above all on his own activeness and co-operation. Integration is also unquestionably a serious challenge for Estonians, presupposing the definition of the nature of Estonia as a nation-state on a political and no longer ethnic basis.

- A feeling of security as the foundation of integration

The real breaking down of barriers and development of tolerance in society can take place only in a situation in which all parties feel confident and safe. For Estonians this means guarantees of the preservation and development of Estonianness. For non-Estonians this means the certainty that the Estonian State's policy is not oriented towards their expulsion or assimilation, also permitting linguistic and cultural diversity alongside the Estonian-language public sphere. Since the model of two separate societies objectively increases both sides' uncertainty, there is no alternative to integration.

3.4. Outcome of integration process: the Estonian multicultural society

The outcome of the integration process supported through the state programme is the Estonian model of a multicultural society, which is characterised by *the principles of cultural pluralism, a strong common core* and *the preservation and development of the Estonian cultural domain.* In the above-mentioned model one must distinguish between the individual and group levels. The direct subjects of integration are individuals. Integration on the level of the individual shapes the common core in the public sphere of society, and that common core operates on the basis of the Estonian language, common social institutions and democratic values. Integration grounded in the principle of individuality is supplemented by the recognition of the rights of ethnic groups, which are expressed in the principles of cultural pluralism and the preservation of the Estonian cultural domain.

- Cultural pluralism

Ethnic minorities living in Estonia are guaranteed opportunities for the preservation of their language and cultural distinctiveness, above all through the organisation of education and the activities of societies in their mother tongue. The concept of pluralism also encompasses the recognition of the cultural distinctiveness of minorities in Estonian society. Thus one objective of integration is the cultural acclimatisation of different ethnic groups in Estonia, *not* their assimilation into Estonian

culture. The difference between integration and linguistic and cultural assimilation lies in the fact that it presupposes two simultaneous processes: on one hand the enabling of the preservation of the linguistic and cultural distinctiveness of ethnic groups and on the other hand the gathering of those groups around a strong common core in Estonian society.

- Strong common core

A multicultural society can only function successfully when its members are linked by a sufficient common core. The common core creates a basis for mutually enriching interaction and the recognition of common interests, and helps different ethnic groups to feel secure in Estonia. The main content of the state programme is indeed to support the integration of individuals around the strong common core in Estonian society. The strong common core of Estonian society is territorially defined by Estonia and is founded on the common language – Estonian, which is the basis for the functioning of institutions of the public sphere. The integration of individuals around the strong common core in Estonian society takes place through the achievement of the aims[5] of the linguistic-communicative, legal-political and socio-economic areas of integration. On the basis of the latter, the strong common core in Estonian society consists of the following elements in the public sphere:

(1) general humanistic and democratic values;
(2) a common sphere of information and Estonian-language environment;
(3) common state institutions;
(4) knowledge of the main facts of Estonian history, the valuing of being a citizen of the Republic of Estonia and awareness of the multiculturalism of Estonian society.

The following *phenomena of the private sphere* such as the languages of ethnic minorities, ethnic traditions, religious beliefs, family traditions and personal lifestyles *are not treated* as part of the strong common core of Estonian society. The above-mentioned phenomena *are not necessarily* common to all members of society, as they belong to the area of the private interests of each individual, where opportunities for their advancement are to be found.

- Preservation and development of the Estonian cultural domain

In social dialogue all cultures functioning in Estonia are equal. In relations with the State, however, the status of Estonian culture is different to that of minority cultures, since one of the objectives of Estonian statehood is the preservation and development of the Estonian

[5] For the main aims of the state programme see section 3.2

cultural domain. Estonian society is multicultural and the task of the Estonian State is the creation of cultural development opportunities for minorities also, although for everyone Estonia is and will remain Estonia-centred in the sense of a common cultural domain.

4. STRUCTURE OF PROGRAMME

The state programme “Integration in Estonian Society 2000-2007” prescribes the main aims of integration in three areas, the:

- “Linguistic-communicative”,
- “Legal-political”, and
- “Socio-economic”.

The descriptions of the main aims are given in part 3 (*"Main Aims"*) of the state programme. Considering the duration of integration processes, the main aims of the state programme are long-term, i.e. achievable later than 2007. The objectives given in part 6 (*"Sub-programmes"*) are founded on the main aims and are short-term, i.e. achievable by 2007.

No legislative action plan is foreseen in the field of legal-political integration, since the state programme, being an executive document, is on the one hand based on the laws and other legal acts presently in effect in the Republic of Estonia, and on the other hand mainly addresses state agencies and their sub-agencies, local governments and third-sector organisations. At the same time legal and normative development activities are a very important condition for the achievement of the main aims and objectives.

The state programme does not foresee extensive tasks and methods in the area of socio-economic integration, since

(a) the volume of linguistic-communicative tasks and measures in the state programme is extensive, and the addition of socio-economic measures would render the management and implementation of the overall programme too complicated;

(b) development plans in the area of socio-economic affairs have already been prepared or are under preparation and are listed in part 2 (*"Background"*) of this programme.

The steering committee of the state programme and those responsible for sub-programmes shall co-ordinate their activities in the preparation and implementation of the state programme with those institutions responsible for the development plans and strategies listed in section 2 (*"Background"*).

The main aims of the state programme lead to objectives, which correspond to the following four sub-programmes:

Sub-programme "Education" – pursuant to objectives A: "Elementary school graduates will be socially competent and possess medium-level knowledge of the Estonian language" and B: "Adolescents who have acquired a secondary-school education possess knowledge of the Estonian language to an extent sufficient for everyday and occupational communication and are able to study in the Estonian language".

Sub-programme "The education and culture of ethnic minorities" – pursuant to the objective "Ethnic minorities possess opportunities to acquire education in their mother tongue and preserve their culture"
Sub-programme “The teaching of Estonian to adults" – pursuant to the objective "Opportunities have been created for adult non-Estonians to improve their knowledge of Estonian and raise their socio-cultural competence"
Sub-programme "Social competence” – pursuant to the objective “the Estonian population is socially competent", which is divided into objectives A: "Inhabitants of Estonia actively participate in the development of the civil society regardless of their nationality and mother tongue", B: "The attitudes of Estonians and non-Estonians contribute to the achievement of the main aims of the state programme" and C: "Improvement of the situation of groups of the population with serious social special needs".

The principal tasks of each sub-programme, the methods to be used for their implementation, results and also criteria for the assessment of their effectiveness are established in part 6 of the state programme (*"Sub-programmes"*).
The prescriptions of part 6 of the state programme (*"Sub-programmes"*) form the basis for the detailed action plan of each sub-programme, and these plans are developed by institutions responsible for each sub-programme. Detailed action plans contain elaborate plans of the measures of sub-programmes, together with a schedule for the taking of certain measures and corresponding responsible parties.
The target groups of each sub-programme are presented in *Appendix 1* and financial resources in *Appendix 2*.
The schedule for the compilation and implementation of detailed action plans for sub-programmes is provided in *Appendix 3*.

The consideration of regional distinctiveness in sub-programmes
In the preparation of the action plan of each sub-programme, the institution responsible must develop regional action plans in co-operation with county governments and local governments, based on the distinctiveness of the region, and development programmes that have been launched (e.g. Ida-Viru County).
Action plans for regions and areas will become an important part of the state programme, and activity priorities will be specified through them, and if necessary programmes will be corrected. Applications for the implementation of priorities for regions and areas shall be taken into account in the planning of financial resources. In the compilation of action plans for regions and areas, target group(s), objectives and tasks shall be elaborated on. The description of the result set as an objective shall include criteria for measuring effectiveness, important deadlines,

actors and persons responsible, but also the solution of questions of financing.

5. INSTITUTIONS RESPONSIBLE. MANAGEMENT OF PROGRAMME

Participants in state programme

The state programme "Integration in Estonian Society 2000-2007" encompasses several ministries, their subagencies, county governments, local governments, academic institutions and universities, third-sector institutions and organisations, as well as international organisations and foreign sources of financing. At the same time, the state programme is an action plan providing direction and primary guidelines mainly for state agencies and local governments, and not for third-sector institutions and organisations or international organisations. The state programme does, however, provide for state financial support for third-sector institutions and organisations and substantive support (in the form of training, etc.) for the development and implementation of third-sector action plans connected with integration.

Potential dangers that must be avoided in the management and co-ordination of the state programme:

- There is a lack of scientific management and inspection in the integration process. Thus the concept of integration may become a phrase devoid of meaning often accompanied by the infringement of its scientific foundations, the blurring of purpose and the avoidance of the measurement of effectiveness.
- Little or irregular financing and the lack of consideration of objectives or effectiveness in financing.
- A poor ability, on the part of responsible government institutions and other partners (county governments, local governments, institutions and organisations of the third sector, etc.), to act in both the preparation and implementation of individual sub-programmes and in the organisation of mutual co-operation.

Institution responsible

1. As of the approval of the state programme, the overall guarantor of the state programme is the Minister for Ethnic Affairs.
2. Each sub-programme is the responsibility of a corresponding institution, which within its competence and in the extent of the tasks assigned to it, guarantees the:
   - goal-oriented development and effective implementation of action plans of sub-programmes
   - co-ordinated activities of performers of the sub-programme
   - presentation of a report concerning the sub-programme

   The following institutions are responsible for the sub-programmes:

Sub-programme “Education” – the Ministry of Education
Sub-programme “The education and culture of ethnic minorities” – the Ministries of Culture and Education (the 2 areas of responsibility in the sub-programme are divided on the basis of an agreement).
Sub-programme “The teaching of the Estonian language to adults" – the Ministry of Education, Ministry of Social Affairs and the Integration Foundation (the 3 areas of responsibility in the sub-programme are divided on the basis of an agreement)
Sub-programme “Social competence” – the Ministries of Education, Social Affairs, Internal Affairs and Culture (the 4 areas of responsibility in the sub-programme are divided on the basis of an agreement).

3. Following the approval of the state programme by the Government, a steering committee shall be formed to direct and organise feedback on the implementation of the state programme and make corrections to the state programme as required. The membership of the steering committee shall consist of representatives of the institutions responsible for sub-programmes. Decisions of the steering committee concerning the implementation and correction of sub-programmes shall be prepared by institutions responsible for those sub-programmes, and if necessary expert groups shall be formed for that purpose.
4. For the more effective organisation of the activities of the steering committee, the Integration Foundation shall, in addition to being the performer of several state programmes:
   - fulfil the tasks of a secretariat for the preparation and administration of meetings of the steering committee;
   - bear responsibility for everyday practical co-ordination work between the four sub-programmes and for reporting;
   - create an expert commission, the goal of which is to secure feedback between programme management and the integration processes taking place in real life, and which include members of groups performing general monitoring and media monitoring of integration and representatives of scientific institutions performing integration-related research.

6. SUB-PROGRAMMES. OBJECTIVES, TASKS AND ACTIVITIES

6.1. Sub-programme "Education"

Integration is a process spanning many generations, the effectiveness of which depends to a significant extent on the generation of non-Estonians presently growing up in Estonia. The development of the young generation of non-Estonians into one actively speaking Estonian and loyal to Estonia yet as a part of society preserving its national culture is an important resource in economics and politics, but also in the expansion of the Estonian cultural domain and the increasing of the diversity of the culture. The ability and opportunities for non-Estonians to participate in the common cultural domain will be shaped above all by education and the media.

It is in school that children acquire knowledge of how to live and survive in Estonian society. Language skills and background knowledge are acquired in school. Communication between different nationalities shapes interests and attitudes. The official language as the first language in society is the language of civil culture. The path of educational development containing the integration dominant presupposes clarity concerning the future of Russian and non-Estonian-speaking schools and the development of civics, following principles of a multicultural and democratic society. The aim of the Estonian school is to make the development objectives and cultural environment of society understandable to pupils of all nationalities, broaden individuals' understanding of other cultures and find and expand the forms and means for interaction between different ethnic groups.

The graduate of a non-Estonian-language elementary school is socially competent and possesses an medium-level knowledge of Estonian and can continue his studies at vocational institutions or gymnasia in which the majority of teaching takes place in the Estonian language. In elementary school the language of instruction may be Estonian or another language, but as of the next level of school education the language of instruction of municipal, state and public educational institutions is Estonian. Those who possess insufficient knowledge of the Estonian language will be provided with additional language training either prior to instruction or at the same time. The increase in the volume of instruction in the Estonian language will not lead to the closing of schools whose language of instruction is Russian, and this will mean changes in educational structure and the retraining of teachers. The younger generation of non-Estonians who have received a secondary and higher education in the Estonian language will become partners in the dialogues taking place in Estonian cultural life, politics and the economy.

Legislation

Education-related legislation establishes that the state's aim is the unity of the education system in the interests of the survival of the Estonian nation, culture and state, and that tolerance and respect for people and language, as well as knowledge of Estonian, are considered important. In its educational structure, the Estonian State takes into consideration that the number of Estonian-speakers in the world is small and that the Republic of Estonia is the only state in which this language is the official language.

The Language Act sets state institutions and local governments the task of guaranteeing opportunities for the acquisition of Estonian-language education as well as the acquisition of an education in a foreign language in accordance with the procedures established by law. The Pre-school Children's Institutions Act and the Basic and Upper Secondary Schools Act prescribe that teaching and educational activities shall take place in the Estonian language or in another language by decision of a local government. In both pre-school children's institutions and in schools a certain amount of Estonian-language training is established in the compulsory framework curriculum. The meaning of that which is one's own and distinctive, and tolerance for that which is different, are ideas emphasised in the principles of the state programme for Estonian elementary and general secondary education. The principles of the curriculum draw attention to differences, which are not avoided, and it is upon the dialogue between these that integration in education can be constructed. The language of instruction of vocational institutions, higher vocational institutions and universities is Estonian. The use of other languages shall be decided by the Minister of Education, and at universities by the council of the university.

The curricula of children's institutions and schools are formed on the basis of the state curriculum. This presupposes an agreement between local government and governing bodies and teachers regarding the development directions and distinctiveness of the institution, taking into consideration regional needs, the wishes of parents and children and intellectual and material resources. Support for children's national identity shall be given increased importance in the objectives of the school curriculum.

Estonian language training and civics

In addition to language skills, matters connected with Estonian culture and the building of Estonian society are emphasised in the Estonian as a second language syllabus - the student becomes acquainted with, learns to understand and appreciate the lasting values of Estonian culture, the most important historical facts, the people's customs and traditions; the student is to develop an interest in contemporary social and cultural life,

thereby enriching his intellectual and emotional world. The teaching of the Estonian language begins from kindergarten.
Civics begins in primary education with the implementation of the principle of social studies, from which separate subject courses are reached by the end of the first stage of elementary school. In parallel with the subject courses, important subjects are planned as subjects pervading the school curriculum, in order to guarantee the comprehensive school's task of *helping to develop individuals who can manage in life and work, develop themselves and assist in the development of society, define themselves as a member of society, as a citizen and as one bearing collective responsibility for the future of Europe and the world*. The principal tasks of civics are concentrated in the elementary school, and knowledge and skills necessary for the development of social competence are acquired on all levels of education, as well as in everyday life.

In the general provisions of the Education Act of the Republic of Estonia, *general human and national values* are named as the sources of the foundations of education, and in the definition of the objective of education it is the creation of favourable conditions for the development of the Estonian nation and ethnic minorities in the context of the global economy and world culture that is considered to be of importance.
The meaning of that which is one's own and distinctive, and tolerance for that which is different, is emphasised in the principles of the state programme for Estonian elementary and general secondary education. and this is also connected with the consideration of students of other nationalities. The value of that which is one's own and distinctive unfolds in collective activities, in searching for what is held in common and in mutual enrichment. Integration takes place within processes.
The school forms its own curriculum on the basis of the state curriculum. This presupposes teachers' agreement as to the school's developmental directions and distinctiveness, taking into consideration regional needs, the wishes of parents and children and intellectual and material resources. In non-Estonian schools the school curriculum has an additional role - to assist in the preservation of the cultural traditions of students' countries of origin and to support their sense of national identity.
The status of teacher of the official language was introduced with Order of the Government No. 464-k of 11 June 1997 entitled "The approval of the principal objectives of the activities of the Government for the years 1997 and 1998" The establishment of this status provides the possibility to support those qualified educators who are prepared to expand their activities to schools in which the language of instruction is Russian (hereinafter "Russian-medium schools") : to advise and guide other teachers and school directors, to organise and carry out supplementary

training within their competence and in accordance with the supplementary training needs of the particular region.

Development plan for Russian-medium schools

The development plan for Russian-medium schools forms the basis of regional development plans and prioritises the tasks of the Ministry of Education, in order to achieve the harmonisation of the Estonian education system in all schools in which Russian or another language is the language of instruction. The development plan has helped to improve planning and co-ordination of the use of state budget, local budget and foreign assistance funds on the level of general education, vocational education and higher education. The tasks established in the development plan have been further developed in this programme.

Objective A: Elementary school graduates will be socially competent and possess medium-level knowledge of the Estonian language

6.1.1.1. Description of situation

Development trends of Russian-medium schools

Significant changes have taken place in Russian-medium schools since the passing of the Republic of Estonia Education Act (1992): Estonian programmes/syllabuses are being applied, more than half of the textbooks in use are published in Estonia, the gymnasium level has been extended from two years to three and the teaching of Estonian has been implemented in all schools. The number of schools with two languages of instruction (mixed schools) has decreased.

The transition to the state curriculum of grades 1, 4, 7 and 10 in Russian-medium schools was begun from the autumn of 1998. The increased effectiveness of the teaching of Estonian permits the transition in the gymnasium grades to the Estonian language in the teaching of most subjects. The direction and volume of Russian-language teaching shall be established in the school curriculum, taking into consideration the volume of teaching in a language other than the language of instruction prescribed by law.

Legislation

The status of teacher of the official language was introduced with Order of the Government No. 464-k of 11 June 1997 entitled "The approval of the principal objectives of the activities of the Government for the years 1997 and 1998" The establishment of this status makes it possible to improve the effectiveness of the teaching of Estonian as a second language. Qualified educators who are prepared to expand their activities in Russian-medium schools shall be employed as counsellors and guides for other teachers and school directors, and will organise supplementary training within their competence.

On the proportion of pupils

Since the 1992/93 school year, the proportion of pupils studying at Russian-medium schools has decreased year by year. This is connected with the decrease in the number of Russian-speaking children (due initially to emigration, but in more recent years to a low birth-rate), the rise in the importance of Ukrainian, Byelorussian and other ethnic languages, as a result of which the role of Russian is decreasing even as a home language. Thus in the autumn of 1999 children entering grade one in Russian-medium schools represented a little over 20% of the total number of children entering grade one (40.6% in the autumn of 1990). The proportion for all grades was 28% (36.8% in the autumn of 1990).

The number of pupils attending pre-school children's institutions in which the language of instruction is Russian has decreased in the past three years, whereas the number of pupils attending kindergartens with two languages of study (Estonian and Russian) has increased. The number of children's institutions has remained stable. 53 386 children attended kindergartens in 1997 (15 621 of these in Russian-language groups), 56 313 in 1998 (14 380 of these in Russian-language groups), 53 467 in 1999 (13 544 in Russian-language groups).

Teaching of the mother tongue

In the state curriculum the volume of teaching of the mother tongue is prescribed, taking the language of instruction to be the mother tongue. If the mother tongue is not the language of instruction, then it is studied as an elective, in extracurricular study or at Sunday school. In the state programme the volume of teaching of Russian as mother tongue in Russian-medium schools is the same as the volume of teaching of Estonian as mother tongue in Estonian-medium schools. Differences may appear in the curricula of specific schools.

On the teaching of Estonian as a second language

On a nation-wide basis, the obligation to teach Estonian will extend to kindergarten and grade one as of the autumn of 2000. Curricula exist for this purpose, and materials are being prepared in both the ordinary manner and within the framework of the *EU Phare Estonian Language Training Programme*. Kindergarten and school teachers meet at summer supplementary training courses.

The number of Estonian classes has increased - in the 1996/97 school year there were a total of 962.5 hours for the 9 years of study, whereas previously 490 hours were allocated for the same period. The state programme reserves schools the right to decide the teaching of the Estonian language: schools can use between 1050 and 1400 hours over 9 years of study, and in elementary schools a total of 30-40 hours per week can be used from grades 1 to 9.

In the primary grades of Russian-medium schools the most commonly taught subjects are physical education, music, art and social studies; during elementary school this broadens to the Estonian-related material in geography, history and literature. In individual schools mathematics, economics and cultural studies, for instance, are also taught in Estonian. The expansion of teaching in Estonian and the training of teachers for that purpose have been submitted to the development plan and status of official language teachers as a state initiative. In its present form Estonian-language subject teaching has developed on the initiative of schools and teachers. The placement of children in Estonian-language pre-school institutions and schools is a particular form of learning the Estonian language that has developed in recent years. Neither materials, methodology nor support system have been developed for such study.

Teachers

In Russian-medium schools there are significantly more teachers possessing higher education than in Estonian-medium schools. The number of teachers with specialised pedagogical preparation is, however, much smaller. The smallest number of competent teachers is to be found in the teaching of shop courses, music, the Estonian language and art. 8.9% of teachers have reached the position of senior teacher or teacher-methodologist. The majority of teachers holding a higher position are mathematics and mother tongue teachers.

The share of teachers who have studied at Estonian institutions of higher education is small. Teachers possess insufficient knowledge of Estonian subject material and school traditions. They feel second-rate and forsaken. Teachers' knowledge of the Estonian language is generally insufficient for everyday communication, and there is therefore not much point in their participating in Estonian-language training in their subject, and the support and example they provide their students is minimal. Even the language level of school administrations and Estonian teachers does not meet the requirements, as a result of which a high level and an medium level have been established. In particular regions and schools one may encounter teachers' and school administrators' opposition to requirements concerning the Estonian language and the requirement of loyalty to Estonia. Participation in language training has had little positive effect, since the tendency to do independent work and courage in communicating are limited. The share of specialised language training as a part of school training has begun to increase.

The education of teachers at pre-school institutions also has little connection with Estonia, and in recent years the volume of state mandates in this area has increased.

Teachers of Estonian as a second language

In recent years the number of teachers of the Estonian language has increased significantly. According to the prescriptions of the Language Inspection Board and the Ministry of Education, positions have been vacated for qualified teachers, and teachers have been directed to language and teacher training courses. Based on course breakdown and the number of classroom-fulls of students, however, there is still a great deficit of teachers. One-third of teachers of the Estonian language have studied to be Russian philologists, one-fifth to be Estonian philologists. Quite a large number possess primary school teacher training or training in some other subject. 14.7% of teachers of the Estonian language have acquired their higher education outside Estonia. Older teachers are in the majority: half of all teachers are 40 years of age and older. The number of teachers participating in retraining has increased significantly. The use of training funds has become more focused: it is

those young people interested in teaching and who know the Estonian language who are directed towards teaching work.

Teaching materials
In grades 1 to 4 in Russian-medium schools the syllabuses presented in the state curriculum have been followed since 1994, as the compilation of the corresponding teaching material was commenced in 1991. The majority of texts are translated and accommodated texts. There are texts for all classes in the teaching of Estonian as a second language, and separate Estonian-language texts in social studies. The compilers have kept Russian-medium schools in mind, but there are also users in Estonian-language schools. The role of the media in the selection of teaching materials is becoming more important.

The Russian-language child in the Estonian--medium school
In Estonian-medium schools there are classes and pupils whose home language is not Estonian. Parents' desire to send their children to Estonian-medium schools is four times greater than children's own desire to do so. More girls than boys are placed in Estonian--medium elementary schools. Parents with Estonian citizenship are more passive in placing their children in Estonian--medium schools. On the basis of children's own assessments one can conclude that their priority is not the Estonian school, where they lose the Russian-language environment which provides them with a feeling of security. There they must, in addition to communicating in Estonian, adapt to alien cultural attitudes. Teachers and students are unable to successfully resolve communication problems arising from inter-cultural differences. For an Estonian-medium school, pupils from homes where a language other than Estonian is spoken usually mean new problems - the need for teaching materials and the special preparation of teachers, the lengthening of study time or the use of supplementary study.

Co-operation between Estonian and Russian-medium schools
There is little co-operation between schools, and the same is the case with knowledge of each other. Russian children and youths, however, consider contacts with Estonian children to be the most important factor in the improvement of their knowledge of the Estonian language. Estonian adolescents are unaware of how difficult it is to live in Estonia without knowing Estonian and without being an Estonian citizen. They are unaware that the Russian population is isolated from the activities of Estonians. Estonian adolescents' interest in the Russian language is relatively small.
Teachers have not become conscious of their common interests, there is little awareness of the need for co-operation in the basic and supplementary training of teachers, and contacts and collective teaching between schools and teachers are insufficient. Inter-cultural differences

are seen as a barrier to communication. Socio-psychological problems tend to be seen in the light of ethnic differences. Competitiveness is dominant among schools (competition for students). In the past few years co-operation projects (curriculum development, language training in families, student exchanges) have begun to expand the circle of those valuing partnership.

6.1.1.2. Tasks, activities, results, criteria for the assessment of the effectiveness of activities

6.1.1.2.1. To support elementary school graduates from elementary schools in which the language of instruction is not Estonian in coping as citizens, in their future studies and in choosing their profession.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Development of civics into principle pervading curriculum from pre-school institutions onwards	- civics training and citizen training materials guarantee the acquisition of the competence necessary for obtaining citizenship	- results of civics training - volume of Estonia-related material and civics training materials - volume of materials valuing Estonianness and Estonia as the homeland - use of Estonian-language information channels in teaching (the Estonian State, development prospects, information describing the population, its future and educational questions) -pupils' interest in the subject of civics - the place of citizens' day in the school's work schedule - co-operation between schools and Citizenship and Migration Board - list of authors of (potential) teaching materials
2. Cultivation of member of multicultural society	- the elementary school graduate values Estonian culture and his own culture and is interested in other cultures - pupils and teachers are able to resolve problems of inter-cultural communication	- multiculturalism in the school curriculum - pupils' cultural attitudes - number of supplementary training curricula / offers of training - teachers' and pupils' participation in nation-wide simulation games, interactive radio and television programmes - acclimatisation to Estonia-centred society -increase in national tolerance
3. Improvement of vocational channelling	- students are able to assess their own choices based on the future, their capabilities and knowledge of the Estonian language	- knowledge of Estonian subject matter - volume of materials for the study of vocational vocabulary in Estonian - knowledge of possibilities of labour

		market - skill of assessing one's own language knowledge - skill of assessing one's abilities and interests
4. Training of teachers and school administrators	- skills for operating in a multicultural school develop into an important part of teacher training - pedagogical, subject-related, civics and language training are connected in teacher training, educators from Estonian-language schools and schools with other languages of instruction are involved	- number of teachers and school administrators to have receiving training in Estonia - volume of common part of teacher training regardless of future language of instruction - volume of co-operation between schools - extent of practice at Estonian-speaking schools
5. Supplementary training of teachers and hobby group leaders	- teachers and hobby group leaders are able to support pupils in the solution of their problems coping and in their self-initiative	- diversity and volume of training programmes offered - number of teachers, hobby group leaders and school administrators to have completed training in Estonia - number of pedagogues who are competent in youth work matters - number of teachers who have undergone supplementary civics training
6. Supplementary training of teachers and hobby group leaders	- academics are involved in curriculum work and the development of teaching materials	- volume of such research - diversity and number of specialists involved in research - nature and volume of contacts between school and academics/academic institutions

6.1.1.2.2. To develop and adopt different language training models, taking into consideration their compatibility.

Activities	**Results**	**Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities**
1. The teaching of individual subjects in Estonian	- the Estonian language is valued as the language of self-realisation - pupils acquire subject vocabulary in the Estonian language - the organisation of teaching and teaching materials support the acquisition of Estonian at an medium level	- graduates' proficiency in the Estonian language - number of teachers teaching in Estonian; proportion of Estonian concepts, subject literature in subject teaching - lexicons and other materials for teaching subjects in the Estonian language - curriculum volume taught in Estonian - regional social studies materials - volume of Estonian-language reading material in school library - joint subject competitions for students of Estonian-medium and non-Estonian-language schools

2. Development and implementation of language immersion programme	- programme helps to raise and resolve issues of language teaching didactics - programme offers individual solutions and teaching materials in Estonian as a second language teaching methodology for all non-Estonian-medium schools	- differences in curriculum are known, principles for the formation of study environment and compilation of teaching materials are developed - demand (competition) for places in language immersion schools - existence of training programme for teachers - number of schools and teachers co-operating with programme - results of graduates of language immersion schools
3. Diversification of measures for the organisation of teaching	- the organisation of teaching supports the application of acquired Estonian-language skills and language proficiency	- interactivity of teaching, applicability, connection with everyday life - assessments of the effectiveness of measures - student motivation - extent of use of support persons and assistant teachers - extent of group learning - existence of individual curricula - connection between curricular and extracurricular activities
4. Extracurricular activities	- the system for family study, language camps is effective, co-operation between schools is lively, the principles and procedures for the financing of projects are stable	- number of parties financing support fund for family teaching, language camps and co-operation projects, volume of fund - number of student competitions in Estonian and in the field of the Estonian language - number of participants in common activities - number of Estonian-language contacts - proportion of common activities - support persons programme - number of support persons who have taken part in training
5. Creation of linguistic didactics centre	- in Estonian-language didactics the direction of foreign language learning is developed in addition to that of the mother tongue	- influence of language immersion centre (research, training, advising, co-operation) activities - functioning of regional methodology and supplementary training centres - volume of academic research in linguistic didactics

6.1.1.2.3. To develop an integrated system for teaching materials for the teaching of the Estonian language and citizen training from primary education to the end of the gymnasium level, taking into consideration the compatibility of different language teaching models.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Development of linguistic didactics	- general teaching principles based on the early commencement of language training, interactions between languages, the simultaneous teaching of students with different capabilities, and the application of the Estonian language in other subjects have been developed	- a functioning linguistic didactics centre - number of specialists, volume of research - number of linguistic didactics and methodological publications - volume of Master's and PhD study, number of defended theses - number of publications analysing the connections between language training and other subjects - amount of teaching materials for language training - publication of linguistic didactics journal
2. Development of teaching materials	- the material used in the teaching of Estonian is diverse and provides opportunities for the development of capabilities and interests - students and teachers use many different handbooks, topic booklets, video games, etc.	- volume of material available to be used in the teaching of Estonian and in citizen training - number of different study sets - volume of materials implementing different methodologies - volume of materials intended for different levels of language capability - number of persons having undergone training in the compilation of Estonian as a second language teaching materials, number of authors of teaching materials - existence of shared databanks - number of Estonian lexicons and Estonian-language teaching materials used in schools

6.1.1.2.4. To establish goals for language training in primary education.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Development of children's institution as regional (children's) language training centre	- the children's institution advises parents in questions involving the teaching of the Estonian language, introduces materials and methodologies, organises teaching	- amount of available teaching materials - volume of corresponding measures in work plan of children's institution - number of teachers with advisory skills and knowledge - interest in and preparedness to learn Estonian on the part of the children of the region
2. Development of children's institution as language learning environment	- the rooms and personnel of the children's institution support language learning, that which is learned is put to use	- level of language proficiency of personnel of children's institutions - proportion of Estonian references, materials - proportion of communication that takes place in the Estonian language

3. Development of methodologies	- methodology that takes into consideration age-appropriateness and interactions between languages is used in the teaching of Estonian	- volume of linguistic didactics research - volume of methodological material and teaching material - children's language proficiency, interest in learning - diversity and number of corresponding supplementary training courses - curricula held in common between children's institutions and schools, collective decisions in the selection of teaching materials

6.1.1.2.5. To establish goals for and broaden the preparation required for the teaching of Estonian as a second language.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Preparation of teachers of Estonian as a second language	- qualified teachers are employed as teachers of Estonian as a second language	- number of qualified teachers of the Estonian language - weekly work load of teachers of the Estonian language
2. Preparation of grade-school teachers and kindergarten teachers qualified and able to teach the Estonian language	- kindergarten teachers and grade-school teachers in children's institutions and the first levels of elementary education are proficient in the Estonian language and methodologies for its instruction	- number of kindergarten teachers and grade-school teachers who possess additional qualifications for the teaching of the Estonian language
3. Preparation of subject teachers qualified to teach subjects in the Estonian language	- teachers teaching subjects in the Estonian language have been prepared for all levels of school education	- number of subject teachers with a high proficiency in the Estonian language and understanding of methodology
4. Preparation of speech therapists, advisers and other educators	- speech therapists, advisers and other educators are able to help solve problems connected with learning the Estonian language	- proportion of problems connected with learning Estonian as a second language in training

6.1.1.2.6. To develop and launch training programmes addressing the supplementary training needs of teachers of the Estonian language and other teachers.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Development and functioning of regional supplementary	- In supplementary training, support is provided for language proficiency and knowledge of and skills required for language	- number of teachers actively operating in the network - supplementation of network databank - utilisation of network databank

training network for teachers of Estonian as a second language	teaching	- coverage of supplementary training service (those in need of training, topics) - amount of methodological materials - existence and utilisation of regional advisors
2. Development of training programmes/ supplementary training models	- training offers derive from training needs	- number of those offering training - demand for training - volume of curricula compiled on request - feedback data - proportion of Estonia-related material in training materials
3. Supplementary training of teachers of Estonian as a second language	- training offers are based on outside assessment materials and teachers' expectations of training	- number of training offers - number of participants in training - effectiveness of training - volume of training materials
4. Advancement of awareness of school administration, hobby group leaders and directors of studies	- School administrators value the qualifications of Estonian teachers, the need for teachers qualified to teach in the Estonian language - hobby group leaders and directors of studies play an important role in the improvement of the teaching of Estonian	- frequency of discussion at school meetings of questions of the teaching of Estonian - importance given to the teaching of Estonian in the school development plan and curriculum - support of organisational measures supporting the teaching of Estonian - connection between extracurricular activities and activities outside the classroom
5. Increasing of teachers' overall linguistic knowledge	- teachers value the accurate knowledge of the language	- volume of procurement of language consultation - teachers' interest in language organisation information, new teaching materials - utilisation of functional grammar books and dictionaries in class
6. Creation of Estonian-language environment	- teachers acquire courage in communicating and learn to notice opportunities in the Estonian-language environment	- number of language camps and Estonian-language supplementary training courses - joint subject departments - scope of use of Estonian-language knowledge in teacher's speciality

6.1.1.2.7. To ensure schools qualified teaching staff meeting qualification requirements.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Development of regional personnel formation programmes	- local governments act as owners of school and become aware of the development of regional educational life and needs involved with it	- schools' awareness of their future - teachers' awareness of their future and the possibilities for shaping their teaching career - local governments' participation in the

		formation of state training orders
2. Formation of priorities for teachers' preparation and occupational training	- teachers' basic and supplementary training amounts shall be applied for and distributed on the basis of distinct principles	- openness of formation of state training order - advance planning of supplementary training on school, local government, county and state level - existence of procedure for the approval of training plans - disclosure of priorities - participation of those performing training in formation of priorities - conformity of training orders with priorities - schools' and local governments' skills in ordering training
3. Development of support system (including stipend programme) encouraging the hiring of teachers at schools with a language of instruction other than Estonian	- schools can choose teachers, because a competition will be organised for vacant positions	- popularity/reputation of teaching profession - degree to which schools and teachers are demanding concerning the quality of work
4. Dismissal of teachers lacking the required qualifications	- teachers meeting the requirements for qualifications will remain at schools	- legally and psychologically acceptable procedure for dismissal - number of teachers meeting the requirements for qualifications - number of dismissed teachers

6.1.1.2.8. To develop co-operation between schools with Estonian and Russian languages of instruction.

Activities	**Results**	**Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities**
1. Planning and implementation of student exchange programmes	- students develop a sense of a common educational environment, and they are aware of their role in shaping the future of Estonia - there is knowledge of how to solve problems of intercultural communication	- volume of exchange programmes - number of Estonian-language contacts - degree to which objectives are set for exchange programmes and activities are assigned meaning - number of schools covered by exchange programmes - degree to which exchange programmes are purpose-oriented - schools with other languages of instruction and other nationalities are valued
2. Planning and implementation of	- teachers possess Estonian cultural attitudes and see their school as one	- volume of exchange programmes - number of Estonian-language contacts

teacher exchange programmes	part of the educational system - there is knowledge of how to solve problems of intercultural communication	- degree to which objectives are set for exchange programmes and activities are assigned meaning - number of schools covered by exchange programmes - continuation of co-operation
3. Planning of joint supplementary training	- teachers become acquainted with Estonian culture and reach their own understanding of the meaning of the principle of mutual enrichment	- number of training offers - interest in training - effectiveness of training
4. Activity of Estonian-language schools in support of language training and social competence	- teachers and students are conscious of their responsibility and ability to be a partner in dialogue	- diversity and number of initiatives - number of continuing co-operation relationships - tolerance of students and teachers - formation of common team
5. Organisation of joint student competitions, including events held by sports clubs and schools	- teachers and students are conscious of common educational environment	- diversity of common competitions - number of participants in common competitions - number of organisers of common competitions

6.1.1.2.9. To inform journalists and the public.

Activities	**Results**	**Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities**
1. Compilation of newsletters	- schools are informed of programmes and opportunities for participating in them	- number of newsletters - formation of a newsletter bank - thematic home pages
2. Formation of media relations	- the press reflects important problems and solutions	- regularity of transmission of information to journalists (including number of information days) - share of appearances of school staff in the media - objectivity and usefulness of information

Objective B: Adolescents who have acquired a secondary-school education possess knowledge of the Estonian language to an extent sufficient for everyday and occupational communication and are able to study in the Estonian language

6.1.2.1. Description of situation

Knowledge of the Estonian language is very important in all fields of work and study. The unemployment that is becoming more widespread among non-Estonian youth is directly linked to insufficient knowledge of the Estonian language. There are three levels of difficulties in adapting: in an environment with new objectives and tasks, in a more or entirely Estonian-speaking environment and in preparation for the acquisition of Estonian citizenship.

Students

74% of elementary schools graduates having studied during the day continue their studies at the gymnasium level (66% of graduates of Russian-medium schools). In the past three years the proportion of those who attend gymnasium after graduation from elementary school has increased. 12 609 students entered grade 10 in autumn 1999 (8744 in Estonian-language classes and 3866 in Russian-language classes). In the past three years the share of vocational training taking place in Estonian has remained stable as a proportion of post-elementary education (63%), whereas in post-secondary education it has begun to decline (in the 1995/96 school year 81%, in the 1999/2000 school year 69%). In the current 1999/2000 school year there are 6632 students in Russian-language post-elementary vocational training (11 460 studying in Estonian) and 4078 in Russian-language post-elementary vocational training (8977 in Estonian).

In institutions of higher education 11.2% of students studied in the Russian language in the 1998/99 academic year, including 27.9% in applied institutions of higher education and 5.3 % in universities. Of university students, 59.6% studied in Estonian-language places, in Russian-language places 5.2%; in paid Estonian-language places 26.3%, in Russian-language places 6.0% and in English-language places 2.9% (total 100%). The proportion occupied by state training orders increased in 1998/99 in comparison with the previous year. In the 1999/2000 school year there were 1000 students more in Russian-language post-elementary vocational training than in the previous year. One of the reasons for this may be the implementation of the intensive teaching of the Estonian language.

Russian-language teaching in vocational institutions and institutions of higher education

In 1999/2000 the greatest number of students studying in Russian in vocational institutions was in the fields of medicine and health (74.3%) and mathematics and computer science (71.7%). In the field of mathematics and computer science there is no Estonian-language training at vocational institutions; in the field of medicine and health there is no post-secondary teaching in the Russian language. In post-secondary Russian-language vocational training the humanities, architecture and industry and handicraft represent a large proportion of the total (the Estonian-language training of the first two fields takes place only at institutions of higher education). One of the principles of the state training orders for the year 2000 is the increasing of the volume of study of the Estonian language in Russian-language specialities.

In institutions of higher education, the proportion of students taking part in Russian-language training is greater in the social and behavioural sciences (24.1%), law (17.6%) and teacher training (16.3%). The volume of Russian-language training was large in terms of the number of students in the following fields: commerce and business – 10 063 (including 1053 students in paid study), equipment and technology – 5995, teacher training – 4017, law – 3453, the humanities – 2873 and health – 2786.

In terms of the number of students, teacher training represents about 4% of the training provided by vocational institutions, and about 10% at institutions of higher education. In post-elementary education 43.3% of students undergo teacher training in Russian, whereas post-secondary groups have been established in Estonian since autumn 1997. In previous years the proportion of participants in Russian-language post-secondary teacher training was 20%.

The teaching of Estonian and study in the Estonian language

Russian-language groups at comprehensive schools, vocational institutions and institutions of higher education are making a partial transition to study in the Estonian language, joining Estonian-language groups. Those whose knowledge of Estonian is not at a sufficient level will be provided with intensive training in the Estonian language. At vocational institutions and institutions of higher education the nominal teaching time in the study of the Estonian language will increase if the student's knowledge of Estonian is below the medium level. Either 20 or 40 units are provided for in the study programme (the nominal teaching time will increase by 0.5 to 1.0 years correspondingly). Intensive study may take place throughout the study period in between other subjects or concentrated in one semester. The objectives of intensive study are study in an Estonian-language group, the transition to study in Estonian as of a certain semester and the gradual consolidation of Estonian-language and Russian-language groups, etc. Principal attention shall be devoted to

the acquisition of the language of the student's speciality. Estonian as second language teachers in vocational institutions will be linked to the supplementary training network by two teachers possessing the status of teacher of the official language.
The intensive teaching of students studying in places created on the basis of state mandate shall be financed from the amounts prescribed by the state budget and in accordance with the coefficient determined for curricula in the humanities.

6.1.2.1. Tasks, activities, results, criteria for the assessment of the effectiveness of activities

6.1.2.1. The transition to teaching in the Estonian language in gymnasia.

Activities	**Results**	**Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities**
1. Compilation of school development plan	- teachers know school development plan and their working and study opportunities - schools and local governments use teachers' occupational training funds in the interests of the development prospects of the region	- number of regional educational conceptions - number of training sessions for compilation of development plans - activeness of teachers/schools in ordering training - breakdown and concreteness of school development plans - existence of procedure to amend school development plans and make them more precise - role of school development plan in compilation of work plans
2. Preparation of teachers qualified and able to teach subjects in Estonian	- teachers teaching subjects in the Estonian language are well-prepared	- number of subject teachers with a high proficiency in the Estonian language and understanding of methodology
3. Development of Estonian-language teaching materials	- teaching materials take into consideration students' proficiency in the Estonian language and support the development of language proficiency	- diversity and amount of materials - number of those to have undergone training in the compilation of materials - availability of materials within schools and for other schools
4. Preparation of educators in the Estonian language	- teachers are able to assess their language proficiency and needs for its development	- effectiveness of language training - participation of trainees in the planning of their own Estonian language training - amount of material aimed at language training of educators
5. Development of support system (including stipend programme) encouraging the hiring of teachers at	- schools can choose teachers, because a competition will be organised for vacant positions	- popularity/reputation of teaching profession - degree to which schools and teachers are demanding concerning quality of work

schools with a language of instruction other than Estonian		
6. Dismissal of teachers lacking the required qualifications	- teachers meeting the requirements for qualifications will remain at schools	- legally and psychologically acceptable procedure for dismissal - number of teachers meeting the requirements for qualifications - number of dismissed teachers

6.1.2.2. The creation of necessary study conditions for the teaching of the Estonian language and study in the Estonian language in gymnasia, vocational institutions and institutions of higher education.

Activities	**Results**	**Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities**
1. Compilation and implementation of integrated curricula	- students' language proficiency improves, and competitiveness in the labour market increases	- number of teachers involved in compilation of integrated curricula - results of assessment of students' linguistic and specialised knowledge
2. Development of teaching materials supporting the acquisition of everyday and occupational language	- teachers at gymnasia, vocational institutions and institutions of higher education are able to use a diverse set of teaching materials to support the development of students' knowledge of the Estonian language	- volume of teaching materials, including lexicons - diversity of teaching materials -number of students to have completed medium and higher level Estonian language examination
3. Study visits, internships at Estonian-language institutions	- students become aware of necessity of everyday and occupational language proficiency	- level of everyday and occupational language proficiency - motivation for language learning - number of Estonian-language contacts
4. Development of teaching institution as language learning environment	- rooms and personnel support language learning, that which is learned is put to use	- level of language proficiency of personnel - proportion of Estonian-language references, materials - proportion of Estonian-language literature in school library - proportion of communication that takes place in the Estonian language

6.1.2.3. The transition of Russian-language groups in vocational institutions and institutions of higher education to Estonian as language of instruction

1. The intensive teaching of Estonian to non-Estonian students	- improvement of non-Estonian students' Estonian-language proficiency - increase in number of youth to	- number of students to participate in teaching - results of teaching (examinations) - students' ability to continue their

	receive degree in Estonia	studies in the Estonian language - existence of area-specific language-teaching programmes and lexicons
2. Development and implementation of intensive programmes for the teaching of Estonian in service specialities and popular specialities	- non-Estonian students' competitiveness increases - teaching materials take into consideration the level of students' Estonian-language proficiency and support the development of language proficiency	- existence of area-specific language-teaching programmes - number of students to participate in teaching - results of teaching (examinations) - diversity and volume of materials - number of those to have undergone training in the compilation of materials - availability of materials within schools and for other schools - diversity and number of supplementary training programmes supporting the teaching of subjects in the Estonian language
3. Partial joint teaching of Estonian and Russian-language students in Estonian-language groups	- students acquire co-operation habits and Estonian-language specialised terminology	- level of language proficiency - creation of common interests, common core - number of Estonian-language contacts
4. Improvement of teaching of Estonian culture and history	- students acquire knowledge of Estonian culture and history and value Estonia	- level of students' social competence - preparation of teachers of Estonian subject matter - launching of curriculum - amount of Estonian-language literature in school library volume and diversity of social competence training
5. Preparation of vocational teachers qualified and able to teach subjects in the Estonian language	- subjects are taught in the Estonian language by teachers qualified for that purpose	- number of subject teachers with a high proficiency in the Estonian language and understanding of methodology
6. Guaranteeing of counselling centre for non-Estonian students	- students become aware of their study needs and can find information concerning study opportunities	- existence of counselling system - regional counselling centres - number of brochures
7. Support for coping of teachers and university instructors	- teachers acquire medium or higher level Estonian language proficiency	-number of teachers to have found their place in Estonian-language teaching - development of curricula for retraining and supplementary training - participation in Estonian-language events introducing the Estonian language and culture

6.1.2.4. To develop co-operation between educational institutions

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Planning and implementation of student exchange programme	- students acquire a sense of a common educational environment and learn Estonian-language specialised vocabulary	- volume of exchange programmes - degree to which objectives are set for exchange programmes and activities are assigned meaning - number of educational institutions covered by exchange programmes - results of assessment of students' linguistic and specialised knowledge
2. Development and implementation of enterprise-related programme for different specialities	- improvement of competitiveness of students, their formation into job-creators	- broadening of opportunities for implementation of acquired working skills - number of graduates supplied with a job
3. Planning and implementation of teacher exchange programme	- teachers become familiar with Estonian culture and become aware of their school as a part of the education system	- volume of exchange programme - degree to which objectives are set for exchange programmes and activities are assigned meaning
4. Planning of joint supplementary training	- teachers become acquainted with Estonian culture and reach their own understanding of the meaning of the principle of mutual enrichment	- number of training offers - interest in training - effectiveness of training
5. Creation of database concerning internship positions and jobs	- students possess an overview of future jobs in Estonia and beyond	- awareness of the opportunities provided by a job

6.1.2.5. To inform journalists and the public.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Compilation of newsletters	- schools are informed of programmes and opportunities for participating in them	- number of newsletters - formation of a newsletter bank - thematic home pages
2. Formation of media relations	- the press reflects important problems and solutions	- regularity of transmission of information to journalists (including number of information days) - share of appearances of school staff in the media - objectivity and usefulness of information

6.2. Sub-programme “The education and culture of ethnic minorities”

Objective: Ethnic minorities possess opportunities to acquire education in their mother tongue and preserve their culture

6.2.1. Description of situation

Composition of population as of 01.01.1999
Whereas before the Second World War Estonia was ethnically a relatively homogeneous state – Estonians represented 88% of the Estonian population – in 1999 Estonians formed 65.2% of the population of Estonia and ethnic minorities' share was 34.8%. In 1999 there were 1 445 589 people living in Estonia, of whom 942 526 were Estonians. Other nationalities thus make up 503 063 people, among whom there are 406 049 Russians, 36 659 Ukrainians, 21 363 Byelorussians, 13 027 Finns, etc. In other words, Estonia has become a truly multicultural country inhabited by the representatives of over 100 ethnic groups.

National minority and ethnic minority
The target groups of this sub-programme are both long-standing national minorities and ethnic minorities that migrated to Estonia in the second half of the 20th century. In the interests of both the implementation of the state programme and general terminological clarity, however, it is essential to distinguish the concepts of national minority and ethnic minority in the context of Estonian history. Since the concept of national minority is applied in demography in the case of those national communities which have inhabited the territory in question consistently and for a long period of time, one must distinguish between the larger national communities that have inhabited different regions of Estonia since ancient times (92 600 Russians, 16 300 Germans, 7 600 Swedes, 5 400 Latvians and 4 400 Jews in 1934) as *national minorities*[6] and the representatives of nationalities who came to live in Estonia after the Second World War as a result of migration as *ethnic minorities*. In planning the measures of the state programme, it is important that in addition to considering the similar objectives of these two target groups,

[6] On the basis of the Cultural Autonomy of National Minorities Act, the term *vähemusrahvus* (minority nation) has historically been used to refer to long-standing minorities. It would be more correct, however, to use the term "national minority", as international law does not recognise the term "minority nation".

their different needs also be taken into account in the preparation and implementation of the sub-programme's detailed action plan for 2000-2007.[7]

Legislative acts

Cultural Autonomy of National Minorities Act

The first Cultural Autonomy of National Minorities Act in the history of the Republic of Estonia was passed by the *Riigikogu* on 12.02.1925. The act established the right of national groups to preserve their ethnic affiliation, culture and religious creed. The act guaranteed the right of the Germans, Russians, Swedes and other minority groups (with over 3000 members) living in Estonia to form their own cultural self-government. Cultural self-governments were entitled to form public and private educational institutions and organise and inspect their activities. Cultural self-governments were also entitled to address the other cultural needs of the corresponding national minority and organise the activities of institutions and enterprises created for that purpose.

On 12.06.1993, the *Riigikogu* passed the Cultural Autonomy of National Minorities Act, which like the 1925 Cultural Autonomy of National Minorities Act establishes the right of persons belonging to a national minority to form cultural self-governments in order to perform the cultural rights granted them by the Constitution - to preserve their mother tongue, ethnic affiliation, cultural traditions and religious creed. The act treats as a national minority Estonian citizens who live in the territory of Estonia, possess long-term, firm and lasting connections with Estonia, differ from Estonians in terms of ethnic affiliation, cultural distinctiveness, religion or language and are motivated by the desire to collectively preserve their cultural traditions, religion or language, which form the basis of their common identity. As in the case of the 1925 act, cultural self-governments may be formed by persons belonging to the German, Russian, Swedish and Jewish national minorities and persons of national minorities whose total number is above 3000.

A person belonging to a national minority is entitled to form and support national cultural and educational institutions and religious congregations; form national organisations; perform national traditions and religious traditions, if this is not detrimental to public order, health or morality; use his mother tongue in official business within the boundaries established by the Language Act; issue national publications;

[7] For the purpose of conciseness the term "ethnic minority" is used in the text of this state programme as a collective term referring to both long-standing minorities and minorities which migrated to Estonia after World War Two. Another collective term that has been used is "non-Estonians", which does not sound very good, but has come into widespread use for lack of a better word.

conclude co-operation agreements with national cultural and educational institutions and religious congregations; distribute and exchange information in his mother tongue.
The main purpose of the cultural self-government of national minorities is the organisation of the teaching of the mother tongue and the supervision of the use of funds anticipated for that purpose; the formation of cultural institutions of the national minority and the organisation of their activities, as well as the organisation of ethnic cultural events; the creation and bestowing of funds, stipends and awards for the advancement of the culture and education of the national minority.

Council of Europe Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities
(Strasbourg, 5.11.1992). Entered into force in Estonia on 1 February 1998.
On 02.02.1995 the Republic of Estonia signed the Council of Europe Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, which was ratified by the *Riigikogu* on 11.11.1996. The framework convention prescribes the protection of the rights and freedoms of national minorities and persons belonging to them, for which the states signatory to the framework convention accept corresponding obligations. The *Riigikogu* added a declaration pursuant to which the Republic of Estonia treats as national minorities Estonian citizens who live in the territory of Estonia, possess long-term, firm and lasting connections with Estonia, differ from Estonians in terms of ethnic affiliation, cultural distinctiveness, religion or language and are motivated by the desire to collectively preserve their cultural traditions, religion or language, which form the basis of their common identity.

Other significant legal and normative acts of the Republic of Estonia connected with the advancement of the mother tongues and cultures of national minorities

Education Act
The act forming the basis of the Estonian education system, which establishes the recognition of the freedom of general human and national values, the individual, religion and the conscience as the fundamental principle of education. Pursuant to the Education Act, the state and local governments are also obliged to guarantee every person's opportunities to perform compulsory education and continuous study in accordance with the conditions and procedures prescribed by law.

State curriculum for Estonian elementary and secondary education
In the state curriculum for Estonian elementary and secondary education approved by the Government, the principles of school teaching are defined as humanism, democracy, love of the fatherland and internationalism. The state curriculum values the Estonian national consciousness, culture and traditions, the identity seeking of both the Estonian State and other nationalities living in Estonia, as well as the cultivation of individual cultures. The state curriculum also prescribes for all persons equal opportunities for the acquisition of an education, and national, regional, age-related, gender and individual particularities are taken into account in the selection of teaching regulations and teaching content.

Broadcasting Act
Of legal acts regulating the mass media, the Broadcasting Act prescribes the requirements for the programmes of public media channels, in accordance with which the broadcasts and programmes of Estonian Radio and Estonian Television must, considering the moral, political and religious convictions of different ethnic groups, influence all persons to respect human dignity and observe the rule of law.

State policy

Bases of the Estonian state integration policy
On 10.06.1998 the *Riigikogu* approved the *Bases of the Estonian state integration policy for the integration of non-Estonians into Estonian society*, which defines the emphases and objectives of the state integration policy as of 1998. The document defines integration as a person's involvement in all levels of social life, and states that integration is not the alteration of ethnic identity but instead the removal of those barriers that today prevent many non-Estonians from genuinely participating in Estonian social life. This means the guaranteeing of a feeling of security to Estonians, on the one hand, as regards the survival of Estonianness and to non-Estonians, on the other hand, as regards the survival of their language and culture.

Foundations of the Estonian state cultural policy
On 16.09.1998 the *Riigikogu* passed the foundations of the Estonian state cultural policy, which prescribes the equal rights of all members of society to participate in cultural life regardless of their sex, nationality or place of residence. The state promotes the cultural activities of national minorities and cultural contacts with their ethnic homeland. The main purpose of the state cultural policy is to guarantee the survival of Estonian national traditions, support the cultural autonomy of national minorities and the vitality of national culture in all areas of life.

Ethnic cultural societies, their federations and associations

The support of ethnic cultural societies
Support is distributed to ethnic cultural societies from the budget of the Ministry of Culture on the basis of the projects they present. The total volume of support was 950 000 EEK In 1996, 1 200 000 EEK in 1997, 2 000 000 EEK in 1998, 2 000 000 EEK in 1999 and will be 1 500 000 EEK in 2000.
The activities of ethnic cultural societies and their Sunday schools have also been supported by the Estonian State, several local governments and foreign donors in the form of direct support, and through the Integration Foundation and the project of the Nordic Countries/United Nations Development Programme "Support for the state programme". In addition, the Ministry of Education and several local governments support the activities of ethnic cultural societies and their Sunday schools.

The activities of ethnic cultural societies
In 1999 there were over 120 ethnic cultural societies operating in Estonia. Ethnic cultural societies are mainly aggregated into 4 federations and associations of ethnic cultural societies, i.e. the Estonian Federation of Associations of Ethnic Cultural Societies "Lüüra" (31 societies), the Association of Estonian National Minorities (20 societies), the Slavic Educational and Charitable Federation in Estonia (42 societies and 33 collectives) and the Round Table of Ethnic Cultural Societies of Ida-Viru County (18 societies), which is an umbrella organisation for ethnic cultural societies operating in Ida-Viru County. Outside the above-mentioned associations and federations ca 10 other ethnic cultural societies operate in Estonia.

Principal problems and corresponding tasks of the state programme

Cultural Autonomy of National Minorities Act
The Cultural Autonomy of National Minorities Act establishes the principle that, in the case of the education and cultural life of ethnic minorities, the initiative and responsibility lie with the ethnic minority itself through the activities of the cultural self-government, and the role of the state is above all one of creating and supporting corresponding opportunities.
Although the act was passed in as early as 1993, the possibilities provided for in the act have not been implemented. This primarily concerns the question of the formation of cultural self-governments, as the main objectives of the formation of the cultural self-governments to be formed were, among other things, the organisation of the teaching of the mother tongue and supervision of the use of funds anticipated for

that purpose, as well as the formation of cultural institutions and the organisation of their activities, etc. As a result, an analysis of the act must be performed in co-operation with the President's Round Table and other parties.

The advancement of the education and culture of ethnic minorities
One of the important tasks of the state in the integration of Estonian society is to give persons belonging to ethnic minorities the opportunity to acquire an education in their mother tongue and advance their culture. Taking this circumstance into account, the state's substantive and financial assistance are important. The organisation of the educational and cultural questions of ethnic minorities is also within the competence of local governments, and many local governments have already supported ethnic minorities' Sunday schools. One part of the preparation of the sub-programme "The education and culture of ethnic minorities" therefore involves the definition of the division of the roles of local governments, cultural self-governments and the state in questions of the education and culture of ethnic minorities, based on the situation in a particular region.

Principles of the activities of comprehensive schools of ethnic minorities
A parish government, city government, private legal person or natural person may own a comprehensive school in the language of the ethnic minority. The school's curriculum must conform to the state curriculum for elementary and secondary education (or the simplified or minimum curriculum). The curriculum of a comprehensive school does not depend on the form of ownership of the school – framework curriculum requirements are compulsory for all languages of instruction. The language of instruction shall be designated by the owner of the school, although in elementary school the teaching of Estonian is compulsory in the volume specified in the state curriculum, so that the graduate could continue study in the Estonian language at the next level of education.
The wages of teachers of primary, elementary and gymnasium schools and vocational institutions and expenditures for the acquisition of study materials shall be provided from the state budget to the extent of corresponding curricula in the procedure established for the same category of state or municipal schools. Private schools may receive targeted support from state and local budgets. These principles are also applied in the case of schools in which teaching takes place in the language of the ethnic minority.

6.2.2. Tasks, activities, results, criteria for the assessment of the effectiveness of activities.

6.2.2.1. To increase awareness of Estonian multiculturalism, support coping in multicultural Estonia.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Becoming acquainted with other cultures (through events, television and radio programmes, information brochures, etc.).	- Estonian society is aware of and tolerant towards cultural differences	- the interest of members of society in the activities of Estonian cultural societies - number of participants in events of cultural societies
2. Development of curricula and principles for the organisation of study supporting coping in a multicultural society	- school curricula contain content that supports coping in a multicultural society	- attitude towards other cultures and ethnic groups - ability to communicate with representatives of other cultures
3. Ordering of academic research	- other countries' experiences, Estonia's possible developments are taken into consideration in formation of Estonian model of multiculturalism	- volume and quality of corresponding academic research - degree to which the use of resources is focused on the objective at hand

6.2.2.2. To re-examine the Cultural Autonomy of National Minorities Act, including the role of cultural self-government in the advancement of the culture and education of ethnic minorities.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Re-examination of act and, if necessary, the submission of amendments	- definition of role of the Cultural Autonomy of National Minorities Act and that of cultural self-government	- the insertion of a certain number of amendments in the act, as required - the number of applications submitted for the formation of a cultural self-government, as required

6.2.2.3. To support the preservation of the languages and cultures of ethnic minorities through the activities of ethnic cultural societies and Sunday schools.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Financial (including state, private sector, foreign assistance, etc.) support for ethnic cultural societies	- a significant number of representatives of ethnic minorities are members of ethnic cultural societies and involved in their events - ethnic cultural societies operate successfully	- corresponding financial resources (including state, private sector, foreign aid, etc.) have been allocated to ethnic cultural societies on the basis of projects submitted and in accordance with established conditions - number of events and other activities of ethnic cultural societies and number of participants in these
2. Financial support (including state, private sector, foreign assistance, etc.) for Sunday schools	- members of ethnic minorities acquire knowledge of their mother tongue and culture through the activities of Sunday schools	- corresponding financial resources (including state, private sector, foreign aid, etc.) have been allocated - number of Sunday schools and number of persons studying at them by regions in which such a need exists - corresponding number of teaching materials are in existence - corresponding number of qualified teachers in existence - level of proficiency of Sunday school graduate

6.2.2.4. The promotion of co-operation between ethnic cultural societies, also for finding private-sector support and foreign sponsors for societies; the setting in order of information distribution.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. The organisation of periodical information days for ethnic cultural societies concerning the directions of activity of state ethnic policy and specific state and foreign assistance projects 2. The participation of representatives of ethnic cultural societies, their federations and unions in round tables and other advisory bodies concerning ethnic minorities and created by the state	- ethnic cultural societies have sufficient and lasting financial support for their activities - ethnic cultural societies are sufficiently well informed concerning the state ethnic policy and co-operate with the state in this area	- corresponding non-state financial resources have been found - number of information days that have taken place and the number of participants - number of representatives of ethnic cultural societies, their federations and unions in round tables and other advisory bodies concerning ethnic minorities; the degree to which their recommendations are taken into consideration

6.2.2.5. Support for the activities of elementary schools operating in the ethnic language.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Financial support (including state, private sector, foreign assistance, etc.) for elementary schools operating in the ethnic language.	- elementary schools operating in the ethnic language possess the necessary operational base	- amount of teaching materials in the ethnic language - number of qualified teachers - number of students in a school
2. Dissemination of information concerning education in the ethnic language.	- representatives of ethnic groups are aware of the opportunities and conditions for the acquisition of an education in their mother tongue	- number of brochures - number of media appearances
3. Development of teaching materials.	- elementary schools operating in the ethnic language possess teaching materials that take into consideration their distinctiveness	- number of original materials in ethnic language - number of original materials concerning Estonia
4. Preparation of Estonian as a second language teachers at elementary schools operating in the ethnic language on the basis of a special plan (studies in the Estonian language + mother tongue at a relevant (foreign) university.	- increase in language proficiency in Estonian and mother tongue	- applied curriculum

6.3. Sub-programme “The teaching of Estonian to adults”

Objective: Opportunities have been created for non-Estonians beyond the age of compulsory school attendance to improve their knowledge of Estonian and socio-cultural competence

6.3.1. Description of situation.

The great majority of adult non-Estonians are first-generation migrants or their descendants. They arrived in Estonia between 1946 and 1990 as a result of massive immigration. The foreign origin and compact territorial location of a significant majority of non-Estonians residing in Estonia has led to linguistic isolation. Having in many cases lost the knowledge of their mother tongue before arriving in Estonia, they speak Russian as a common language of communication, and in many cases speak only Russian. This influences their motivation to learn Estonian (knowledge of Estonian is not necessary when living in an Russian-speaking environment), as well as attitude and approach (the speaker of a language with a large speakership lacks the tradition and habit of learning foreign languages) and in short is detrimental to the prospects for Estonian becoming a common language for contact between ethnic groups.

In recent years the non-Estonian populations' interest in learning the Estonian language has, however, increased, and language proficiency has improved. The language proficiency of young non-Estonians is significantly better than that of adults. Whereas in 1989 knowledge of the Estonian language among non-Estonians was 14% (17% among Russians, thanks to the historical Russian minority), in 1999 67% of adults and 92% of youths considered themselves to be proficient in the Estonian language.[8]

The teaching of the Estonian language has thus far been predominantly instrumental. Other things being equal, people's competitiveness in the labour market often depends on knowledge of the Estonian language. According to data from sociological surveys, in the opinion of non-Estonians insufficient knowledge of the Estonian language significantly limits opportunities to find work and causes social isolation. A 1997 survey demonstrated that the greatest motivation for studying the Estonian language was the need to improve one's qualifications. 25% of

[8] See Pettai, I. and Proos, I. *Venelased ja eesti keel [Russians and the Estonian language].* Commentated database. Estonia Open Society Institute. Tallinn, 1999.

those surveyed were non-Estonians already possessing citizenship and needing to improve their Estonian-language qualifications, and 23% were non-Estonians who would study Estonian in any case, regardless of its connection with the language examination component of the citizenship examination.

The prescription of the requirement of Estonian-language proficiency for public servants and for employees employed in certain area of the private sector (the need to perform requirements concerning work environment and consumer protection or protection of the environment, health and safety) coming into contact with other people is an unavoidable condition for the normalisation of the Estonian language situation and the securing of the status of the Estonian language. Study opportunities corresponding to the established language requirements are, however, limited (the level of teaching is low and there is a shortage of teachers with specialised training and suitable teaching materials). Questions of language training acquire a particular importance for the reason that they affect a considerable number of non-Estonians living in Estonia: adults through occupational language requirements and requirements for Estonian-language proficiency stipulated in the Citizenship Act, but also students at vocational institutions and university students at institutions of higher education through requirements for Estonian-language proficiency prescribed by state curricula or educational standards (In Estonia there are no language requirements for applicants for residence or work permits, although on the basis of the Refugees Act and in accordance with the UN Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, Estonia has undertaken the obligation of organising Estonian language training and providing translation services for refugees arriving in the country).

State support for the teaching of the Estonian language to adults has thus far been restricted to legal regulation and free pre-examination consultations for citizenship applicants and those performing the Estonian-language proficiency level examination. The language training of medical workers and public servants has been supported from the state or local government budget (state support for language projects financed with foreign assistance).

The Estonian language examination for citizenship applicants is performed by 2000 persons annually. The amendment to the Language Act that entered into effect on 1 July 1999 foresees the combination of this examination with the proficiency level examinations and through them also with final school examinations. Students who have passed the elementary school final examination in the Estonian language may, for instance, apply for citizenship without additional language examinations. The above-mentioned amendment also foresees a new system launched in September 1999 for proficiency level examinations. The examinations are in test form and the Estonian language proficiency level descriptions provided in the Language Act serve as the basis for the development of

the examination requirements. Depending on the position and the nature of the job, Estonian-language proficiency is required on one of three language proficiency levels (beginner, medium and higher level)

The State Examination and Qualification Centre (SEQC], which operates in the area of administration of the Ministry of Education, bears responsibility for the organisation of examinations. In addition to proficiency level exams, the Centre is also responsible for the development of final school exams and exams for citizenship applicants. As of 1998, SEQC is an associated member of the Association of Language Testers in Europe (ALTE), and the ALTE Code of Practice, which defines the responsibility and obligations of relevant individuals in the development of exam materials, the assessment of tests and the distribution of information, is observed in the development and organisation of exams.

The transition to a new examination system presupposes changes in the organisation of study, since properly formulated examination requirements have a positive influence on the entire language training system. The level of proficiency required by the exam cannot be achieved with 40-60-hour courses, which is still the ordinary practise of many language teaching companies. By means of comparison, one might mention the 180-200 hours under normal studying conditions required for an adult student to acquire the beginner level of language proficiency in the English language (Council of Europe Waystage Level or Cambridge University Key English Test) and the 370-400 hours required to achieve the communication threshold (Council of Europe Threshold Level, Preliminary English Test).

The proficiency level examination system was launched in September 1999 and since then over 400 people have taken the exam. The exam is mainly taken by employees whose Estonian language proficiency requirement has been established as a part of their vocational qualification, but also by many students, university students and just language learners who are interested in determining their level of proficiency. The average percentage who pass the test is 60. This relatively low percentage of passing may have several reasons. Test-takers are neither up to date with new exam requirements, nor have they selected an exam that corresponds to their language proficiency. This figure also reflects the shortcomings of the current teaching system. The methodology for the teaching of Estonian as a second language requires further development, especially as concerns the teaching of the language to adults, as does teacher training and supplementary training. This programs' measures for teaching Estonian to adults coincide with the principles of lifelong learning advocated by the Council of Europe. In the development of teaching literature and examinations and in teacher training, co-operation will take place with experts from the Council of Europe.

Adults have the opportunity of studying Estonian at the training centres of local governments or at courses offered by language teaching companies based on private capital. In the issuing of training licences, documents proving specialised education are not required, as a result of which the standard of training is not guaranteed. The number of those wishing to study the Estonian language has increased largely thanks to courses organised by the *EU Phare Estonian Language Training Programme*, in which up to half of a proficiency level exam or citizenship exam applicant's tuition fees are reimbursed.

In coming years the focus of the teaching of Estonian to adults will shift to the intensification of socio-cultural competence and work and profession-related language proficiency, which, in addition to the development of general language proficiency, also presupposes the description of the language needs of different areas on the basis of vocational qualification standards and the compilation of lists of technical terms.

The restructuring of language centres for the provision of linguistic services to new immigrants (for instance those who have received residence permits on the basis of asylum applications) must be provided for, guaranteeing them language courses that would permit them to acquire proficiency in the Estonian language at a level necessary for initial basic survival (the beginner level).

In implementing the sub-programme one must avoid the danger of creating Russian monolingualism instead of integration. In that case conditions for the continuation of separation and the assimilation of third ethnic groups into the Russian-speaking community will have been created.

6.3.2. Tasks, activities, results and criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities.

6.3.2.1. To reform the system for the teaching of Estonian to adults

Activities	**Results**	**Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities**
1. The creation of a support persons programme for the organisation of the teaching of the Estonian language to adults	- functioning programme - existence of language training support persons - improvement of Estonian-language proficiency	- number of students involved - demand for support training - number of support persons involved
2. Development and implementation of procedures for the certification and licensing (issuing of training licenses) for teachers of Estonian as a	- improvement of standard of instruction of Estonian language	-database - issued training permits

second language		

6.3.2.2. The improvement of the specialised preparation of the Estonian teachers of language training centres and companies, and the organisation of supplementary training

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. The creation of a supplementary training network for teachers of Estonian as a second language	- functioning supplementary training network - teachers are informed of supplementary training opportunities - teachers' methodological preparation has improved	- number of teachers involved - state financing - number of opportunities for supplementary training and places - results of assessment of students' language proficiency
2. The development of supplementary training models	- flexible training that corresponds to teachers' needs	- number of teachers involved in training
3. The organisation of supplementary training, also concerning teaching materials	-teacher qualifications improve -a large number of teachers are involved in supplementary training - teachers are sufficiently informed of new teaching materials - teaching materials are rapidly adopted	- number of training events - number of teachers involved - demand for training - number of teachers involved in training - demand for new materials

6.3.2.3. Improvement of the system for the assessment of language proficiency and the consultation system

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Compilation and distribution of materials introducing examinations procedures	- students are informed of examinations and examination procedures	- number of materials - demand for materials - volume of information materials - number of information events and participants - sufficient resources from state budget - lack of criticism in public information channels
2. Development of proficiency level exam in co-operation with ALTE and experts from Council of Europe	- standardised and unified examinations	- compliance of test parameters with developed criteria

6.3.2.4. Compilation of teaching materials and programmes supporting acclimatisation in an Estonian-speaking environment and specialised and socio-cultural needs.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Ascertainment and description of language needs of different professions or vocations and compilation of terminological minima in Estonian language within the framework of Council of Europe vocationally oriented language learning (VOLL) project	- existence of teaching materials - improvement of specialised language proficiency	- demand for materials - results of assessment of language proficiency - descriptions of language needs - terminological minima in Estonian language, their use in language learning and everyday work
2. Compilation of language teaching materials and sample teaching programmes supporting occupational needs	- existence of teaching materials - increase in effectiveness of teaching	- demand for materials -results of assessment of occupational language proficiency
3. Organisation of compilation and publishing of comparative/parallel grammar texts in Estonian and the languages of ethnic minorities	- existence of grammar texts - increase in language awareness	- utilisation of results in teaching

6.3.2.5. The subsidising of the language training of socially high-priority and risk groups

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. The result-based subsidisation of language training.	- functioning subsidisation system - students' active participation in subsidised language training - improvement of language proficiency	- number of participants in subsidised language training - allocation of new financial resources for the subsidisation of language training - results of assessment of language proficiency (examinations)
2. The teaching of the Estonian language to the non-Estonian registered unemployed and job seekers.	- improvement of language proficiency and increase in feeling of social safety among the unemployed - increase in competitiveness in labour market	- number of participants in teaching - results of assessment of language proficiency (examinations)
3. The development and implementation of activation programmes for the young	- increase in feeling of social safety and competitiveness in labour market	- number of participants in activation programme - number of those who have found jobs

unemployed in combination with language training.		
4. The development and launching of a labour exchange model within Estonia.	- functioning labour exchange programme - improvement of language proficiency and specialised knowledge - improvement of competitiveness in labour market	- number of participants in programme - demand for participation in programme
5. The teaching of Estonian to non-Estonian recruits.	- improvement of language proficiency	- number of participants in teaching - results of assessment of language proficiency (examinations)
6. A programme and materials of state and legal foundations for non-Estonian recruits; police and security guards.	- improvement of knowledge concerning the foundations of the state and law - improvement of specialised and general language proficiency	- number of participants in teaching - results of training - decreased in number of complaints
7. Estonian language courses for medical workers.	- improvement of customer service due to general improvement in language proficiency	- number of participants in teaching - results of assessment of language proficiency (examinations)
8. The teaching of Estonian to non-Estonian inmates.	- improvement of language proficiency and increase in feeling of social safety among the unemployed - increase in competitiveness in labour market	- number of participants in programme - results of assessment of language proficiency
9. The teaching of Estonian to non-Estonian prison officials	- improvement of language proficiency	- number of participants in programme - results of assessment of language proficiency (examinations)

6.3.2.6. Improvement of the reputation of the Estonian language and valuing of language proficiency

Activities	**Results**	**Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities**
1. Information materials and public events aimed at the public for the propagation of linguistic competence and the principles of lifelong learning; motivation for acquiring language through cultural activities and events (theatre performances, films, etc.)	- the public is informed of opportunities for study and results - active participation in language training programmes	- number of information materials and events - demand for information materials (supplementary information) - demand for language training programmes - demand for language teaching materials
2. Determination of aspects of socio-cultural competence	- existence of teaching materials	- demand for materials - survival in cultural environment

and compilation of cultural descriptions (culturgrams) and their insertion in training programmes	- becoming acquainted with cultural differences and learning to value them - increase in cultural awareness	- results of assessment of language proficiency

6.3.2.7. The organisation of socio-linguistic research

Activities	**Results**	**Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities**
1. The analysis of language usage in different fields of life for the ascertainment of linguistic behaviour and attitudes.	- increase in linguistic awareness - application of research in programmes	- performed research - training meets needs
2. The analysis of multilingual persons' language usage in order to ascertain the mutual interactions between languages and the extent and nature of linguistic contacts.	- application of research in curricula and teaching materials	- performed research - usability in pedagogical programmes
3. The analysis of the internal linguistic relations within a language collective in order to ascertain language usage areas	-research is used in shaping language law	- performed research - application of research

6.4. Sub-programme “Social competence”

Objective: The Estonian population is socially competent (divided into objectives A, B and C)

Definition
Social competence means a person's ability to function adequately on all levels of social life. The state programme treats social competence as a key factor in people's ability to organise on the basis of common interests (to be carried out in the third sector) and changes in the availability of objective information and attitudes in society (to be carried out in the field of the media and public opinion).

General tasks of sub-programme “social competence”

- To raise awareness of the potential of non-Estonians and consciously involve them in decision-making and development programmes
- Implementation of the concept of the Estonian multicultural society and the presentation to the public of the cultures of ethnic minorities living in Estonia.

Objective A: Inhabitants of Estonia actively participate in the development of the civil society regardless of their nationality and mother tongue.

6.4.1.1. Description of situation

A civil society is an organised area of social life that is voluntary, self-organising, largely self-supported, independent of the state and restricted by rules of its own creation. A civil society is a link between the private sphere and the state and signifies collective human involvement in the sphere of public life in order to express their interests, will and ideas; to exchange information; achieve common objectives; present demands to the state so as to change existing state policy and keep officials answerable to the people.

In as early as the beginning of the 1990s, many non-profit associations were involved with questions involving non-Estonians, without at the time realising that this constituted activity directed towards the integration of Estonian society. By the end of 1999 an extensive network of non-profit associations had developed. Two representative bodies for non-profit associations have been created – the Associations' Consultative Board and the Associations' Co-operation Board – whose purpose is to organise relations both within the non-profit sector and, in the interests of associations, with the Government and *Riigikogu*. Representative bodies are composed of umbrella organisations of Estonian non-profit associations. The objective is to bring together representatives of parties and associations, develop co-operation between associations and elaborate the conception for the development of the civil society to be presented to the *Riigikogu* in 2000.

Representatives of the ethnic minorities living in Estonia are participating more and more actively in the activities of non-profit associations, although they are often obstructed by complicated administrative procedures for the creation of non-profit associations and in the application for support for projects. Another weak point is the co-operation and exchange of information within the third sector, since organisation often takes place according to ethnic attributes. One of the tasks of the state programme is to guarantee that non-Estonians are able to participate equally with Estonians in third-sector activity. It is important to achieve a situation in which the Estonian population organises, in addition to ethnic and cultural attributes, on the basis of common interests (education, social security, health care, etc.).

6.4.1.2. Tasks, activities, results and criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities.

6.4.1.2.1. To support integration-related co-operation between third-sector and state institutions

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Support for representative bodies of non-profit associations promoting societal dialogue between Estonians and non-Estonians.	- representative bodies of non-profit associations play an active role in the dialogue between Estonians and non-Estonians	- analysis of activities of representative bodies of non-profit associations (assessments by non-profit associations and state institutions)
2. Propagation of information and notification of the public through the press, Integration Foundation information bulletin, Integration Foundation Internet home page and other channels; Integration Foundation's regularly held information day for non-profit associations.	- non-profit associations are sufficiently informed of each other's activities and projects, co-operation with state institutions and opportunities for funding their projects - non-profit associations' activities in the field of integration are reported on in the press	- amount of information published in the press - existence and content of Integration Foundation information bulletin - quality of information on Integration Foundation Internet home page - holding, content and number and satisfaction of participants in information days - content analysis of *Eesti Päevaleht* monthly supplement entitled "Forum" from the point of view of the integration programme
3. To analyse the administrative procedures and rules ensuing from acts governing the foundation and activities of non-profit associations.	- the administrative procedures of non-profit associations will be simplified on the basis of recommendations resulting from the analysis	- non-profit associations' satisfaction with administrative procedures and their observance of laws
4. Development and implementation of mechanism to guarantee partial state financing to secure the realisation of integration projects of non-profit associations possessing partial foreign financial support	- intensification of activities of non-profit association in the field of integration, including increasing of number of realised projects and content	- corresponding state financial resources are in existence

6.4.1.2.2. To support student self-governments in non-Estonian schools and youth associations

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. The regular training of leaders of student self-governments and youth associations.	- increased capabilities of leaders of student self-governments and youth associations in having a say in school activities	- activeness and diversity of activities of student self-governments and youth associations -students' and teachers' attitude to student self-governments and youth associations and their initiatives
2. Introduction of topic of student self-governments and youth associations in training programmes for school administrators and pedagogues.	- student self-governments acquire a specific role - co-operation between school administrators, pedagogues and student self-governments	- formation of student self-governments and youth associations and the openness of their activities
3. Support for youth co-operation.	- contacts between youth become more frequent, and youths' way of thinking	- proportion of initiatives and activities uniting different schools in the activities of student self-governments and youth associations - number of undertakings developing long-term co-operation - diversity of common core formed through co-operation
4. Development of co-operation within Estonia (with institutions of higher education, research institutions, etc.)	- student self-governments and youth associations are involved in the charting of the problems in society and in the elimination of shortcomings	- extent of partnership of academic elite of Estonian population - youth awareness of regional and national problems - renewal, repair and other initiatives initiated by students
5. Publishing of information materials supporting initiative.	- associations are able to act as the implementers of their initiatives	- number of brochures - associations' initiative - associations' ability to carry out that which has been initiated

Objective B: The attitudes of Estonians and non-Estonians contribute to the achievement of the main aims of the state programme

The above-mentioned objective is divided into smaller closely interrelated objectives:
1. The expansion of the field of influence of the Estonian media[9] among non-Estonians.
2. The more active participation of the Estonian media in the achievement of the objectives of the state programme and the strengthening of mutual co-operation in that area.
3. The increase in the awareness of Estonian society concerning the objectives of the state programme and events taking place in the integration process.

6.4.2.1. Description of situation

Media consumption in Estonia[10]
Media consumption in Estonia is characterised by differentiation along ethnic and linguistic lines. Among non-Estonians the predominant media consumption pattern involves a combination of the Russian media and Estonian (Russian-language) media. Among Russians the orientation towards the international English-language media is also more common than among Estonians (mostly in parallel to the Russian orientation. The great majority of the Russian-speaking population in Estonia actively watches Russian (television) channels. An average of 80% of 18-74-year-old non-Estonians living in Estonia actively watch at least one Russian television channel per day (BMF Gallup Media, spring 1999). In spring the daily viewership of Estonian television channels was 39% among non-Estonians. In comparison with the situation in 1993, Estonian radio stations and television channels have lost some of their importance in the consumption repertoire of non-Estonians. The listenership of Estonian national (Russian-language) radio stations is 43%, and the local radio listenership is 48% among the adult Russian-speaking population. The readership of nation-wide Estonian or Russian-language newspapers (those having read at least two of the six latest editions of one newspaper) is 33% of the 15-74-year-old non-Estonian population. In connection with joining satellite and cable television systems in order

[9] I.e. the Estonian and non-Estonian-language media

[10] The following overview is presented from the source *Estonian Human Development Report 1999*. United Nations Development Programme. Tallinn, 1999. Pp. 45-53.

to continue to monitor Russian channels, the viewing of Western channels through satellite and cable transmission has significantly increased among non-Russians, and one part of the population, especially younger non-Estonians, have begun to watch both Western and Russian channels. Over the years 1993-1999, the solely Russia-oriented group of media consumers has decreased from 38% to 21% of the Estonian adult population (this group includes very few Estonians).
A slight increase has taken place in the share of local channels, in parallel with the Russia orientation.
Thus between 1993 and 1999 the media consumption repertoire of Russians living in Estonia and Russian-speaking population of other nationalities has become more diverse: although the proportion of people watching Russian channels as the only foreign channels has remained practically unchanged, the number of people who watch both Western and Russian channels as foreign channels, as well as the local media, has increased.
The addition of different media levels in the consumption repertoire also develops the variability of possible reference systems, which should in conclusion create new possible "lines of association" between the information and communication spheres, values and the resulting social identities of the Estonian and Russian-speaking populations.

Principles and target groups of sub-programme
In the case of media-related activities, one must consider that they be directed primarily towards the following significant target groups:

- school-age children and those of compulsory school age and their families
- pupils at primary and elementary schools and gymnasia with elementary grades, teachers, administrators, directors and adults, excluding the older generation (those over 60)
- university students and instructors specialising in the media at institutions of higher education
- Estonian and Russian-speaking journalists (television, radio, the press)
- employees of information and public relations departments of institutions involved with integration
- the young and adults, excluding the older generation (those over 60)

Target group and objective must be clearly established before commencement of the project, the objective must be measurable and the result objectively assessable.

Performers of media-related activities must be guided by the following general objectives:

1) the creation and intensification of openness, tolerance and a feeling of security;
2) the formation of ethical and æsthetic categories corresponding to the Estonian modern multicultural reality;
3) focus on the individual – representation of achievements or problems as outputs resulting from the individual's choices and responsibilities, and not (automatically) resulting from his membership in a group;
4) the creation of verbal and visual terms, symbols, etc. favourable to the development of a common state-identity of Estonians and people of other nationalities;
5) reduction of the exclusivity of media in different languages and of differences in discourse offered.

The media must work in a common system with other integrative activities and areas, for instance *school - parent - television*.

In the case of Estonian-language programmes, one must also consider the viewer who speaks another language. The correctness of the Estonian language must be assigned particular importance.

Objectives of sub-programmes by different target groups

Non-Estonians (younger and middle-aged generation)
Raising the consumption of the *Russian-language* Estonian electronic and printed media and the expansion of the listenership/viewership/readership of programmes and publications.
Better awareness of and a more active approach towards participation in social life (also the surmounting of obstructions to this (language proficiency, acquisition of citizenship, etc.).

Estonians (younger and middle-aged generation
The gradual withdrawal of the attitude "non-Estonians as a problem" and the rise of an understanding of "non-Estonians as development potential" and the development of positive attitude towards Estonian multiculturalism.

The Estonian-language media
More frequent and responsible treatment of the topic of Estonian multiculturalism.
Closer co-operation with the Russian-language media in Estonia.
Recognition of the existing practice[11] of constructing a distinction between "us" and them" and the avoidance of such biased reporting.

[11] For instance: the more frequent mention of the fact that a person is a Russian-speaker or of ethnic background in the case of negative news items

The Russian-language media in Estonia

Increasing the competence (e.g. the ability to work with sources in the Estonian language) and responsibility of journalists writing or producing programmes for the Russian-speaking public in the treatment of ethnic issues and state integration policy.

Closer co-operation with the Estonian-language media.

The arrival of young (Estonian and Russian-speaking) specialists among journalists writing or making television or radio programmes for the Russian-speaking public.

Making integration topics and the method of treating ethnic relations more diverse, open and giving them the form of a dialogue.

6.4.2.2. Tasks, activities, results and criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities.

6.4.2.2.1. The less one-sided development of integration topics in the Russian and Estonian-language media, increasing of the interactivity of the Russian-language media.

Activities	**Results**	**Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities**
1. Specialised training and training treating integration topics, for journalists and editors (development of foundations of programme, finding of financial resources, pilot projects and then a competition for the realisation of the entire programme or parts of it) (combined with 6.4.2.2.7. item 5) 2. The ordering or supporting of articles, programmes and broadcasts of different areas of integration (development of foundations for stipend competitions etc. and then development and implementation of entire compound system) 3. System for the awarding of journalists who have contributed to the realisation of the integration programme (development and launching of foundations of award system)	- journalists' awareness of integration and the media - avoidance of the attitude "let's choose a journalist whose task will be integration" on editorial boards - materials directly involving integration topics appear more often in the press - integration and Estonian multiculturalism appear more clearly in articles and broadcasts not directly dealing with the topic (e.g. characters in stories are of several nationalities) - viewers begin to feel a stronger emotional connection with Russian-language channels	- number of training sessions for journalists - number who participate in journalist training - heterogeneity according to publications/stations and journalists (also for instance writers on criminal topics, youth topics, etc.) - number of announced (journalistic) competitions, number of participants in competitions, standard of participants in competitions. - realisation of winning projects -number of programmes/articles directly connected with topics of integration (monitoring) - number and type of

than in the case of positive ones (in the latter case often even the mentioning of a person's name); the use of the term "Estonians" when speaking of all inhabitants of Estonia, etc.

4. The ordering or supporting of interactive programmes (with public feedback) (see also table 6.4.2.2.3. item 1) (development of foundations of programme, finding of financial resources, pilot projects and then a competition for the realisation of the programme)	in Estonia (e.g. programmes as subject for discussion, etc.) - a stronger habit develops among the Russian-speaking listenership/viewership/ readership to turn to the local media in order to obtain utilitarian information	references indirectly connected with Estonian multiculturalism (media monitoring) - changes in media consumption habits and expectations of Russian-speaking population (television-radio diary research, surveys, the latter on a certain interval)

6.4.2.2.2. The raising of a new generation of non-Estonians with regular media-consumption habits and skills for orientating in the information society.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. A combined Estonian language training[12] and media education programme for Russian-language elementary schools and high schools (also in co-operation with the Tiger Leap Foundation and the Estonian Media Educators' Association), which would contain an overview of both different media channels (including the Internet, multimedia) and of genres, skills for the analysis of elementary texts and visual information, as well as skills for using information (seeking) systems, databanks, etc. 2. The adaptation of the measures mentioned in item 1 to the military forces. 3. The supplementary training of teachers for the performance of the measures mentioned in item 1, the creation of teaching materials and other subprojects necessary for the launching of the system. 4. The launching of the project "The newspaper about school classes" in Russian-language schools.	- development of supplementary training system for programme (item 1) and teachers; launching of pilot projects; feedback - students who have participated in the programme develop an interest and habit in using (new) media also after the end of the programme - some of the participants go on to study in (new) media specialities	- number of educational institution/defence force units to have participated in pilot projects (later in the programme) - satisfaction, advancement, ability to apply knowledge e.g. activeness of media use) after end of programme (longitude study) - number of those going to study in media or close specialities

[12] Significant for raising the reputation of the Estonian language as a contemporary language of self-realisation and from the point of view of raising youths who able to orient in an Estonian-language information environment.

6.4.2.2.3. The increasing of communication between Estonians and non-Estonians.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. The production of bilingual television programmes (dating shows, quiz shows, children's programmes), including the agreeing of clearer effectiveness criteria in co-operating with ETV (if possible also with private channels), which would mean the (additional) financing by the state of the production of programmes and also: (a) announcement of programmes in other programmes (news) previously on the air (b) broadcasting of at least one programme during prime time[13]	- interest of Estonian and Russian-language viewership and active participation in programmes	- extent and socio-demographic profile (sufficient representation of younger people and both Ida-Viru region and Tallinn) of viewership of programmes (in the Russian-speaking population this should reach 10%) (television and radio diary research) - activeness of viewer feedback (calls, letters, those wishing to participate in programme) - reviews of programmes in the press
2. A family-meeting programme, with the goal of activating relations between Estonian and non-Estonian families, for instance in the form of family camps, excursions, various common competitions, etc.	- development of family-meeting programme, launching of pilot projects; feedback - families that have participated in the programme are satisfied with it, communicate with each other outside the programme or after it	- number and socio-demographic profile of families to have participated in programme (younger people, families with children, communication of Ida-Viru families with families from other regions) - satisfaction of participant families and density of (subsequent) communication (surveys) - continuation of meetings between families that participated in programme
3. Development of framework programme for the organisation of common events (e.g. training programmes connected with children), the stimulation and activation of hobby associations in co-operation with local governments (as part of their social programmes).	- the Estonian-speaking and non-Estonian-speaking inhabitants of a city district or other regional unit participate in endeavours characterised by mutual interests, new hobby associations are created or old ones are strengthened	- number of local governments that participated in common events - number of events, associations' support projects organised within framework of programme - relation between one-time and continuing endeavours - number and socio-

[13] Significant requirements if one considers the present undeveloped viewing habits and general rhythm of watching television as (an often routine) pastime.

		demographic profile of members of hobby associations, the frequency at which they meet and associations' duration (statistics + research)
4. The representation in the media of the relations between Estonians and non-Estonians, the shaping of so-called everyday communicative discourse, e.g. the production of a television series on integration, the systematic presentation of non-Estonians in Estonian-language society and women's magazines; the publishing of a Russian version of some Estonian-language magazine analogous to "Stiil", etc.	- the series gathers viewers, Russian and other non-Estonian names (personages) enter into Estonian-language society, women's and other topics and vice versa	- extent and socio-demographic profile of viewership of series; number and standard of articles featuring figures from Russian and other local ethnic groups (television and radio diary research, media monitoring)

6.4.2.2.4. Support for political-legal integration.

Activities	**Results**	**Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities**
1. A public campaign on the following levels propagating-encouraging performance of the citizenship examination: (a) addresses-attention expressed on the level of the state or president/prime minister; (b) a public notification programme necessary for passing the examination; (c) an active promotional campaign among the non-Estonian-speaking target group, for courses in the Estonian language and other course provided for in the state programmes; (d) a social advertising campaign treating citizenship and targeting both Estonians and non-Estonians.	- more active performance of citizenship exams and increase in number of Estonian citizens	- realisation of different sub-components of campaign, their reception in the media (media monitoring): a) Target groups' awareness and attitudes towards campaign (survey) b) number of applicants for Estonian citizenship, those to pass exam and recipients of Estonian citizenship
2. A communication programme supporting the broader political integration of the young, the different sub-components of which support the realisation of civilian rights, e.g. initiation of a debate with parties and other political associations concerning their views of the involvement of young Estonian citizens of other ethnic backgrounds in social life; the creation of a programme of activities supporting and enlivening civics training	- clearer awareness of what it means to be a citizen, development among Russian-speaking youths of attitude that is more socially active and respects democratic culture	- number of schools/associations/students to have participated in communication programme - media reporting of endeavours performed within framework of programme

for non-Estonian schools and youth associations (visits to the parliament, political debates, etc.).		
3. Composite communication programme (articles/programmes in the press, PR campaign, social advertising) to direct public attention to the state programme and its realisation (combined with the activities described in 6.4.2.2.5., item 2 and 6.4.2.2.7., item 3).	- (public) reception of state programme as provider of security to the entire population and endeavour promoting social perseverance	- reception of campaign in media - public awareness and attitudes toward campaign (survey)

6.4.2.2.5. The creation and development of dialogue between cultures.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Similarly to measures provided for in task 6.4.2.2.3., projects combined with the common strategy (TV programmes, quiz shows)	- see 6.4.2.2.3.	- see 6.4.2.2.3.
2. A social advertising campaign (TV, radio, the press, placard advertising) to draw the attention of the public to Estonian multiculturalism (combined with activities described in 6.4.2.2.4. item 3 and 6.4.2.2.7. item 3)	- positive public reception of campaign	-reporting of campaign in media - public awareness of and attitudes towards campaign (survey)

6.4.2.2.6. The increasing of the number of professionals in the fields of media and information among non-Estonian youths.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. The initiation of a programme for the training of graduates of non-Estonian-language schools at the University of Tartu in the fields of journalism, advertising and public relations.	- youths from Russian-speaking schools study at institutions of higher education in media specialities	- number of Russian-speaking youths from Russian-speaking schools; their advancement and journalistic activity during their studies; entrance into work in their specialisation; number who enter into master's programme
2. The creation, in co-operation with universities (Tallinn Polytechnic University, the University of Tartu, Concordia University, etc.) of a system of diploma study (open university) for journalists in the electronic media, that would guarantee the development of the new generation's cadre.	- diploma study programme achieves popularity as a second university degree among those with other degrees	- number of participants in diploma study programme; their advancement and journalistic activity
3. The performance of stimulating	- journalism and media work	- activeness of participation

preparatory work, for instance an article competition for youth writing in Russian, articles compiled by students in daily newspapers, etc.	achieves popularity among school students and interest in the media as a whole increases	in competition

6.4.2.2.7. The improvement of the accessibility and quality of Russian-language institutional-utilitarian information.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Training of officials for relations with the Russian-language consumer, performed in organisations, state agencies and local governments.	- government officials are seen by the Russian-speaking population as partners instead of enemies	- number of training sessions that have taken place, the assessment of their effectiveness by both officials and inhabitants visiting state agencies (surveys)
2. Improvement of the work of the PR departments of state agencies in relations with the Russian-language media.	- reporting of questions involving the state authorities in the Russian-language media in a clear and systematic manner coming directly from the source	- frequency and type of materials connected with the state authorities (media monitoring)
3. The creation of a system to provide the Russian-language media with a continuous supply of information concerning integration and the participation of non-Estonians, including the notification of the public of the objectives and results of each stage in the integration programme (combined with the activities described in 6.4.2.2.4. item 3 and 6.4.2.2.5. item 2): (a) WWW-pages (home pages for Minister of Ethnic Affairs, Integration Foundation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and other institutions and organisations involved with integration); (b) the systematic broadcasting of official press releases (see item 2).	- effective operation of notification system; positive reception of information on integration programme and participation, creating feeling of security among Russian-speaking media consumers (a) active visiting of web pages (b) see item 2	- assessments of corresponding rubrics, programmes, materials (survey); activeness of feedback - frequency of publishing, clarity and adequacy of information materials (media monitoring) (a) number of visitors to pages, assessments of page (Internet survey, chat room) (b) see item 2
3. The partial support of an information page or rubric promoting social participation, at the main Russian-language channels.	- realisation of rubric, its active utilisation	- readers' letters that have arrived at rubric, interest in rubric (readership survey)

4. The training of journalists concerning the utilisation of integration-related information channels presently in existence and under creation 5. The organisation of a competition to provide support for the Russian-language press from the state or municipal budget	- materials involving integration topics appear more often in the media	- number of training sessions for journalists - number who participate in journalist training - heterogeneity according to publications/stations and journalists

6.4.2.2.8. Creation/expansion of common core of Estonian and Russian media system

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Support for the creation of a system of joint programmes and mutual critiques. 2. Exchange programmes for journalists.	- a substantive discussion develops between the Estonian and Russian-language media in certain areas of integration (including reviews, references)	- number and standard of corresponding articles (media monitoring)
3. The creation of the prerequisites for the broadcasting of Estonian and Russian-language programmes on cable television networks.	- realisation of programmes, increase in their viewership	- realisation of programmes, increase in their viewership (television and radio diary research)
4. Organisation of a competition for the founding of a Russian-language regional private television station.	- development of sufficient viewership for station	- development of sufficient viewership for station (television and radio diary research)

Objective C: Improvement of the situation of groups of the population with serious social special needs

6.4.3.1. Description of situation.

The activities performed within the framework of this sub-programme are aimed at those groups of the population whose integration in Estonian society has been obstructed by serious social problems.

Primary social problems:

- Lack of jobs
- Poverty
- Housing problems
- Lack of information (language problem)
- Lack of skills (social)
- Shortage of professionals (especially shortage of professionals (counsellors, psychologists)
- Abuse of alcohol and drugs
- Existence of handicap

6.4.3.2. Tasks, activities, results and criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities.

6.4.3.2.1. The guaranteeing of care and a favourable environment for growth for abandoned non-Estonian children; the re-socialisation of families.

Activities	**Results**	**Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities**
1. Development of social centres	- guaranteeing of basic needs of abandoned children (food, housing, hygiene) - guaranteeing of supervision over children	-children's interest in being at / coming to the social centre - people's knowledge of location and services of social centre - reduction in number of abandoned children
2. Development and strengthening of foster family/stepfamily network	- abandoned children are in an environment favouring growth	- burden of foster families/stepfamilies - children's interest in being in foster families/stepfamilies - number of foster families/stepfamilies - training of foster families/stepfamilies
3. Development and implementation of	- expansion of opportunities for	- number of persons

"Edu-elamus" [feeling of success] programme.	self-realisation outside work (including studies) through assistance programmes	(children, youths) with social survival skills
4. Brokering of jobs	- jobs guaranteed - alleviation of poverty	- number of jobs
5. Housing problem	- alleviation of poverty - reduction of vagrancy and homelessness	- number of persons
6. Counselling and training of families	- reduction of shortage of information -rise in family's social capacity	- ability of registered families to cope

6.4.3.2.2. The guaranteeing of social services to handicapped non-Estonians.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Improvement of activities of Social Affairs Board, also through the distribution of information and the training of personnel	- availability of corresponding information to handicapped non-Estonians (sound and Braille books for the blind and sign language courses, texts and materials for the deaf) - social workers' ability to cope with demand for social services	- number of brochures, other materials, courses and events - demand for brochures, other materials, courses and events - number of social workers who participated in training - number of resolved applications
2. Support for social assistance projects, events, and other activities targeting handicapped non-Estonians (including state, private sector, foreign assistance, etc.)	- social services are available to non-Estonians	- principles and procedure for the financing of social assistance projects etc. - number of participants in social assistance projects and events - number of social services

6.4.3.2.3. Support for repatriated Estonians.

Activities	Results	Criteria for assessing the effectiveness of activities
1. Creation of system for the acclimatisation of repatriated Estonians in Estonian society (in the form of psychological, social and financial assistance).	- repatriated Estonians have become acclimatised in society	-results of research performed among repatriated Estonians

7. ASSESSMENT OF EFFECTIVENESS AND SUCCESS OF PROGRAMME. REPORTING

7.1. Assessment of the effectiveness and success of the state programme

The assessment of the effectiveness and success of the state programme shall take place:
(a) during the performance of the programme;
(b) after the conclusion of the programme.
Assessment shall take place in two manners:
1. On the basis of yearly general and media monitoring aimed at target groups and the media;
2. On the basis of periodical research into the success and effectiveness of the management and activities of the programme.
The assessment of the success and effectiveness of the state programme shall take place on the following bases:

- the descriptions of main aims provided in part 3 *("Main Aims"*);
- the descriptions of objectives provided in part 6 (*"Objectives"*) and the criteria for the assessment of the effectiveness of the tasks and activities of corresponding sub-programmes;
- the detailed action plans and yearly activity reports and financial reports of sub-programmes for the years 2000-2007.

The Integration Foundation is responsible for ordering corresponding monitoring and research.
During the course of the state programme, the Integration Foundation shall, at the beginning of each year, present to the steering committee of the state programme the results of the previous year in the form of interim reports. On the basis of the reports, the steering committee shall, if necessary, make amendments to the state programme.
Upon the conclusion of the state programme, the Integration Foundation shall present a final report to the steering committee of the state programme.

7.2. Assessment of the success and effectiveness of the state programme: activities in that field, descriptions of effectiveness and success, indicators

Activities to be carried out for the assessment of the success and effectiveness of the state programme	**Descriptions of the success and effectiveness of the state programme**	**Indicators of the success and effectiveness of the state programme**
1. The ordering of general monitoring of the target groups of the state programme	- tasks aimed at the target groups of the state programme are fulfilled and objectives achieved	- results of general monitoring - results of media monitoring

2. The ordering of media monitoring 3. The ordering of research into the management of the state programme and the effectiveness and success of activities	- objectives, tasks and activities to be performed in the state programme are sufficiently and objectively reported on in the Estonian and Russian-language media. - the management of the state programme has taken place smoothly and transparently - the activities of the state programme are carried out effectively and successfully	- reports of research into the effectiveness and success of the state programme

8. CAPACITY-BUILDING OF INSTITUTIONS

8.1. The capacity building of institutions implementing the state programme

The state programme consists of a large number of projects both already launched and to be launched, as well as other activities. Sub-programmes require careful chronological description and the goal-oriented planning of tasks and measures. Thus it is very important that each institution responsible for a sub-programme possess qualified and sufficient personnel, without which the implementation of sub-programmes would be obstructed.

The objectives, tasks, target groups and measures of sub-programmes are often closely connected with each other, and the activities implemented in one sub-programme support those implemented in another sub-programme or depend on the success of the others. Therefore the role of the overall guarantor of the state programme in the co-ordination of the activities of sub-programmes, the successfulness of co-operation between those responsible for sub-programmes and direct performers, as well as the unhindered exchange of information are both of great importance.

Considering the above-mentioned facts, it is necessary during the implementation of the state programme to strengthen the capabilities of institutions implementing the state programme in terms of both content and technical matters.

8.2. The capacity-building of institutions implementing the state programme: activities in that field, descriptions of effectiveness and success, indicators

Activities for capacity-building of institutions implementing the state programme	**Results**	**Indicators of increased capabilities**
1. Formation and training (in the fields of integration, customer service, project management, etc.) of the work forces of institutions implementing the state programme. 2. Strengthening of technical base of institutions implementing the state programme.	- there is sufficient trained personnel for the management of the programme - the implementation of the state programme takes place competently and without a hitch - institutions implementing the state programme possess a sufficient technical base	- reports of implementation of state programme - results of investigations into effectiveness and success